

THE APPLICATION OF THE HORMIC THEORY

IN PSYCHOLOGY

TO THE THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

:::

THE APPLICATION OF THE HORMIC THEORY
IN PSYCHOLOGY
TO THE THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

: :

THESIS

PRESENTED TO THE POST-GRADUATE SCHOOL
OF THEOLOGY

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF Ph. D.

by

REGINALD INNES MORRIS,

M.A.

: :

OCTOBER, 1944.

: :



FOREWORD.

In the years that followed the introduction into many Sunday Schools of the new methods advocated by the late Mr George Hamilton Archibald, several youth leaders noticed a disturbing fact: while some adolescent girls and a few adolescent boys became happily busy as Sunday School helpers or teachers, the majority were not expressing any impulses^{which} they had, to do regular voluntary work intrinsically valuable for them. One who was particularly disturbed about this, was Rev. William Goyen, Director of the Welfare of Youth Department of the Presbyterian Church of Australia. What was to be done? What help could psychology give to the educationist in this connection?

Dr William McDougall's 'Social Psychology' had been widely read; he had theories that seemed likely to be of use in Religious Education. The psychologies of Drs Freud, Jung, and Adler, were also receiving much attention; could they give any lead -- in the desired direction?

Professor W. P. Paterson was interested; he suggested that the subject, 'The Application of Psychology to the Theory of Religious Education', might be studied in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Ph. D. of the University

of

of Edinburgh; the subject was approved in 1925.

The proposal then was: That there should be taken into consideration (a) The Teaching of the Psychologists, (b) The Experience of the Public Schools, (c) Religious Education To-Day, particularly in England, and, for purposes of comparison, (d) The Theory of Religious Education in the last quarter of the Nineteenth Century; also, That Arrangements should be made for Experiments.

Mental life may be regarded as involving three processes, termed the cognitive, affective and conative processes; or, cognition, affection, and conation respectively. Cognition, in education, has always received much attention; in relation to the scholar, it is concerned with the gaining of knowledge through ear and eye, by listening and seeing; to the educator it involves telling and blackboard work or pictures. The affective process (or feeling aspect of mental life) has been prominent in religion; the emotional appeal of music and pulpit oratory is valued; the power of emotion is seen in 'decision' or 'conversion', which are the subject of many books, including psychological studies by Mr L. Wyatt Lang, Dr A. R. Uren, and Dr W. Bryn Thomas, in this country; from the emotions Professor McDougall sees the self-regarding sentiment rise to determine character. Often, however, emotions are aroused, a 'decision' is made, and then the religious enthusiasm subsides.

The

The knowledge gained, too, may never be used; the classical example is Alexander Lyons, of Stirling, who committed to memory the words of the entire Bible and could immediately repeat any verse of any book, if given the numbers of the chapter and verse; but this knowledge did not affect his ideas either of duty or of doctrine; he could not even quote a text in explanation of belief or obligation. May the efforts of educators be failing, because they are stressing only the cognitive and affective processes?

The third aspect of mental life is conation, the active phase of volition, desire, conscious impulse; the tendency to act. Our Master Himself often mentioned the importance of not only knowledge, and re-birth, but of actually carrying forward into action His teachings.

The question, then, was, Would opportunity for activity in accordance with religious knowledge give youth interest in religion, and make for the moral and spiritual development of the individual? To that question an answer is being sought in this thesis.

The subject being, 'The Application of Psychology to the Theory of Religious Education', all three processes of mental life were, to begin with, taken into consideration, and the whole field of Religious Education was studied. But the subject became larger and larger, and although much was written, and some experiments commenced, in the years 1925, 1926 and 1927, much remained to be done at the end of the

third year. Reading and experiments were continued in Australia (1928-1931) and England (1932-1938), and in Scotland (1938-1944); but the War made the study of theory difficult, although, with the evacuation of a section of an hospital to Millport, comprising children only, there were new opportunities for practical work and observation. The subject, however, had become unweildy, and this year the Post-Graduate School of Theology granted permission for limitation of the Thesis to one part of the conative aspect of mental life, thus excluding cognitive and affective processes; so that 'The Application of the "HORMIC THEORY" in Psychology to the Theory of Religious Education' is all that is attempted in the following pages.

: :

It is but right that deep gratitude should be expressed here to the Edinburgh professors and to Dr William Boyd (Glasgow); to Miss E. Mildred Nevill (of the Psychological Centre, London, W.C.1), who arranged a ten-weeks' programme for me in the London area, in order that I might see many of the best Sunday Schools and other organizations of the various Protestant Churches; to the late Mr G. H. Archibald (Founder and First Principal of Westhill Training College), and to his staff, who have, at Swanwick and at Westhill, discussed many problems and admitted much in regard to the psychological basis; to Rev. Wm. Goyen (Australia) and to the Editor of 'The

Australasian Graded Sunday School Teacher', who have also discussed matters frankly; to the officials of many Sunday Schools and youth organizations in England, Scotland, and Australia (some have permitted experiments extending over years, and have themselves taken part in them); to medical practitioners interested in psychotherapy; and to principals, head masters and teachers, who have done much, in various ways, to encourage me and to help me in this study. To all of them I am grateful.

R. I. M.

Millport, Scotland,

October, 1944.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER I	... EDUCATION ...	page	1
CHAPTER II	... RELIGION ...		22
CHAPTER III	... PSYCHOLOGY ..		36
CHAPTER IV	... SOME SCHOOLS OF PSYCHOLOGY ...		47
CHAPTER V	... DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY		63
CHAPTER VI	... THE HORMIC THEORY		97
CHAPTER VII	... INSTINCTS		110
CHAPTER VIII	.. SOME SPECIFIC INSTINCTS		122
	(a) Gregarious Instinct		
	(b) Constructive Instinct		
	(c) Submissive Instinct		
	(d) Protective Instinct		
CHAPTER IX	... SOME NON-SPECIFIC TENDENCIES ...		188
	Imitation		
	Suggestion		
	Sympathy		
CHAPTER X	... SOME TROUBLESOME INSTINCTS ...		202
CHAPTER XI	... OTHER ENDOWMENTS ...		222
CHAPTER XII	.. THE THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY		232
CHAPTER XIII	. SOME EXPERIMENTS		249
CHAPTER XIV	.. CONCLUSIONS		257

CHAPTER I

EDUCATION

CHAPTER I

EDUCATION

'Mind ... grows, not like a vegetable
... but like a Spirit, by mysterious
contact with Spirit, Thought kindling
itself at the fire of living Thought'

-- Thomas Carlyle,
'Sartor Resartus'.

CHAPTER I

E D U C A T I O N

Education has been defined, by some, so as to include all the influences that affect human development. For instance, John Stuart Mill speaks of

EDUCATION
IN THE
WIDEST
SENSE Education, in the 'largest acceptance'
of the term, as comprehending 'even the
indirect effects produced on character,
and on the human faculties, by things of which the
direct purposes are different; by laws, by forms of
government, by the industrial acts, by modes of
social life; nay, even by physical facts not depend-
ent on human will; by climate, soil, and local
position' (I: VOL.5, p. 166).

The same thought has also been expressed by modern educationists, as when Professor Drever says that, in definitions, Education is recognized as a 'process in which, and by which, the knowledge, character and behaviour of the young are shaped and moulded, in part by uncontrolled factors in the environment' (II: p. 1); or as when Professor G. H. Thomson writes: 'By Education I mean the influence of the environment upon the individual to produce a permanent change in his habits of behaviour, of thought, and of attitude' (III: p. 19); or, again, as when he says that the 'whole of the environment ...

is the instrument of man's Education in the widest sense' (III: p. 21).

However, John Stuart Mill proceeds to narrow his definition in accordance with the more general use of the word Education, which implies definite purpose on the part of the adult members of the community; Dr Drever, in a briefer definition, which he gives, speaks

NARROWER
USE OF
THE WORD

only of the purposive process; and

Professor Thomson also goes on to make

clear the importance of a conscious aim,

devoting a whole chapter to 'Reflections on the Aim of Education' (III: pp. 57-76). Indeed, this limitation is accepted by most writers on the subject, and it may be definitely stated as a first indicator of the meaning of the word:

(1) EDUCATION IMPLIES AN EXPRESS PURPOSE IN THE MINDS OF THE EDUCATORS.

(Sir John Adams writes: 'Purpose ... is always felt to be essential in Education' -- I: VOL. 5: p. 166.

Professor T. P. Nunn: 'The idea of deliberate direction ... is an essential element ... Whether an experience is part of an individual's education or not, depends upon whether its form has been arranged by those .. concerned' -- V: VOL.7: p. 964).

: :

Other points on which there is reasonable agreement include:

(11) EDUCATION IS OF PERSONS -- FOR SUB-HUMAN SPECIES THE WORD 'TRAINING' IS PREFERRED.

('Animals

('Animals cannot in any true sense be educated: they can only be trained' -- Sir John Adams: I: VOL.5: p. 170.

Professor E. L. Thorndike: 'The word Education refers especially to those elements of science and art which are concerned with changes in man himself' -- VII: p. 1).

(111) THE PURPOSE OF SOCIETY IS TO SHAPE THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE COMING GENERATION IN ACCORDANCE WITH ITS OWN IDEALS OF LIFE; BUT THE PERSON TO BE EDUCATED IS AN ORGANISM, WHO MUST DEVELOP ACCORDING TO THE LAWS OF HIS OWN NATURE.

(Pestalozzi: 'In the new-born child are hidden those faculties which are to unfold during life' -- I: VOL.5: p. 166.

Froebel: 'The man must be viewed, not as already perfect, not as fixed and stationary, but as constant yet always progressively developing ... always advancing from one stage to another' -- I: VOL.5: p. 166.

Sir John Adams: (The educator) 'cannot interfere with the laws of development inherent in the educand' -- VIII: VOL.VI: p. 207).

'To shape the development' is a phrase that, at first sight, seems to contradict the statement that 'the person to be educated ... must develop according to

MANIPULATION
OF
ENVIRONMENT

the laws of his own nature'; but, although the educator cannot interfere with the laws of growth, 'he can so manipulate the environment that these laws shall lead to results different from those that would follow were the conditions left unchanged' (Sir John Adams: VIII: VOL.4: p. 207). Pestalozzi makes this clear in his use of the plant metaphor: 'Sound

education

education stands before me symbolized by a tree planted near fertilizing water ... Man is similar to the tree' (I: VOL.5: p. 166). As Sir John Adams points out, the teacher can, no doubt, influence his pupils in such a way as to change the course of their development, but, in order to do this successfully, he must respect their inner natures; 'he can command only by obeying the laws of the child's own nature'; 'he must stoop to conquer'.

(iv) TO EDUCATE, THEN, IT IS NECESSARY TO PROVIDE AN ENVIRONMENT IN WHICH THE PERSON MAY DEVELOP SATISFACTORILY.

Some educationists, in particular, stress this as the prime function of the teacher. 'In the first

METHOD OF MADAME MONTESSORI form of schooling that a child receives, Madame Montessori would have the teacher simply arrange

the child's environment -- the room, the apparatus, and so forth -- and then leave the child to make his own experiments and discoveries. The Dalton plan, the higher forms of secondary schools, and all colleges and universities, carry this principle to a higher stage' (VI: p. 98). The surroundings are arranged so as to provide such opportunities for the pupil or student as will induce him to take advantage of them; and, what is more, the presence of others, who are making use of the apparatus, will lead him to follow their example.

But

But a plant does not follow the example of other plants; a plant is not moulded by its environment in the same way as a child is (a). It becomes clear that the plant metaphor (which some educationists consider has been much over-worked) is only useful in so far as the 'laws' of Botany (of plant life)

LIMITATIONS
OF THE PLANT
SIMILE

apply also in the realm of Zoology (of animal life), and therefore in the whole realm of Biology (of all life). Just as many psychologists will not allow their science to be limited to the principles understood by physical scientists, finding that they, in the realm of Psychology, are dealing with facts that cannot be explained in terms of mechanism, so educationists cannot allow the theory of the art of teaching to be regulated by principles that do not take into account the difference between the two forms of life which comprise the science of Biology, and that would ignore the still greater difference between plant life and that form of animal life which is found in the children of the human race.

This is important in connection with the matter now being considered (ENVIRONMENT): A PERSON IS CAPABLE OF BEING AFFECTED BY HIS SURROUNDINGS IN

WAYS

(a) 'The environment moulds the individual, and the individual the environment' -- Professor G. H. Thomson (III: pp. 26-27).

WAYS in which A PLANT OR LOWER ANIMAL COULD NOT BE AFFECTED. Professor G. H. Thomson goes so far as to say: 'It is in being susceptible to environment that man differs from the animals, and the higher animals from the lower' (III: p. 21).

By providing a suitable environment, educationists, therefore, hope to modify a child's growth in

MAN MOULDED
BY HIS
ENVIRONMENT

ways in which a plant's life could not be modified. Professor T. P. Nunn mentions that mental, like physical, behaviour is to be viewed as a reaction to environment; and it is generally admitted that moral and spiritual behaviour may be similarly regarded.

When the question is asked, How would a 'suitable environment' be described, it is found that Professor Dewey has answered by saying that 'conscious or deliberate education has to provide an environment

- (i) idealized or purified
- (ii) universalized, and
- (iii) systematized.

In such an environment, what place is taken by the teacher? Some educationists say that the

THE PLACE
OF THE
TEACHER

teacher must fade out of the environment; he may arrange it; but he himself may not be part of it. In this connection Sir John Adams has quoted from a book, 'The Individual and the Environment' by Dr J. E. Adamson, in which the educand is 'treated in relation to three worlds

that

that make up his complete environment.' They comprise

1. THE NATURAL WORLD, examined in all the natural and physical sciences;
2. THE SOCIAL WORLD, to which all the humanist studies belong; and
3. THE MORAL WORLD, the sphere of religion and ethics, where 'we actually add something to what we study'.

Sir John goes on to quote from Dr Adamson's book: 'Within that mysterious synthetic activity through which the individual is at once appropriating and contributing to his environment, forming and being formed by it, and which we are considering under the conception of adjustment, the teacher has neither place nor part'. The adjustment to environment should be carried out as much as possible by the pupil's own activity and initiative. Then Sir John adds his own note: 'But it is the master who has dominated and always will dominate the situation'.^(a)

With Sir John other educationists generally agree. Professor Nunn has written: 'Education ... a definitely personal work' (V: VOL.7: p. 964). Dr Yeaxlee concurs: 'Yet all through this interplay of organism and environment, the personal forces resident in the environment become increasingly

more

(a) E.g., Pestalozzi even, who says (in regard to his son): 'I had decided that he should work (at learning to read) regularly every day, whether he liked it or not' (XX: p. 88).

more evident and influential' (VI: p. 98). So also does Professor Dewey, who wishes education to be understood as a 'personal sharing in common experiences', teacher and learner being co-operators in an activity, and both actually participating in it.

Another point may, then, be noted as to the meaning of Education, viz.,

(v) EDUCATION IS PERSONAL; i.e., THE EDUCATOR IS A PERSON, AND IS PART OF THE ENVIRONMENT PROVIDED.

: :

As the purpose of society, in arranging this environment, is to shape the development of the coming generation in accordance with its own ideals, a sixth point emerges, viz.,

(vi) 'THE FINAL AIM OF EDUCATION IS MORAL'. The wording is by Professor Dewey, who states that this is 'almost universally admitted', and who even writes: 'If it does not affect character, it is not Education', and, again, 'It is a commonplace to say that the development of character is the end of all school work' (IV: p. 49). Others have used almost the

FINAL AIM
OF
EDUCATION

same words: 'It is almost universally

agreed that the supreme object of

Education is the formation of character,

and this agreement is due to the common conviction that morality is the unifying point of society, without which social harmony and happiness are

impossible.

impossible. Moral education is, consequently, held to be of supreme importance'(XXa). With this the late Professor James Ward agrees, too, saying that 'moral excellence' is 'the first and paramount aim of secular education' (XVI: p. 8).

How Education may be most effective in influencing character is of the essence of the present enquiry.

: :

In this connection, it may be noted that some educationists have stated, most definitely, one cause especially, of the ineffectiveness of education (and, as will become clear later, of Religious Education) though their remarks apply to many branches of instruction. For instance, Professor Dewey mentions that 'school education tends to become remote and artificial (abstract, in the unfavourable sense sometimes given that term) ... because its affairs are not organized into the ordinary practice of daily life'; he

EDUCATION
AND LIFE refers to the 'constant cry of the educational reformer of each age that the school education has got too far away from the actualities of life to be genuinely educative'.

Having regard to this, it will be seen that some definitions of Education are too narrow. Up to the present, a definition that would make Education cover all the forces that influence animal development, has been considered; and this definition has been, step

by

by step, reduced, so as to limit the meaning in accordance with general use by authorities on the subject. Now, a Roman Catholic definition of Education falls to be considered, and it becomes clear that it is not broad enough:

'The provision of suitable instruction to fit the child for the duties of social life' (XI: Article, 'Education').

Much depends on what is meant by 'Instruction', but

EDUCATION	the ordinary dictionary meaning is 'the
AS	act of instructing or teaching: informa-
INSTRUC-	tion: command', and the Dictionary of
TION	

Psychology gives

'INSTRUCTION = 1. the systematic imparting of knowledge to others; 2. a command or advice given by one individual to another' (X).

Certainly, instruction is important. English Free Church educationists admit this, too, Dr Yeaxlee saying that 'the place of instruction in Education, and especially in Religious Education, should be strongly emphasized'; he commends 'direct communication' of definite knowledge, as well as pointing out the advisability of encouraging and guiding pupils in digging out and arranging 'facts for themselves' (VI: pp. 108-109).

But Education cannot be limited to such instruction. Many would agree with Mr Caldwell Cook when he says that a 'natural education is by practice,

by

by doing things' rather than 'by instruction, the hearing how'; that telling 'can only be the servant of trying, not its substitute'; that 'we rarely profit from any experience other than our own'; and that it is well to let the child 'try as much as he can for himself under guidance'. (XVIII: p. 1).

Professor T. P. Nunn, too, states the 'general principle' that the 'function of the school is to encourage positive activities of a wholesome and valuable kind', and adds: 'moral as well as mental discipline comes by learning to do the right thing in the right way'; and Professor W. H.

NATURAL
EDUCATION
IS BY
PRACTICE Kilpatrick, on the other side of the Atlantic, says he would wish to think of Education 'as the process of continually remaking experience in such a way as to give it continually a fuller and richer content, and at the same time to give the learner ever increasing control over the process' (XII: p. 191).

('What do you mean by remaking life?'
'Take the small boy, and lacing his shoes.
Heretofore, mother or nurse has laced
his shoes ... Henceforth, he laces his
own shoes ... He has become independent
of his mother ... directs his own life').

Clearly, therefore, the definition of Education needs to be wide enough to include the work of clubs and organizations for the physical, mental, moral or spiritual development of young and old. Writing in

regard

regard to the Year 1938, Professor A. A. Cock says that the 'most striking contribution to general moral and religious education for the young (apart from the traditional methods of organized religion)

RELIGIOUS
AND MORAL
EDUCATION
BY CLUB
WORK

'lies in the 'general and widespread development of club work' (XIII: p. 216).

He mentions the Boys' Brigade, the Church Lads' Brigade, the Scouts, and the Girl Guides, and states that they were showing 'rekindled enthusiasm and activity'. Since the commencement of the War, other movements have sprung up, but all have this in common: they educate by encouraging young people to 'do things', 'telling' being only preparatory to 'trying'.

A seventh indicator of the meaning of Education may therefore be now added:

(vii) EDUCATION INCLUDES PARTICIPATION IN WHOLE-SOME ACTIVITIES.

Such participation has moral value, it is held. 'The introduction of every method that appeals to the child's active powers, to his capacities in construction, production, and creation, marks an opportunity to shift the centre of ethical gravity from observation (which is selfish) to a service (which is social)', Professor Dewey writes (IV: p. 26).

Not only should there be activity, but the activity should be actually part of the necessary routine

routine of the world's work, and not divorced from practical life. In this connection, Professor Dewey has, in a recent book, given an illustration of the type of education which he believes we should avoid. He tells of a school in a 'certain city' where youths are taught to swim without going into the water, being repeatedly drilled in the various movements which are necessary in swimming. When one of the young men, so trained, was asked how he got on when he found himself in the water, he laconically replied 'SUNK!' The story, Professor Dewey adds, 'happens to be true!' He suggests that educative results may best be secured by actual 'direct participation' in life. For the purposes of the present study, it is desirable that such 'direct participation in some form of contemporary life' should be included in the definition of Education,

EDUCATION BY	provided always that such participa-
DIRECT	tion is arranged by the educators
PARTICIPATION	with a deliberate educational purpose
IN LIFE	

in view. Examples may be found in some educational institutions.

For instance, in the grounds of the State School, Merbein, Australia, vines were planted, and equipment provided for the cultivation of the ground, the care of the vines, and the drying of the fruit; the whole of the various classes of work was done by the boys

boys themselves, under the guidance, of course, of the masters.

It is of the essence of the plan that the activities should contribute to the welfare of the community. Professor Dewey tells us that he believes that Education which does not occur through forms of life that are 'worth living for their own sake', is 'always a poor substitute for the genuine reality' (XIX: pp. 6-7).

An instance of an activity which contributed to the welfare of the community, and yet could not be classed as 'Education', is provided by a group of school boys, whose average age was about thirteen years. They formed themselves into a Firewood Company; appointed one of their own number as manager, and others as woodcutters, salesmen, measurers, and carters, as well as employing one or two men; kept accounts; paid for all manual labour at piece-work rates; gave other officials a percentage of the nett profits; and paid good dividends. By placing orders with the 'Company', the Headmaster and others encouraged these activities. But this particular 'form of experience', as it had not been arranged by those responsible for the education of the boys, does not comply with the accepted definition of 'Education'. It had, however, a certain advantage over many forms that have been so arranged, as the boys had been employed in 'creative'

or

or 'constructive' work; there had been planning, and co-operation in carrying out the plans; and the capabilities of the boys must have been increased by their experience.

An eighth indicator of the meaning of Education may be noted:

(viii) EDUCATION MAY PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES FOR WORK THAT IS OF VALUE TO THE COMMUNITY.

: :

With present-day German education (as well as British education) in mind, the question naturally arises, Is a Person's Education planned for the bene-

	fit of his community (and nation) or
FOR BENEFIT	
OF COMMUNITY	for the benefit of the individual him-
OR OF THE	
INDIVIDUAL?	self? Professor Nunn gives an answer

when he writes that

(a) 'The PRIMITIVE tendency in communities is towards the complete subordination of the individual';

(b) but 'In the Western peoples that tendency has, since the advent of Christianity, been checked and modified by an increasing valuation of the individual life'.

Educational theory, he says, in its recent trend, inclines to regard the 'perfection of the individual' as the proper purpose of educational efforts. 'The view is that the best forms of communal life will be fostered by an education which regards social

activities

activities as a necessary medium for the development of the higher stages of individual life, rather than something to which the claims of individual development must be subordinated' (V: VOL.7: p. 965).

This view finds some support in Central Europe also, but, as Mr Bertrand Russell points out, there is a tendency among Great Powers 'to make national greatness the supreme purpose of Education'. Of this tendency modern Japan affords a clear illustration (XIV: p. 4). The view of modern educationists (as expressed, for instance, by Professor Godfrey H. Thomson: 'The community exists for the individual, not the individual for the community, and Education may not properly set the means over the end' -- III: p. 25), then, differs from that of modern Japan and Nazi Germany, and is also seen to be in marked contrast with the outlook of some of the peoples of ancient times.

(Dr C. G. Jung has written: 'The further we go back into history, the more we see personality disappearing beneath the wrappings of collectivity. And if we go right down to primitive psychology, we find absolutely no trace of the idea of the individual. In place of individuality, we find only collective relationship ... What we understand by the concept "individual" is a relatively recent acquisition in the history of the human mind and human culture').

While we may say (in the words of Dr Boyd -- XV: p. 223) 'The Education of the present must seek to
make

make good citizens', yet we must also say (with Professor G. H. Thomson -- III: p. 24) 'Education is ... for the individual; and, in the long run, this is indeed so'.

A ninth note as to the meaning of Education is, then,

(ix) EDUCATION IS FOR THE PERFECTING OF THE INDIVIDUAL.

: :

To sum up: it appears that -

EDUCATION is a process

for the perfecting of individual persons,

who must develop according to the laws
of their own natures,

but who are set in an environment,

which includes personal forces,

and which can be manipulated

partly by the provision of
opportunities for activity,

including work which is of
value to the community,

so that individual development may be
satisfactory,

the proper aim being moral perfection.

: :

A question remains unanswered: What development shall be called 'satisfactory?' or, What is 'moral perfection?' Miss Alice M. Ashley says: 'Our aim is the development of the many powers of
mind

mind and of body with which the child is endowed, and the strengthening of the will to use those powers for the general good' (XVII: p. 209). But when the 'many powers' are considered in detail (as they will be in the course of this enquiry), it will be found that some qualification of this statement is needed.

WHAT IS
SATISFACTORY
DEVELOPMENT?

Many educationists would prefer to follow Professor Nunn, who, writing on the Aim of Education, states that 'we may say with Plato' that it is

"to develop in the body and in the soul all the beauty and all the perfection of which they are capable;"

'but this leaves quite undecided the nature and the form of that "beauty and perfection," and on such points there has never been universal agreement at any one time, while successive ages have shown marked difference of estimate.' 'Hence', he concludes, 'so far as any conception of Education can give guidance to the actual process, it must be relative in every way to the state of development of the society in which it is given' (V: VOL.7: p. 965).

This is recognised, too, by Professor Drever, who speaks of Education as a process, controlled in part 'by the adult community in such a way as to produce a certain type of individual, consciously or unconsciously regarded as the normal type by that community' (II: p. 1).

This

This 'state of development of the society', by which the Education is 'controlled', requires special attention, and in this connection the meaning attached to the word 'Religious' at the present time, in this country, now has to be considered.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- | | | |
|------|---|--|
| I | Encyclopædia of Religion and Ethics
EDINBURGH: T. & T. CLARK
2nd Impression 1937
(first printed 1912) |)(Article 'Education' in Volume 5, by John Adams, formerly Professor of Education, Univ. of London. |
| II | An Introduction to the Psychology of Education
LONDON: EDWARD ARNOLD & Co.
2nd Impression 1923 | by Jas. Drever, M.A., B.Sc., D.Phil. Professor of Psychology in the University of Edinburgh |
| III | A Modern Philosophy of Education
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & UNWIN
2nd Impression 1931
(first published 1929) | by Godfrey H. Thomson, Bell Prof. of Education, University of Edinburgh |
| IV | Moral Principles in Education
BOSTON, U.S.A., &c.: HOUGHTON MIFFLIN Co.
1909 | by John Dewey, Professor of Philosophy in Columbia University |
| V | The Encyclopædia Britannica
14th Edition
LONDON
1929 | Article 'Educational Theory' by T. Percy Nunn, M.A., D.Sc., Prof. of Education, Univ. of London. |
| VI | The Approach to Religious Education in Sunday School and Day School
LONDON: S.C.M. PRESS
1931 | by Basil A. Yeaxlee, Ph.D., formerly Principal of Westhill Training College |
| VII | Educational Psychology Briefer Course
NEW YORK: Teachers' Coll. Columbia Univ. Press: 1925 | by E.L. Thorndike, Prof. of Educational Psychology in Teachers' Coll. Columbia Univ. |
| VIII | Chambers's Encyclopædia
LONDON & EDINBR. 1924 | Article, 'Education' by John Adams |
| IX: | Instinct, Intelligence and Character; an Educational Psychology
LONDON: ALLEN & UNWIN
Reprinted 1927 | by G. H. Thomson, Ph.D., D.Sc. Bell Professor of Educatn., Edinbr. |

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS...(Continued):

- | | | |
|-------|--|---|
| X | Dictionary of Psychology
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.: 1935 | Edited by the late
Howard C. Warren,
Princeton Univ. |
| XI | A Catholic Encyclopædic
Dictionary
LONDON: CASSELL & CO. LD.
1931. | General Editor,
Donald Attwater |
| XII | Foundations of Method
NEW YORK: THE
MACMILLAN COY.
1926 | by Wm.H.Kilpatrick,
Teachers' College
Prof. of Education,
Columbia Univ. |
| XIII | Encyclopædia Britannica Supplement, Year 1938 | |
| XIV | On Education, Especially
in Early Childhood
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.
Reprinted 1928
(first published 1926) | by Bertrand Russell |
| XV | The Modern Teacher
LONDON: METHUEN & CO.
LTD.: 1921 | Edited by A. Watson
Bain, M.A. |
| XVI | Psychology Applied to
Education
CAMBRIDGE UNIV. PRESS
1926 | by the late Prof.
James Ward |
| XVII | Religion in Education
VOL. 2, No. 4,
Oct. 1935. | Article, 'Christ in
School Worship and
Teaching', by Miss
A. M. Ashley, Head-
mistress, Honor Oak
Secondary School |
| XVIII | The Play Way: An Essay
in Educational Method
LONDON: Wm.HEINEMANN LD.
New Impression, Mar.1924 | by H. Caldwell Cook,
M.A. |
| XIX | Education To-Day
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.: 1941 | by John Dewey |
| XX | The Educational Ideas of
Pestalozzi and Fröbel
LONDON: Ralph, Holland
& Co.: Revised Ed.1905
(first published 1904) | by F.H.Hayward,
D.Lit., M.A. |

CHAPTER II

RELIGION

: :

'It is well said, in every sense, that a man's religion is the chief with regard to him'

-- Thomas Carlyle

('Heroes and
Hero-Worship')

CHAPTER II

RELIGION.

The meaning of the word 'Education' having been examined, the question now is, What is meant by 'Religious Education?'

'Religious' is an adjective, and signifies 'Pertaining to Religion'. But what is 'Religion?'

Dr C. G. Jung distinguishes

- (a) the 'emotional and symbolical phenomena of a religion' f r o m
- (b) the 'nature of religion'.

It is, Dr Jung points out, only the former (the 'phenomena') that many psychologists would feel justified in examining; but, for the purposes of this enquiry, it is well to know what others, including theologians, consider (b) (the essential 'nature of religion') to be.

Some have spoken of Religion as an instinct. Dr Glover, for instance, uses the term 'the religious instinct' (I: p. 2), and so does Dr A. S. Peake (II: p. 25); Dr Starbuck speaks of Religion as a 'deep-rooted instinct' (VI: p. 125), and Professor M. Jastrow not only mentions the 'religious instinct', but is quoted by Professor Wm. McDougall as having

IS RELIGION
AN INSTINCT?

written: 'The definite assumption of a religious instinct in man forms part of almost every definition of religion proposed

since

since the appearance of Schleiermacher's discourses' (IX: p. 260). The phrase has been in such common use that it has been defined both in Dr Baldwin's Dictionary of Philosophy and Psychology (III) and in the more modern Dictionary of Psychology edited by the late Professor Howard C. Warren (IV). However, in the former dictionary it was noted (under 'Religious Instinct') that 'impulse' and not 'instinct' was the 'proper' word.

Whether it is desirable, or not, to call Religion an 'instinct' must depend on the meaning that is given to the word 'instinct'. This word is used by many writers in connection with the very processes that are the subject of this study, and it will therefore become necessary, in an early chapter, to decide what is usually meant by 'instinct', although it may not be possible to frame a definition that would be acceptable to every psychologist. When the word 'instinct' has been defined, it will be seen that it becomes impossible to class Religion with the instincts, and that it is necessary to look in other directions, if Religion is to be described adequately.

'Religion' is a word that has been given many meanings, and that has been used to describe various faiths; in these circumstances, classification of religions is desirable. One broad classification is given in The Encyclopædia Britannica, where the treatment

treatment of the subject is divided into two parts, which are headed respectively (A) PRIMITIVE RELIGION and (B) THE HIGHER RELIGIONS.

Under the former heading, the minimum definition of Sir E. B. Tylor (in 'Primitive Culture') is quoted, viz., 'The belief in spiritual beings'; but it is pointed out

- (1) That practice must be reckoned as primary; and
- (11) That the outlook is not exclusively towards the spiritual, but also towards the quasi-material.

Sir J. G. Frazer's definition (in 'The Golden Bough') is also given, viz.,

'The propitiation or conciliation of powers superior to man, which are believed to direct and control the course of nature and of human life'.

By 'powers' are meant 'conscious or personal agents',

though (it is pointed out) 'personal' may
PRIMITIVE
RELIGION exclude much that the 'primitive man undoubtedly treats with awe and respect as exerting a mystic effect on his life' (VI: Article, Religion).

Having said this, it is not necessary, for the purposes of this study, to consider Primitive Religion further. It is HIGHER RELIGIONS with which we are here concerned, and particularly one of the Higher Religions -- the highest -- Christianity. To discover the essential nature of Religion, as we know Religion, not in the mission field, but in this

country

country, is the important matter.

A Roman Catholic definition states that

RELIGION is a virtue
 by which men exhibit due worship
 and reverence to God
 as the Creator and Supreme Ruler
 of all things
 and acknowledge their dependence
 on God
 by rendering Him a due and fitting
 worship
 both interior
 (e.g., by acts of devotion,
 reverence, thanksgiving,
 etc.)
 and exterior
 (e.g., by external reverence,
 liturgical acts, etc.)
 (X: p. 448).

But what is meant by a VIRTUE? Virtue has been
 defined as

'The practice of duty',
 and, more fully, as
 'The act of adhering
 (or the quality through which one
 adheres)
 to those social ideas and standards
 in general which involve the
 notion of moral conduct'
 (IV: Virtue)

or it may mean an 'excellence'.

'Religion', then, is seen as an 'excellence' or
 'practice of duty' or 'act of adhering' (or 'quality')

by which men exhibit worship and rever-
 THE HIGHER
 RELIGIONS ence. Such a description might be given
 by an outsider, by one who observed the practice of
 others; but something more is required if the

'essential

'essential nature of religion' is to be understood and not the 'emotional and symbolical phenomena of a religion' described (to refer to the distinction made by Dr Jung -- which distinction is also noted in the Dictionary of Philosophy and Psychology edited by Dr Baldwin).

Dr R. H. Thouless speaks of eight different definitions of Religion in the first chapter of his 'Introduction to the Psychology of Religion', and

VARIOUS DEFINITIONS COLLECTED BY VARIOUS AUTHORS mentions that Professor Leuba has collected forty-eight, from various writers, including them in 'A Psychological Study of Religion'. Dr Thouless himself, while admitting that, 'possibly, for a different purpose, a different definition would have been found more convenient', indicates the sense in which the word 'Religion' is used in the course of his own book:

'Religion is a felt practical relationship with what is believed in as a superhuman being or beings' (VIIa:p. 4). (a)

While this may be accepted as being broad enough to embrace

(a) This may be contrasted with the Roman Catholic definition already quoted, in which Religion is said to be a 'Virtue'. 'Virtue' is defined (in the same Roman Catholic publication) as 'Excellence or perfection of a thing... a habit operative of good, i.e., .. a lasting disposition of the soul's faculties, setting them towards good, and thus perfecting them by lifting their natural indeterminateness and substituting a definite tendency (but without constraint) to good rather than evil' (X: Virtue)

embrace both primitive and higher religions, it is possible to describe Religion, as understood by Protestant Christians in this country to-day, in greater detail.

After giving a definition somewhat similar to that adopted by Dr Thouless, the late Professor H. R. Mackintosh added:

'together with the felt need to have personal fellowship therewith' (VII: p. 18-19).

Contrasting Science and Religion, he proceeds: 'While Science rightly is content with explanations that keep strictly within the boundaries of space and time, Religion insists on rising up, beyond the world of phenomena, to a transcendent Power, and entering into

RELIGION AS
FELLOWSHIP
WITH THE
UNSEEN

fellowship with the Unseen. There is in it the thrill of response to the "Supernatural". Then, after discussing the ultimate meaning of Art, he describes Religion as confronting us 'with the holy, the august, the unconditionally sublime and commanding', and notes: 'Here, accordingly, the question of objective truth is vital and inescapable' (VII: pp. 22-23).

'Fellowship with the Unseen' is also stressed by Professor A. S. Peake, who adds: 'We need for each individual an original spiritual experience, the electric thrill of definite contact with God' (VIII: p. 7), and quotes:

'As

'As the hart panteth after the water-brooks,
so panteth my soul after Thee, O God',

and

'Whom have I in heaven? and possessing
Thee, I delight in nought upon earth'.

Here Professor Peake comments: 'Surely these are
Religion of the purest kind' (VIII: p. 10). In his
own words Professor Peake describes this experience:

'Here we are at the centre. It is the
meeting of spirit and spirit, the flush
of happiness, the thrill of satisfac-
tion, the sense of peace, the glad
realization that now at last a hunger,
keener than hunger, has been appeased
by the heavenly bread. God and the
soul have met, and in the shock of that
meeting there has come to the soul a
wholly new emotion' (VIII: p. 3).

Religion is here being described in terms of its
affect^(a); this is not definition; metaphor is
being used freely. But as the affect is pictured,
it is possible to realise something of the nature
of the 'living tendency' that produces this happiness,
satisfaction, peace.

In order to indicate the aim, the purpose of
Religions Education, a lengthy quotation is appended
the late
from Professor W. P. Paterson's writings; this
makes clear what Religion may mean to those for
whose Education we are now planning:

'To

(a) This study is concerned with CONATION (purposive
activity -- the active phase of volition, desire,
impulse) rather than with AFFECT (emotional experi-
ence); however, all mental activity (including
religious experience) comprises both; as an 'emotion'
is the 'expression of the operation of a particular
disposition' (XI: p. 456) the quotation is useful for
our purpose.

'To possess a satisfying view of existence
 as a whole,
 and of its first and final cause,
 to make a spiritual valuation of human life,
 to be haunted by a vision of the divinely
 beautiful,
 to revere a moral ideal which towers above
 custom and convention,
 and to aim at living up to it,
 to believe in the realisation of the SUMMUM
 BONUM

--- THESE THINGS,
 which seem to be a high cultural
 achievement
 when stated in scholastic language,
 have been attained by multitudes of
 commonplace people in every land
 upon whom an ethical religion,
 and notably the Christian religion,
 has laid its spell'
 (IX: p. 28).

In order still further to make clear the nature and
 aim of the Christian religion, another quotation is
 given from the same book by Professor Paterson; in
 this he describes the 'daring of the religious
 venture,' in which man has sought

'not merely to penetrate to the deepest secrets
 of existence,
 and make the Infinite submit to the em-
 brace of his finite mind,
 but to perfect his human weakness by linking
 it to divine omnipotence,
 and to defy death itself by seeking a
 refuge in the Eternal'
 (IX: p. 24).

: :

Professor Paterson has mentioned 'a moral ideal
 which towers above custom and convention' and the
 aim of 'living up to it'; the question arises,

'Does

'Does Religion imply Morality?'

It would not be right to say, without a caution, that Religion does imply Morality. Much could be quoted contradicting such a statement. 'Many persons have been extremely religious and extremely wicked'. 'A strong case could be made for the contention that, on the whole, Religion, up to date, had done more harm than good' (Dr Temple, now Archbishop of Canterbury, said this in his Gifford Lectures). Dr Peake tells us that many religions have found their 'most congenial -- nay, their supreme -- expression in what would seem to us the most revolting vice'. 'In Greece itself' Morality and Religion were quite different, distinct. 'Religion has in many instances worked for the moral degradation rather than for the uplifting of man'.

Professor Bruce, on the other hand, wrote: 'Morality is the sure outcome of Religion'.

These conflicting statements are really complementary; for, while Dr Temple and Dr Peake were referring to religions of all times and of all places, it was the Christian Religion, within the past century, as he knew it in Scotland, to which Professor Bruce was referring (this is suggested by the very title of the book from which the quotation is taken, 'The Formation of Christian Character'). And it is the

Christian

Christian Religion, as he knew it in England, to which Dr Peake was referring, when (after quoting a tale from a negro community abroad) he wrote: 'Religion, as we understand it, leaves no room for chicken-stealing' (VIII: p. 8). 'It is, indeed, the great glory of the Religion of Israel and of Christianity that they have wedded Morality and Religion', he says (VIII: p. 11); and, again, he tells us that the Gospel fused Religion and Morality so completely 'that it often

THE CHRISTIAN RELIGION IMPLIES MORALITY	comes as a startling novelty to a man' to be told that 'the two are quite different' (VIII: p. 16). But, so
--	---

clear has it been made, through Christianity, that 'a religious life must be a moral life', that Dr Temple is able to say that 'no one in the modern Western world disputes the proposition that Religion is concerned with Ethics' (Gifford Lectures, p. 31).

However, it is still possible to distinguish (as Dr Peake does) between those in whom the ethical temper predominates and those in whom the religious is stronger; 'one will say, "I must do right at all costs, and I am religious because it is my duty to be so"; the other will say, "Religion is my deepest need, and God is my highest good. I must be moral, for only so can I maintain my fellowship with my God, and express in action the love I feel for Him".' (VIII: p. 11).

It

It is clear that Religion -- Religion as understood in this country to-day, the Christian Religion -- necessarily implies Morality.

With this definitely in mind, we proceed to summarise the meaning of Religion for us:

RELIGION is a practical relationship
with God as revealed by Jesus Christ,

together with the felt need to have
fellowship with Him,

giving happiness and peace,

a satisfying view of existence
as a whole,

a spiritual valuation of human
life,

and a moral ideal which towers
above custom and convention,

and enabling the believer to overcome
even death itself

by finding refuge in the Eternal.

: :

Now that the meaning of Religion has been considered, it will be possible to see what is meant by Religious Education.

For Education to be good, Professor Nunn tells us, it must aim at the right kind of product. The product at which we aim is a character ever developing towards the perfection indicated in our definition of Religion.

Another requisite for good Education (again to quote Professor Nunn) is that the means adopted

be

be well fitted to secure the desired results.

Educationists, we have seen, regard the manipulation of the environment (personal and other surroundings) as the best means, and some suggest that the environment should be so adapted as to include opportunity for the child to participate in some form of contemporary life, opportunity for constructive, productive and even creative work, which will be of value to the community.

But before we can understand what kind of environment would best provide such opportunities, it is necessary to know something of the mental nature of the child, who, it is hoped, will develop in accordance with the Religious and Moral Ideal which has been envisaged.

This study of the child -- of human nature in its mental aspect -- belongs to the realm of Psychology, and we now turn to that science to discover what help it can give towards the perfecting of the Theory of Religious Education.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- | | | |
|------|--|---|
| I | THE JESUS OF HISTORY
LONDON: STUDENT
CHRISTIAN MOVEMENT
1917 | by T. R. Glover |
| II | CHRISTIANITY: ITS NATURE
AND ITS TRUTH
LONDON: DUCKWORTH & CO.
Ninth Impression, 1913
(first published, 1908) | by A. S. Peake, D.D.
Professor of
Bibl. Exegesis,
University of
Manchester |
| III | DICITIONARY OF PHILOSOPHY
AND PSYCHOLOGY: Article
'Religious Instinct' | edited by J. Mark
Baldwin |
| IV | DICTIONARY OF PSYCHOLOGY
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.
1935 | edited by the late
Howard C. Warren,
Princeton Univ. |
| V | MODERN MAN IN SEARCH OF A
SOUL
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
1934 (first published in
1933) | by C. G. Jung |
| VI | ENCYCLOPÆDIA BRITANNICA
LONDON: ENCYCL. BRIT. CO.
14th Edition | Article, 'Religion' |
| VII | THE CHRISTIAN APPREHEN-
SION OF GOD
LONDON: STUDENT CHRISTN.
MOVEMENT
1929 | by H. R. Mackintosh,
D. PHIL., D.D. |
| VIIa | AN INTRODUCTION TO THE
PSYCHOLOGY OF RELIGION
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY
PRESS
2nd Edition Reprntd. 1936
(first published 1923) | by R. H. Thouless,
M.A., Ph.D.
Asst. Professor
of Psychology
University of
Glasgow |
| VIII | CHRISTIANITY: ITS NATURE..
(same book as II) | by A. S. Peake, D.D. |
| IX | THE NATURE OF RELIGION:
GIFFORD LECTURES
LONDON: HODDER &
STOUGHTON
1925 | by W. P. Paterson, D.D.
Professor of
Divinity
Univ. of Edinbr. |

*former
Lecturer in
now
Cambridge Univ.*

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS (continued)

- X A CATHOLIC ENCYCLOPÆDIC General Editor,
 DICTIONARY Donald Attwater
 LONDON: CASSELL & CO.
 LTD.
 1931
- XI AN OUTLINE OF ABNORMAL by Wm. McDougall,
 PSYCHOLOGY F.R.S.
 LONDON: METHUEN & CO. Professor of
 LTD. Psychology in
 1926 Harvard College

CHAPTER III

P S Y C H O L O G Y

: :

'All the choir of heaven and furniture
 of earth, all those bodies which
 compose the mighty frame of the world
 -- have not any subsistence without
 a mind'

-- George Berkeley

('Principles of
 Human Knowledge')

CHAPTER III

P S Y C H O L O G Y

Professor Jung states that mankind as a whole has held, from its earliest beginnings, the belief that the soul is a 'substance', meaning, by 'substance', 'That which has independent existence' (I: p. 200). This certainly is the Orphic tradition, adopted by the Pythagoreans and others; it is implied in the theory of the transmigration of souls (II: p. 191). Such dualism also appears in the solution of meta-

PSYCHOLOGY

AS THE SCIENCE
OF THE 'SOUL'

physical and ethical problems of early Greek philosophy (III: p. 23).

In fact, in the Ancient Graeco-Roman world the belief was general, and it continued throughout the Middle Ages (I: p. 200).

So Aristotle and his followers, including the Scholastics, use a word, 'Psychology' (psyche-ψυχή - the soul; logos-λόγος - discourse) in connection with the theory of mental operations; i.e., they regard mental processes as the activity of the psyche -- the soul, mind, living principle, or spiritual 'substance' in man.

Even within the last half-century, when his purpose has not been to supply an exact definition^(a)

a Professor

(a) Sir John Adams (writing in 1897) called his a 'working definition', and added: 'It is not perhaps of vital importance that we should define Psychology; it is different with John'.

a Professor of Education, or a Professor of Psychology, has sometimes written

'Psychology ... we may say it is the study of the soul of John' (IV: p. 19)

or -

'Psychology is the science of the mind' (II: p. 7);

and Dr Spearman was in 1937 still able to state that 'some psychologists would, and others would not, make their science include some kind of 'soul' (V: p. 27).

But under the influence of 'scientific materialism', everything that cannot be 'perceived by the senses or traced back to physical causes' is now, in many quarters, held in doubt (I: p. 200), and there is 'Psychology without a soul'; or, in the words of Dr Cyril Burt, a man is no longer usually regarded as 'a potential corpse loosely coupled with a possible ghost'.

Against the supplanting of a 'metaphysics of the mind' by a 'metaphysics of matter', protests have been

made. They include that of Dr Jung,

INFLUENCE OF
'SCIENTIFIC
MATERIALISM'

who points out that 'no chain of

reasoning can prove or disprove the

existence of either mind or matter', adding that both these 'concepts' are 'mere symbols that stand for something unknown and unexplored' (I pp.201-202).

There is a fact here -- that 'other-worldliness' has been exchanged for 'matter-of-fact-ness' -- which

affects

affects the theory of Religious Education, and which must be taken into account in a later chapter. But for the purpose of finding the meaning of Psychology, it is sufficient to note the position, and to respect the attitude of the psychologist 'who rightly holds' (to quote Professor Drever) 'that to define his science in terms of mind or soul is to define it in terms not of facts, but of an inference from facts, which might be challenged, and is therefore entirely illegitimate' (VI: p. 4). To make the definition broad enough to include all psychologies, it is necessary therefore to avoid using such a noun as 'soul' or 'mind'.

So William James opened his 'Psychology' thus:

'The definition of Psychology may be best given in the words of Professor Ladd, as the DESCRIPTION AND EXPLANATION OF STATES OF CONSCIOUSNESS AS SUCH.'
(VII: p. 1).

(By 'states of consciousness' William James tells us that he means such 'things as sensations, desires, emotions, cognitions, reasonings, decisions, volitions, and the like').

In 1902, Professor G. F. Stout held a similar view as to the meaning of Psychology, which he defined as

'The science which treats of actual psychical processes, their objects as such, and the conditions of their occurrence'

'occurrence' (VIII: Article 'Psychology'). Professor Stout is able to add that this definition agrees with that of Wundt, for according to him, 'Psychology investigates the entire content of experience in its relation to the subject'.

The standpoint is that of 'the subject'. The aim of these psychologists, at the close of last century, was to describe 'states of consciousness', 'psychical processes', 'mental life', or 'experience', from the point of view of the individual whose 'experience' it was, and the practice of each was to take his own mind 'as the most accessible sample'. Wundt speaks of two 'auxiliary methods' (experiment, and the history of mankind), but says that 'all Psychology begins with Introspection' (IX: p. 177).

This is in striking contrast to the attitude of many of the later psychologists; and in 1921 Professor Drever was able to say that the tendency at present 'is always to lay stress upon the material facts studied, and by preference the objective facts' (VI: p. 4). Professor McDougall, in 1922, when forming a definition for inclusion in his comprehensive books ('An Outline of Psychology' and 'An Outline of Abnormal Psychology'), rejected the term 'consciousness', which he called a 'thoroughly bad word', 'having the form of a substantive that cannot

cannot be used as a verb', and so allowing us to 'forget that it stands for the fact of being conscious of something, and that it implies some one who

is conscious of that something' (X: p. 16).

REJECTION OF
THE WORD
'CONSCIOUS-
NESS'

Some psychologists go further, and refuse to include 'conscious phenomena' within the scope of the science, regarding Psychology as concerned with the systematic investigation of only the activities (or 'Behaviour') of the human being. 'Behaviorism',^(a) (Dr J. B. Watson writes) 'claims
'BEHAVIORISM' that "consciousness" is neither
AND
'CONSCIOUSNESS' a definable nor a usable concept; that it is merely another word for the "soul" of more ancient times' (XI: p. 3).

There has been another important development which makes it necessary now to omit the word 'consciousness' when defining Psychology. The definitions already quoted limit the science to 'states of consciousness', 'actual psychical processes', or the 'content of experience'. By a 'psychical' process, Professor Stout means a 'conscious' process; further, an 'actual' psychical process is a 'process as it takes place in the life history of some individual consciousness at a particular time and in connection with some particular bodily organism' (VIII: Article, 'Psychology');

and

(a) The 'Behaviorists'' own spelling

and, as Dr Spearman points out (when rejecting that 'most obvious' definition of Psychology, 'The Science of the conscious'), the word 'consciousness' has degenerated into one of the worst sources of misunderstanding between different psychological schools.

Not only are there the reasons given by Professor McDougall for omitting the word 'consciousness' from a definition; there is another: 'SOME AUTHORITIES,

but NOT OTHERS, WOULD TAKE IN A
THE 'REGION' OF
THE 'UNCONSCIOUS' VAST REGION CALLED THAT OF "UN-
CONSCIOUSNESS" OR "SUB-CONSCIOUSNESS" (V: p. 27).

This 'vast region' is of great importance for the subject of this enquiry, but it need not be explored in detail at this juncture; it will be dealt with from an historical point of view in the next chapter.

Here, a definition of Psychology is being sought; and it appears that, taking into consideration the

view s of different schools, modern
MODERN
DEFINITIONS writers generally prefer to speak of
Psychology in such terms as these:

'The science of the facts of human
nature and human behaviour' (VI:
p. 4).

Professor McDougall sets out the position as follows:

'Psychology is, or aspires to become,
a science, a systematically organized
and growing body of knowledge ...
The aim of Psychology is to render
our knowledge of human nature more
exact and more systematic, in order

that

'that we may control ourselves more wisely and influence our fellow-men more effectively' (X: p. 1).

This (he explains) is a 'statement' rather than an exact 'definition'; it is too broad, as Anthropology is also a science that studies human nature; and it is too narrow, as 'one well-established branch of Psychology studies animals.'. In order to narrow the definition so as to exclude Anthropology (and Physiology), the words 'in its mental aspect' (X: p. 37) might follow the word 'nature'; and as to Animal Psychology, this is unimportant in connection with the study of Religious Education (except for purposes of comparison and contrast), and a definition that does not include the study of animals within the realm of Psychology is quite satisfactory for our purpose.

Dr Drever has distinguished 'Pure Psychology' from 'Applied Psychology' (V: pp. 5-6); the former, he points out, seeks to understand 'the behaviour of living organisms, and especially of human beings'; the latter 'lays more stress on external results', and 'is less concerned with general laws and principles, more with the individual human being' and the 'claims and needs of practical life'. It is with 'Pure Psychology' that this chapter deals, and it is a definition of 'Pure Psychology' that is

now

now being sought. However, when the 'mental processes, the thoughts, feelings, desires and purposes, which underlie' human behaviour, have been discovered, then their application to the theory of Religious Education must be considered. That such is the proper end of Psychology is admitted (as in Professor McDougall's definition (or 'statement')).

Professor Drever has given a definition of Psychology that avoids both the objections to the 'statement' of Professor McDougall that has been quoted, and that applies to the 'Pure Psychology' which is under discussion:

'The Science which takes as its field of study the behaviour of living organisms, as far as it is mentally or psychically conditioned, and can be interpreted in mental or psychical terms' (XII: p. 1).

The tendency of modern Psychology having been noted, and the changes in outlook having been mentioned in outline, it is now possible to pass on to consider the rise of the 'dynamic' psychologists, and of the 'hormic' theory in Psychology.

: :

Towards the end of last century, Sir John Adams wrote that Psychology 'labours under a formidable name and a bad reputation' (IV: p. 17). Since then, its reputation, in the eyes of many, has certainly not improved, but there has been a change

in both the personnel of the critics and the reason for the bad name of the science. For this change, the DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGISTS have been largely responsible. (a) Popular misconceptions may, in part, account for the 'bad reputation' of the later years. (b)

(a) 'Freud's contributions to psychology have met with a very bitter opposition from a certain number of psychologists and doctors, and from many more people who are neither. They have been attacked on moral, on æsthetic, and on scientific grounds. The intensity of this opposition makes it rather difficult to estimate the importance and the value of his work' -- Dr R. H. Thouless (XIII: p. 107).

(b) However, even Professor McDougall can, on occasion, speak of 'the stinking complexes hauled up from the depths of "the Unconscious".' (XIV: p. 452).

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN
MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- I Modern Man in Search of by C. G. Jung
 a Soul
 LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
 TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.
 Fourth Impression, 1934
 (first published, 1933)
- II The Subnormal Mind by Cyril Burt, M.A.,
 LONDON: Oxford Uni- D.Sc.
 versity Press Professor of Psy-
 Second Edition, 1937. chology, Univers-
 ity of London.
- III A History of Psychology by George Sidney Brent
 Ancient and Patrhist- M.A. (Oxon)
 ic
 LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
 Co.
 1912
- IV The Herbartian Psycho- by John Adams, M.A.,
 logy Applied to B.Sc., Professor
 Education of Education in
 LONDON: D. C. HEATH &
 Co.
 1897
- V Psychology Down the Ages by C. Spearman, Ph.D.,
 LONDON: MACMILLAN & Hon.LL.D., F.R.S.
 CO. LTD. Emeritus Prof. of
 1937 Psychology in the
 University of
 London
- VI The Psychology of by James Drever, M.A.,
 Industry B.Sc., D.Phil.,
 LONDON: METHUEN & CO. Professor of
 LTD. Psychology, Uni-
 1921 versity of
 Edinburgh
- VII Psychology by William James
 LONDON: MACMILLAN &
 CO.
 1892 Professor of
 Psychology in
 Harvard Uni-
 versity

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS ... (Continued)

- VIII Dictionary of Philosophy & Psychology, edited by J. Mark Baldwin
NEW YORK: THE MACMILLAN COY.
Article, 'Psychology' by G.F. Stout, M.A., LL.D., Professor of Logic & Metaphysics in St Andrew's University
- IX A Hundred Years of Psychology 1833-1933
LONDON: DUCKWORTH
Second Impression, 1934
by J. C. Flügel, Assistant Professor of Psychology, University College, London
- X An Outline of Psychology
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
2nd Edition, 1924
by Wm. McDougall, F.R.S.
- XI Behaviorism
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL, TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.
1925
by John B. Watson, formerly Professor of Psychology, John Hopkins University
- XII An Introduction to the Psychology of Education
LONDON: EDWARD ARNOLD & CO.
1923
by Jas. Drever, M.A., B.Sc., D.Phil., Professor of Psychology, University of Edinburgh
- XIII An Introduction to the Psychology of Religion
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
2nd Edition reprinted 1936 (first pub. 1923)
by R.H. Thouless, M.A., Ph.D., (Assistant Professor of) Psychology at the University of Glasgow
- XIV An Outline of Abnormal Psychology
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
1926
by Wm. McDougall, F.R.S., Professor of Psychology in Harvard College

CHAPTER IV

SOME SCHOOLS OF PSYCHOLOGY

: :

'Some are bewildered in the maze
of schools'

-- Alexander Pope

(Essay on Criticism,
1. 6).

CHAPTER IV

SOME SCHOOLS OF PSYCHOLOGY

In order to make clear the difference between the DYNAMIC and OTHER SCHOOLS of PSYCHOLOGY, it is proposed in this chapter to trace briefly certain developments, preparatory to a consideration of the contribution that the HORMIC THEORY has made to the science. One way of distinguishing between the different 'schools' is by observing the methods used by their adherents, and reference will therefore be made to some of the chief of these.

It has already been noted that, at the close of last century, the aim of many psychologists was to describe 'states of consciousness'. By description of their own experience, they hoped
 THE METHOD OF
 INTROSPECTION to gain a great deal of information, and to give a rational explanation of human behaviour. The happenings in their own minds were the material on which they worked, and their method of enquiry was that of 'introspection'. This word is used to denote reflection upon the varied processes of the human mind. Each man attempted both

(1) to observe directly, from a psychological standpoint, while the experience was in course of process; a n d

(ii) to describe, from memory, his past experiences.

experiences. The latter form of the method was called 'retrospection'.

Introspection (and retrospection) cannot even now be classed as out-of-date. 'The student may feel that his experience is too real to be explained away as an illusion; and he may argue that ... we cannot afford to repudiate introspective observation entirely ... If he takes this line, he will fall in with a large and excellent company of psychologists who are following just this road' (Professor McDougall: I: p. 27).

The same views are expressed, too, on the Continent of Europe; for instance, the Danish

CONTINENTAL
PSYCHOLOGISTS
AND INTROSPEC-
TION

psychologist, Vilhelm Rasmussen,
says that 'the chief condition for
being able to understand the soul

life of others is to be an attentive observer of one's own' (II: p. 2). He also notes that, if we are to understand that which other observers have to communicate, we need ourselves to practise self-observation.

Although both these quotations are from books written in the 'twenties, such views on introspection are still held to-day, more modern writings showing clearly the practice of their authors, who, though primarily studying 'objective facts',

continue

continue to 'introspect'. The Gestalt School, for instance, 'attempt to describe the configuration of mental process in terms of introspectively observable facts', as Professor McDougall has observed (VII: p. 435).

(That some psychologists do not regard introspection as a valid method is acknowledged; e.g., the 'Behaviorists' (a) of America. Sympathy would, however, be felt by many leading psychologists with the writer of the report of an experiment in 'The British Journal of Psychology' -- April, 1935 -- when he states: 'It is admitted, however, that whether the methods adopted are regarded as of any importance or not, depends upon whether introspection and direct verbal report are accepted as legitimate psychological methods' (III: p. 418)).

: :

As early as the opening of the Nineteenth Century there had come the idea of applying another method, that of experiment (b), though it was not until the
latter

(a) Adopting the American spelling, with Professor McDougall, though Drs. Hywel Hughes, Francis Aveling, and Sir John Adams include the 'u' even when naming the school.

(b) 'Introspection' when it is 'observation from a psychological standpoint, leading to description' is 'the equivalent of observation in the scientific sense' (VI: 'Introspection'), and it would be impossible to say that any 'introspectionist' had not used 'experimental' methods (in the broader sense of the word 'experiment').

half of the century that Wilhelm Wundt, in Germany, set himself the task of employing the experimental method seriously. In 1867 Wundt began to lecture on physiological psychology; in 1874 appeared his

WUNDT AND THE
EXPERIMENTAL
METHOD

book that was a record of progress with regard to the new science; in 1875 Wundt went to Leipzig; and in

1879 he founded his laboratory there.

(In the Nineteenth Century this was called the 'New Psychology', but as this vague term has also been applied, at various times, to hypnotism, to psychoanalysis, and to Gestalt psychology, it cannot now be used without danger of ambiguity).

From this 'experimental' school, we have results of experiments and observations -- but described, by William James, as amounting 'in the end to just nothing'. Dr Kohler has continued the criticism in

CRITICISM OF
EXPERIMENTAL
SCHOOL

our own day, maintaining that 'hundreds of thousands of quantitative psycho-physical experiments have been

made almost in vain, because no one knew just what he was measuring, or what were the processes upon which the whole procedure was built'. He adds: 'The fact is that we are not in the habit of asking questions about underlying processes in psychology' (IV: p. 40).

The

The necessity of having 'questions of theoretical importance', if the method is to be scientific, was stressed by Professor Stout in his 'Manual' (V: p. 42), and these 'preliminary forms of hypothesis' are essential in scientific investigation, though not

mentioned specifically under 'science' (or under 'experiment' or 'scientific management' or 'scientific method' either) in the modern 'Dictionary of Psychology' (VI). However, showing that the methods used in psychological research to-day are in keeping with common practice in other sciences, Professor Sandiford (Toronto) points out that

PSYCHOLOGY USES THE STEPS FOUND IN ALL LOGICAL THINKING:

- (1) A problem is presented
- (11) After clearly defining the field a tentative hypothesis is proposed;
- (111) Observation and experiment are then invoked.

If these data fit the tentative hypothesis, more confidence can be placed in it; in fact, it may be elevated into a theory; then follow

- (1v) Further testing and experimentation.

If no instance conflicts with the theory, it may become a LAW or PRINCIPLE: then

- (v) The law is applied; and events are predicted.

He



He also mentions that scientific psychology

- (A) is dependent upon factual data obtained from observation (controlled or uncontrolled);
- (B) utilizes the principle of causation;
- (C) tries to explain as many effects as possible by the one principle; a n d
- (D) uses some methods of study that are peculiarly its own.

(VIII: p. 10 ff.)

: :

Two methods, then, have been already noted -- those of introspection and experiment. These are supplementary. 'The fund of experience which can be acquired by self-observation and by the interpretation of other persons' actions is the foundation of the psychological information which may be obtained by experimental methods' (II: p. 2); though (as became clear when a definition of Psychology was being sought) the tendency is now 'always to lay stress upon the material facts studied, and by preference the objective facts'.

Before following further developments of methods and later trends of schools, it is well to emphasize

the magnitude of our inheritance.

VALUE OF WORK
BY EARLIER
PSYCHOLOGISTS

From these earlier psychologists we have learned much about interest and attention, instinct and emotion -- and sentiments, too; and about 'the integration of the various

mental

mental states and conscious experiences'; from them we have received a large part of our working vocabulary, arranged in that veritable dictionary of psychology, Stout's 'Manual', where terms are so carefully explained and defined; and they are the pioneers, whose methods we use -- or ignore, and whose theories we test. It is our privilege to know their work, and its results, and to be able to commence where they left off.

: :

The investigation of mental phenomena, and of the behaviour of organisms, by experimental methods, continues to-day, and important findings are continually being reported from psychological laboratories in various parts of the world. Professor Stout claims that 'Psychology has always been to some extent experimental' (taking 'to experiment' as meaning 'to observe under conditions which we have ourselves pre-arranged'), but 'what is especially modern is the introduction of apparatus and of exact measurement' (V: p. 51).

: :

Developments were in two directions:

(A) Academic; a n d

(B) Biological.

(A) Academic Psychology. Some psychologists regarded 'introspection by experts under laboratory conditions'

conditions' as the main method of their science; they described and analysed 'the flow of experience' and aimed at discovering laws concerning the composition of the 'units' or 'atoms' of consciousness; this was sometimes called 'structural psychology', which is defined as

STRUCTURAL
PSYCHOLOGY

'a method or systematic treatment of psychology which investigates and describes the composition and the integration of the various mental states and conscious experiences' (VI).

Naturally, 'Introspectionism' is a term sometimes used by its critics when referring to this school, which Professor McDougall brands as 'narrow', 'atomistic', 'mosaic' -- indicating by the last-mentioned term the variegated nature of the 'stuff' of consciousness as described by the 'structural psychologists'. However, writing in 1922, he admits that this psychology is 'perhaps the one most widely held at the present day' (I: pp. 16-19; XI: p. 14).

Against this 'mosaic psychology' there has, naturally, been a reaction. The Psychological Institute of the University of Berlin has produced the Gestalt School of Psychology, which repudiates 'atomistic sensationism', refuses to accept the course of experience as a 'clustering of atoms of consciousness called sensations or images or feelings', and claims that any 'cross-section of experience is a structural whole,

GESTALT
SCHOOL OF
PSYCHOLOGY

whole, each part of which is organically related to all the rest'. These 'organized structures', when relatively incomplete, reveal an immanent tendency towards their own completion'.

Gestalt (configuration, pattern, structure) is defined as

'a term applied to those organized units, both experiential and behavioural, which possess specific properties not derivable from parts and their relations ... In its wider sense, Gestalt means an integration of members, as contrasted with a summation of parts' (VI: 'Gestalt').

A Gestalt may be either phenomenal, physical, physiological, or logical -- the last-named being 'a thought or logical unity having logical necessity' (VI: 'Gestalt').

Professor McDougall claims that 'that which has a definite Gestalt or configuration is not the pattern of experience ... but rather the structure of the mind, the mental dispositions whose activity and interplay underlie and express themselves both in the introspectively observable facts and in behaviour'. He mentions (with satisfaction) that the leaders of this school 'recognise that our life is fundamentally a series' of purposive striving towards goals, and that the Gestalt psychologists are not 'dogmatic mechanists' (VII: pp.426-430).

: :

(B) Biological

(B) Biological Developments. Another science, physiology, has had a great influence on psychology. There were those who, coming to the examination of human nature (as medical men, for instance, do come) with a knowledge of physiology, quickly concluded that the brain was all-important for mental life, and sought explanations solely from the physiological side. So 'there arose a physiological psychology, narrow, dogmatic, and thoroughly materialistic' (these adjectives,^(a) again, are Professor McDougall's); there has been much research, and 'a multitude of facts have been established' (I: p. 19; XI: p.14).

Meantime, the experimental methods, originally employed by Wundt in Germany, had spread to America, where they had taken root and thrived, and, in conjunction with physiological psychology, produced a crop of psychologists of a biological rather than of an introspectionist turn of mind; they not only favoured external observation and experiment, but they excluded introspection altogether (as already mentioned: p. 49). They have grown into the 'Behaviorists' of American psychology.

'Behaviorism'

(a) Professor McDougall wrote in 1935: 'I am convinced of the need for a ruthless facing of the situation and an utter frankness in stating the case as I see it... I adopt the policy of ruthless out-speaking' (XV: pp. 9-10).

'Behaviorism' is defined as

'The theoretical standpoint that all psychological phenomena can be adequately treated by the behaviour method' -- i.e., by the 'systematic observation and description of motor and glandular responses of the organism' (VI).

There can be no objection to the position taken up, in so far as it stresses the necessity for psychology being both experimental and able to make use of physiological information; but the reason for the

WHY DO THE	rejection of introspective methods
'BEHAVIORISTS'	is not so clear, although Professor
REJECT	
INTROSPECTION?	McDougall suggests that the develop-

ment is quite a logical one. Most of the psychologists of the 'structural' or 'introspectionist' school accepted (as a working hypothesis) the doctrine of 'psycho-physical parallelism', which is

'A theory of mind-body relations, according to which, for every variation in conscious processes or experiences, there is a concomitant variation in neural processes' BUT 'the theory makes no assumption of a causal relation between the two' (VI);

i.e., 'psycho-physical parallelism' implies that the mental processes do not influence behaviour. 'But it is in behaviour that we are interested', some psychologists said. 'We can observe behaviour -- what the organism does or says; let us concentrate our efforts on the study of behaviour; let us limit ourselves to things that can be observed, and

formulate

formulate laws concerning only those things'.

The words underlined are Dr J. B. Watson's. To avoid any misconception as to his meaning, he continues: 'And let me make this fundamental point at once: that SAYING is doing -- that is, behaving. Speaking overtly or to ourselves (thinking) is just as objective a type of behavior as baseball' (XII).

DR J. B. WATSON ON
'BEHAVIORISM' AND
'OBJECTIVE BEHAVI-
OR'

In order to give an idea of what all this amounts to in practice -- and as reference is being made in this chapter to the methods used by various schools of psychology -- a note is now given of some American methods mentioned in a chapter on 'The Individual In Infancy' (XIV: pp. 635-637):

- (1) Neurophysiology (in the higher animals, by experimental interference with the nervous system; in man, histological study of lesions in the nervous system of the infant may be brought into relation with antecedent studies of behaviour).
- (2) Experimental Analysis (controlled situations; response recorded in terms of time and space; cinema suitable for comparative study of behaviour at ascending developmental stages).
- (3) Psychometry (measurement -- e.g., of time in mental processes).
- (4) Naturalistic Observation (observation of infant, free from test situations)
- (5) Clinical Study (appropriate to those departures from the normal in which nature virtually provides an experiment for elucidation).

(6) Comparative method (stages of development objectively compared; 24-week and 28-week infant side by side; toy, pellet, or string presented).

(7) Co-Twin control (a development stimulus may be deliberately confined to one twin; effects observed).

('A specially devised ... "One-Way-Vision Screen" ... conceals the observer but not the observed')
(XIV: p. 641)

: :

However interesting the results of their observations may be -- and however necessary that some of their discoveries be applied to the theory of Religious Education -- it is not possible to follow the 'Behaviorists' further in this inquiry. For, in addition to refusing to make use of introspection, they have, with some notable exceptions, rejected the hormic theory.

The 'few notable exceptions' may be the forerunners of a generation of American psychologists whose views and methods are not so circumscribed as those of the ardent 'Behaviorists'. The voice of Dr J. B. Watson now seems to be sounding as if from the wilderness, but it is not the voice of a new prophet, preparing the way ahead; rather it sounds like the cry of a deserted leader, whose army has moved forward to fresh conquests. 'I have reached the end of my psychological career', Dr Watson writes (1936). ' ... The youngsters do not get a

fair

fair presentation. Hence they are not embarking whole-heartedly upon a Behavioristic career ... I honestly think that Psychology has been sterile for several years ... We need younger instructors, who will teach objective Psychology with no reference to the mythology most of us present-day psychologists have been brought up upon' (XIII: 'John Broad Watson').

: :

Sufficient has been noted to show that, by these Biological Schools of Psychology little attention has been paid to the energy that drives the human mind. To the development of those Schools of Psychology which have given heed to this aspect of human nature, it is now time to turn.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- | | | |
|------|---|---|
| I | An Outline of Psychology
LONDON: METHUEN & CO.
LTD.
2nd Edition, 1924
(first published 1923) | by Wm. McDougall,
F.R.S.
Professor of
Psychology in
Harvard College |
| II | Child Psychology, Vol.1
LONDON: GYLDENHAL
(& COPENHAGEN)
1920 | by Vilhelm Rasmussen
(Denmark) |
| III | The British Journal of
Psychology: General
Section
VOL. XXV: Part 4:
April, 1935 | Article, 'Some Mental
Functions,
Illustrated by an
Experiment on
Reading' Part I
by R. W. Pickford |
| IV | Gestalt Psychology
LONDON: G. BELL &
SONS LTD.
1930 | by Wolfgang Kohler
Professor of
Philosophy at
the University
of Berlin |
| V | A Manual of Psychology
LONDON: W. B. CLIVE
8th Impression (Third
Edition) 1919
(3rd Edition prepared
in July, 1913) | by G. F. Stout, M.A.,
LL.D. |
| VI | Dictionary of Psychology
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.
1935 | edited by the late
Howard C. Warren,
Princeton Uni-
versity |
| VII | An Introduction to
Social Psychology
23rd Edition, 1936 (en-
larged)
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD.
(first published, 1908) | by Wm. McDougall,
M.B., F.R.S. |
| VIII | Educational Psychology:
An Objective Study | by Peter Sandiford,
Professor of
Educational
Psychology in
the University
of Toronto |

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS ... (continued)

- IX A Hundred Years of Psychology by J. C. Flugel
 1833-1933 Assistant Pro-
 LONDON: DUCKWORTH fessor of
 2nd Impression, 1934 Psychology,
 (first published, 1933) University Coll.
 LONDON
- XI The Energies of Man; A by Wm. McDougall,
 Study of the Fundamentals F.R.S.
 of Dynamic Psychology
 LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD.
 3th Edition, 1939
 (first published 1932)
- XII Behaviorism by John B. Watson
 LONDON: KEGAN PAUL, formerly Prof.
 TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD. of Psychology
 1925 John Hopkins
 University
- XIII A History of Psychology in Article by J. B.
 Autobiography Watson
 Volume III
 Clark University Press
 WORCESTER, MASS., U.S.A.
 1936
- XIV The Foundations of Experi- Chapter, 'The
 mental Psychology Individual in
 Clark University Press Infancy' by
 WORCESTER, MASS., U.S.A. Arnold Gesell,
 2nd Printing, Nov. 1930 Yale Univ.
- XV Psycho-Analysis and Social by Wm. McDougall,
 Psychology M.B., F.R.S.
 LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD. Professor of
 1936 Psychology in
 Duke University

CHAPTER V

DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY

The older 'academic' psychologists, who used chiefly the method of observation of immediate experience (attending to the workings of their own minds), found it necessary to acknowledge the existence of elements that lay beyond their powers of introspection; and sometimes they spoke of psychological 'dispositions' and 'tendencies' and 'unconscious factors'. 'We cannot proceed', Professor Stout writes, 'without constantly recognising the existence of unconscious factors' (I: p. 20). These 'factors', which are also called 'mental dispositions', are regarded as 'connected with consciousness in a way comparable to the way in which mass and energy are connected with motion'. (The use of the word 'energy' in illustration of these 'unconscious factors' is interesting). The 'unconscious factors' may exist as an 'actual mode of consciousness' (a perception), and when they cease to do so, they continue to exist 'as a persistent condition of possible consciousness, or as a persistent possibility of consciousness which may come into operation to determine the actual course of my experience whenever a suitable occasion arises (I: p. 21).

These 'unconscious factors' or 'mental dispositions'

tions' are not the 'unconscious' of Freudian psychology ('Psycho-Analysis'); Dr Freud tells us that 'unconscious' is no longer a term for that which is 'temporarily latent' (II: p. 178). These 'unconscious factors' rather belong to what was called by the Psycho-Analysts the 'pre-conscious', a term which was employed to signify all that 'mind-stuff' of which a person is not aware at the moment, but which it is possible for him to call to consciousness more or less readily.

This inclusive term 'mind-stuff', however, does not take into account the distinction between

(a) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS, on the one hand,

a n d

(b) EXPERIENCE, on the other --

a distinction which is carefully made in the writings of Professor McDougall. The word 'structure' is used in defining or describing (a) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS, and certainly some word is required beyond the bare term 'disposition', for 'disposition' may stand for many different meanings in Psychology and Biology. Even in one book ('An Outline of Psychology') we find Professor McDougall himself defining an Instinct as an innate 'disposition' (IX: p. 110), and then, two or three hundred pages later, using the word 'disposition' in quite another sense (a) (IX: p. 351)

(a) Since writing this, I have found that Professor McDougall acknowledges his use of the word with two 'very different' significations.

p. 351). But the word 'structure' seems, to many, an unfortunate word with which to explain these dispositions that are contrasted with EXPERIENCE; a 'structure' seems to suggest buildings or machinery, and any word that implies mechanism or space seems undesirable; 'arrangement' (contrasted with FUNCTION or ACTIVITY) is not satisfactory, either. But, as a first step in defining such words as 'instinct' and 'sentiment', the distinction seems necessary, and in the following two columns there are set out (A) a note of some of the so-called 'structures' and (B) the corresponding 'functions' or 'activities':

(A) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS ('STRUCTURES', 'ARRANGEMENTS')	(B) MENTAL FUNCTIONING ('ACTIVITIES', 'OPERATIONS')
Instinct	... Instinctive activity
Cognitive disposition (that enables us to think of the object)	... Thinking of the object
Sentiment (e.g., Love) (the organized system that endures)	... Emotional experience
A Belief (developed through reasoning)	... The feeling that belief brings to us

The purposive functioning (instinctive activity) is seen in relation to the INSTINCT; the emotional experience in relation to the SENTIMENT. It is important that the relationship should be made clear now, as DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY is to be considered, and

'rational

'rational CONCEPTS' (proposed in order to explain facts of EXPERIENCE) will be mentioned as if they were actual 'STRUCTURES' ('rooms', e.g., is a term freely used by Dr Freud himself, though there is an apology from him for employing a 'crude' 'spatial' conception). The distinction, therefore, between (A) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS and (B) MENTAL FUNCTIONING is generally helpful. It is also an aid in understanding the conception of 'SENTIMENT', which Mr A. F. Shand has propounded in connection with EMOTION. This concept Professor Stout has adopted:

'The specific organisation of our sentiments
-- affection for our friends, the home-
sentiment, and every sentiment that we
can use the term "LOVE" to express, as
Love of Knowledge, Art, Goodness,
Love of Comfort,
and all our interests, as
Interest in our Health, Fortune and Profession,
Interest in Books, Collections, Self-Interest

..... --

THESE ARE THE RELATIVELY STABLE CENTRES TO
WHICH (EMOTIONS) ATTACH THEMSELVES' (I: pp.594-5)

Mr Shand refers to the sentiments (enduring dispositions) as 'complex wholes which contain in their possible life-history the entire gamut of the emotions' (I: p. 595); Professor Stout speaks of them as 'ideal systems'; but they are only 'rational constructs'.

The 'older academic' psychologists, then, attending to the workings of their own minds, experience instinctive ACTIVITY, and infer the existence of a 'disposition' that endures; this 'disposition' they call an 'INSTINCT'. The Psycho-Analysts, in

themselves

themselves, or in their patients, discover dreams, etc., and infer the existence of 'the efficacious unconscious'. But the 'unconscious factors' or 'mental dispositions' (of which Professor Stout wrote in his 'Manual of Psychology' in 1898), although they were compared with 'mass and energy', are quite different from Dr Freud's UNCONSCIOUS DYNAMIC PROCESSES, which, though intense and effective, 'cannot be brought into conscious experience by any effort of the will or act of memory'.

To use a metaphor and speak in terms of naval operations, the 'older academic psychologists' took no serious view of the submarine, once it had submerged; there is no suggestion, in their writings, that the submarine might discharge a torpedo that could trouble -- or even shatter -- the ship. A periscope might at times appear, but it went unnoticed, for it was not known to indicate the presence of a hidden mass, dynamic, possibly dangerous.

: :

But a new day had been dawning, in which the practitioner in medicine, and even the surgeon, would enter the psychological field, where their influence would be epoch-making. In 1926, Professor McDougall prefaced one of his books with a quotation from Professor Eugene Bleuler:

'At this time one of the most important,

if

'if not the most important, of all paths to a knowledge of the human soul is by way of psychopathology',

adding: 'This dictum of a great psychiatrist seems to me indisputable'(IX: p. vii).

As early as the beginning of the 19th century, the first glow of the dawn of the new day had appeared, though many, including leading psychologists, did not notice it until the first quarter of the 20th.

: :

Mesmer died in 1815. He had enjoyed popularity as a healer with a new method; had been frowned on by the medical profession; and had finally been denounced as an impostor. However, it had been noticed that there was an enhanced suggestibility during a special sleep-like (or 'hypnotic') state, and the subject was considered of such importance

by some leading men that Professor
MESMERISM Elliotson resigned his chair when the Council of University College, London, forbade the practice of Mesmerism in University College Hospital.

From 1845, one James Esdaile exploited the anaesthetic use of the new art in major operations, and a contemporary of his, James Braid, though hostile to the Mesmerists, did much to help to
reconcile

reconcile medical and scientific opinion to the genuineness of certain facts of hypnotism. James Braid died in 1860, but his discoveries were taken up by psychiatrists and neurologists of other countries (III: pp. 67-107).

In France, in the year 1881, PIERRE JANET, a young man -- only twenty-two years of age -- became a Professor of Philosophy at Havre; he tells us that at the age of eighteen he was very religious, that he always retained mystical tendencies (which he had succeeded in controlling), and that PIERRE JANET he studied 'hypnotism from a distance' (IV: p. 123), by which he seems to mean that he could hypnotise persons who were not present with him in the room; in this he succeeded, in a majority of cases, before a British delegation, which had come to France to investigate matters for themselves.

A year or two after Janet's appointment, the French Government created for Charcot a Chair of Neuropathology at the Faculty of Medicine, which CHARCOT gave him a clinic with auxiliary scientific departments; he had to deliver but one lecture each week, and so was able to prepare it carefully. He achieved world-wide fame by his investigations. He found that the cause of many cases of paralysis was to be looked for in certain diseases

of the brain and the spine, but after much further enquiry he dedicated himself to the study of hysterical phenomena. At that time, hysterical patients were often looked upon as impostors. (X: p. 3).

Charcot discovered numerous peculiarities of hypnosis and of the method of its induction; and he found, in cases of hysterical paralysis, that he could arbitrarily bring about paralysis when the patient was

PARALYSIS
AND
HYPNOSIS

in a hypnotic condition. Other investigators thought that, if it were possible to bring about such symptoms during hypnotic sleep, it might be possible to remove them when the patient was in the same condition. (This hypothesis proved to be true). And, further, if suggestion by the hypnotist could cause paralysis, might paralysis not be caused also by a similar suggestion arising in the patient himself? (X: pp. 4-5). This hypothesis involved a curious implication, viz., SUGGESTIONS MIGHT BE PRESENT IN THE PATIENT'S MIND WITHOUT HIS BEING AWARE OF THEM IN ANY WAY.

Janet tells us that he noticed and 'proved in particular the very curious and historical relationship between the teachings of Charcot (at Salpêtrière) and Bernheim (at Nancy), and those of the hypnotists'; but that Charcot and Bernheim 'pretended to ignore

and

and scorn' the hypnotists -- who, nevertheless, influenced them (IV: p. 127). (Hypnotic practices were still, at that time, despised as the methods of spiritualists and quacks).

It is interesting to find Janet writing: 'The most useful psychology of the future will be a practical psychology of conduct, which will, at the same time, be dynamic, and will study the physiological production of energy and its distribution'; and: 'Instead of trying to introduce quantity in psychology by the hypothetical constructions of psychophysics, one must introduce quantity by the appreciation of the energy of the subject and its variations'. He mentions, again, that modifications of psychical energy 'determine great changes in character, and play an important part in most psychical disorders' (IV: p. 133). The first signs of a dynamic psychology, as well as of a psychology that took into account 'UNCONSCIOUS EFFECTIVE PROCESSES', were then clearly evident.

In 1889 and 1890, laboratories for experimental psychology were established respectively at the Sorbonne and at Rennes, with Ribot occupying a Chair of Experimental and Comparative Psychology at the College de France (III: p. 216).

Ribot wrote constantly on psycho-pathological topics.

topics. In 1886, Alfred Binet's first book had appeared; it was based largely on the results of hypnotic experiments.

: :

Among the pupils of Charcot had been Sigmund Freud. Commencing in 1902, a number of young medical men gathered round Dr Freud, in order to acquire a knowledge of PSYCHO-ANALYSIS (a), which was the name given to the system of psychology that had been developed by him.

In the Spring of 1908, at Salzburg, the first Psycho-Analytical Congress was held. One result of this congress was the founding of a periodical published by Bleuler and Freud, and edited by C. G. Jung. The concepts of Psycho-Analysis were going forth to the world. The meaning of the word 'unconscious' was undergoing a change; it was no longer a term to signify that which is 'temporarily latent'.

: :

There was conclusive evidence, it was believed,
(1) FOR THE EXISTENCE OF EXPERIENCE SHUT OFF FROM
CONSCIOUSNESS UNDER ORDINARY CONDITIONS.

As Dr Jung has written since: Our consciousness does not express the sum total of our human nature; it is and remains only a part... It has forgotten infinitely more than it knows. It has heard and seen an infinite amount of which it has

never

(a) Or 'depth psychology'

never become conscious. There are thoughts that develop beyond its consciousness; they are ready and complete, and it knows nothing of them' (VIII: p. 93).

: :

(11) THAT THIS EXPERIENCE, THOUGH IT WAS NOT ACCESSIBLE TO CONSCIOUSNESS DIRECTLY, WAS YET CAPABLE OF AFFECTING IT INDIRECTLY.

Dr Freud said (as has already been mentioned -- page 66) that the most convenient conception was a spatial one, though he admitted it to be crude. He

'UNCONSCIOUS SYSTEM' (FREUD) compared the 'unconscious' ^(a) system to a 'large ante-room'; in this room the 'various mental excitations are crowding upon one another, like individual beings' (II: p. 249) -- or, some might be tempted to say, after reading further descriptions of these 'excitations', like wild beasts packed in a cage. They have all, at one time, according to Dr Freud, been part of the individual's own experience; this experience 'includes the ante-natal life, which is responsible for the first storing of the unconscious' (V: pp. 155-166).

But how has this 'UNCONSCIOUS' been created? How is it that this 'experience' (ante-natal and otherwise) has passed out of consciousness, has

become

(a) Dr Freud's earlier terms; later terms, page 78.

become lost beyond recall?

Dr Freud says that among the 'indestructible' wish-feelings 'originating from the infantile life, there are ... some the fulfilment of which have entered into a relation of contradiction to the end-presentation of the secondary thinking'. The fulfilment of these wishes would no longer produce an affect of pleasure, but one of pain. 'And it is just this TRANSFORMATION OF AFFECT that constitutes the nature of what we designate as "REPRESSION", in which we recognise the infantile first step of passing adverse sentence, or of rejecting through reason' (XI: p. 479).

The question may also be answered in the words of the late Dr W. H. R. Rivers: 'Elements of experience and modes of behaviour, which are incompatible with later developments, are ^(a) suppressed' (XII: p. 33). So that the 'UNCONSCIOUS' is a 'storehouse of instinctive reactions and tendencies, together with the experience associated with them, when they are out of harmony with the prevailing constituents of consciousness' (XII: p. 33).

Or,

(a) The word 'SUPPRESSION' is used by Dr Rivers where other writers would employ the word 'REPRESSION', i.e., for the UNCONSCIOUS process by which perceptions and ideas are forced into the unconscious system. 'SUPPRESSION' -- in the writings of Freud and his followers -- is generally a CONSCIOUS act of inhibition. (XI: p. 481). But REPRESSION is accomplished without the cognizance of the 'Ego'.

Or, again, the question may be answered (as in a paper read at the Tenth International Congress of Psychology at Copenhagen in August, 1932): 'In the evolution of more complex living forms, lower-level, congenitally unconscious, mental activities have arisen by differentiation from what originally constituted activities of the conscious primitive self' (XIII: p. 347).

Dr Freud himself has stated that it is 'only' wish-feelings -- 'SEXUAL WISH-FEELINGS' -- from the infantile life that experience repression during the developmental period of childhood (XI: p. 480). He writes: 'The daughter sees in her mother the authority which imposes limits to her will, whose task it is to bring her to that renunciation of sexual freedom which society demands ... To the son, the father is the embodiment of the social compulsion to which he so unwillingly submits' (II: pp. 173-174).

and, again, referring not only to children :

'Every time we should be led by analysis to the sexual experiences and desires of the patient, and every time we should have to affirm that the symptom served the same purpose. This purpose shows itself to be the gratification of sexual wishes; the symptoms serve the purpose of sexual gratification for the patient; they are a substitute for satisfactions which he does not obtain in reality' (II: p. 251).

So far, there has been exposition of the theory of Dr Freud without criticism. But it is time to point out⁽¹⁾ that the phrase 'stored up in the unconscious'

unconscious' has been called a 'silly metaphor' (XIV: p. 358), and the question is naturally asked, WHAT EXACTLY is so 'stored up?' Not the experiences themselves, but, at most, the traces of the experiences; 'and there is no ground for supposing that

CRITICISM OF 'THE
STOREHOUSE OF THE
UNCONSCIOUS'

the traces themselves are of
the nature of experiences', Dr

Broad notes, and adds: 'The plain fact is that we know nothing with certainty about the intrinsic nature of traces' (XIV: p. 359).

(11) On page 65, a distinction is discussed: on the one hand there are (A) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS, and on the other (B) MENTAL FUNCTIONING. An experience belongs to the latter class; but its trace is 'indestructible', and is transferred to the 'large ante-room' of the 'UNCONSCIOUS', where it apparently becomes part of the 'ENDURING DISPOSITIONS'. Unfortunately, Dr Freud has not prepared the two lists -- (A) and (B); and therefore he has not informed us that, while (B) -- MENTAL FUNCTIONING, ACTIVITIES, &c., with FEELINGS -- are known to us, are part of our EXPERIENCE, (A) -- ENDURING DISPOSITIONS, with TRACES OF EXPERIENCE -- are (again in the words of Dr Broad) 'purely hypothetical and are known only by their effects' (XIV: p. 358).

Professor Hollingworth has drawn up a list of such 'concepts', which are 'not the names of

phenomenal

phenomenal observations'; they are 'rational constructs'; it is conjectured that they are productive of the phenomenal facts (activities; feelings; &c.). So long as it is remembered that they are only fictions or explanatory concepts, and nothing more, there cannot be objection taken to them; but when they -- (A) -- are classed together with experience --(B)-- under the term 'mind-stuff', confusion arises. Further, Professor Hollingworth points out that 'fictions so readily become hypotheses'. The list of these CONCEPTS is appended:

- 'The concept of the efficacious unconscious;
- The doctrine of conflict of trends and motives;
- The concept of the dynamic trend, libido, energy, hormone;
- The phenomenon of suppression or repression, and the more passive notion of dissociation;
- The concept of affective and emotional growth, fixation, and regression or infantilism;
- The 'mechanisms' of transfer, compensation, conversion, introjection, sublimation, siphoning, attachment, and the continuity of emotion;
- The concepts of affective symbolism, in the individual and the race, as manifested in daily life, in art, in dreams, in literature, and in neurotic symptoms;
- The exploratory and therapeutic technique of psychoanalysis'

(XV: p. 60).

These are NOT facts of EXPERIENCE; they are imposed on us in order to account for the facts. As

Professor

Professor McDougall has mentioned, however (XVI: p. 57) 'under the one term, "THE UNCONSCIOUS", certain parts of the total mental structure were confounded with certain modes of mental functioning or activity.'
'"The Unconscious" used to comprise'

(A) 'all those parts of the structure of the mind which were debarred by repression from expressing themselves in consciousness'

and (B) 'all unconscious activities'.

The words 'used to comprise' have been quoted exactly; and they are notable; for, while the term "Unconscious" was formerly used to cover'

(A) 'a term descriptive of certain ill-defined parts of the total mental structure'

and (B) 'a term descriptive of certain mental activities'

Dr Freud now says (in his 'New Lectures'): 'We will no longer use the word "Unconscious" in the sense of a system, and to what we have hitherto called by that name we will give a better one ... the "ID".'

'Is, then, the ID simply the sum of the instincts?' Professor McDougall asks (XVI: p. 59). He answers: 'On some pages it would seem so: for the ID is unconscious, it is "a cauldron of seething excitement" and is the great reservoir of LIBIDO, and in it "the pleasure-principle exerts undisputed sway" ... But the doctrine of the ID ... is still a great tangle'.

Having quoted Professor McDougall in regard to

the

the concept of the 'Unconscious', as explained by Dr Freud, and having shown that Professor McDougall considers that the term 'covers a mass of gross confusion', it is only right to add that he holds Dr Freud's system 'to be the most deserving of honest criticism,' and 'to have the essential foundations of truth' (XVI: p. vi).

: :

A further criticism of Dr Freud's theory concerns his conception of the SEX-INSTINCT. He has been quoted as writing: 'Every time we should be led by analysis to the sexual experiences and desires of the patient'. The first impulse of a critic, who has seen much of functional cases, is to say: 'That statement is not true', and to proceed to contradict Dr Freud's assertion by quoting case after case in which not sex but fear has been found at the root of the trouble.

DR FREUD AND
THE SEX
INSTINCT

But does Dr Freud recognise an instinct which determines the individual to experience the emotion of fear? It would appear not; FEAR is an expression of LIBIDO, and LIBIDO is sexual desire or energy.

(Certainly, in his 'New Lectures' he says in this connection: 'Here everything is in a state of flux

flux and change'; but, again to quote Professor McDougall, Dr Freud 'still does not recognise fear as rooted in an "INNATE, INDEPENDENT, INSTINCTUAL DISPOSITION in man" (XVI: p. 71).

With the aid of the term 'LIBIDO',^(a) a large part of human behaviour has been classed by Dr Freud as 'SEXUAL'; viz.,

(1) Those activities accepted as sexual by Dr Flügel also; these comprise, among others,

courtship and romantic love,
perversions, etc.,
and behaviour directly determined by
family relationships;

(11) Activities not accepted as sexual by Dr Flügel (and, of course, not accepted by a host of other psychologists who are not strict Psycho-Analysts); these include

'all behaviour that can be called social;
all tender protective altruistic behaviour;
all self-assertive, aggressive, angry, or
cruel behaviour ...'
all submission, obedience, imitation, and
behaviour that is the result of suggestion;
all exploration and behaviour prompted by
curiosity;
all expressions of fear and of disgust.

(XVI: pp. 63-64)

Professor McDougall finds Dr Freud's mode of thinking of instinct 'quite shocking'; further, he believes that 'at least ninety-nine biologists in a hundred' would feel much as he himself does about it. 'Freud'

(he says)

(a) LIBIDO (for Dr Freud) is sexual desire or energy. Dr Jung uses the term LIBIDO to denote psychic energy irrespective of the object upon which it acts (XVII).

(he says) 'without having made any serious effort to determine what are the instinctive endowments of the human species ... flies off ... in highly speculative discussions' (XVI: p. 66).

In the circumstances, although Dr Freud has held such a pre-eminent place among Dynamic Psychologists, although he has had such a great influence in shaping the opinions of those who to-day adopt the Hormic Theory in Psychology, and although he wrote, years ago: 'No knowledge would have been so important for the establishment of a sound psychology as some approximate understanding of the common nature and possible differences of the instincts', IT WILL BE NECESSARY, when an attempt is being made to define the term INSTINCT, TO IGNORE THE VIEWS OF DR FREUD, in regard to the meaning of the word. Otherwise there will be 'Confusion worse confounded!'.(a)

: :

When Dr C. G. Jung developed his own theory of 'Analytical Psychology', he departed from the Freudian conception in some respects.(b)

As to the material in the 'UNCONSCIOUS' --

the

(a) John Milton: 'Paradise Lost', Book II, Line 921:
"With ruin upon ruin, rout on rout,
Confusion worse confounded".

(b) 'Analytical Psychology' is the term used to distinguish the psychology (and methods) of Dr Jung from those of the 'Psycho-Analysts', who follow Dr Freud.

the 'store-house' -- Dr Jung held that part of it was hereditary, and that it belonged to the human race rather than to the individual's own personal experience, although he agreed with Dr Freud in regard to some of it; in other words, he considered that the racial content was supplemented by repression. He found it necessary to include racial transmission, in order to account for 'symbols, folk-lore and myth-making tendencies', which are seen throughout the human race, and also in order to account for some religious tendencies.

ANALYTICAL
PSYCHOLOGY
OF DR JUNG

He describes the activities of the 'Unconscious':-- 'If facts do not deceive us, the unconscious processes are far from being unintelligent. The character of automatism and mechanism is lacking to them, even in a striking degree. They are not in the least inferior to the conscious process in subtlety; on the contrary, they often far surpass the conscious judgment' (VIII: p. 95).

Dr Jung speaks not only of 'unconscious processes', but of 'the unconscious portion of the mind' (VIII: p. 100), of 'the unconscious psyche' (XVIII: pp. 214, 216), and, over and over again, of 'the unconscious', describing it as 'a natural organ with an energy specific to itself', and defining it as 'the totality of all psychic phenomena that lack the quality

quality of consciousness' (VIII: p. 275).

This term, 'THE UNCONSCIOUS', which has already been found in both the writings of Dr Freud and of Dr Rivers, and which is now found also in the writings of Dr Jung, has been the subject of much criticism. Dr Broad repudiates the term by referring to 'unconscious states'; Professor Hollingworth passes summary judgment, writing "THE UNCONSCIOUS"(NOUN!)'; and Professor McDougall (while recognising that knowledge of unconscious (or subconscious) activities is of the first importance) says that 'THE UNCONSCIOUS is a fraudulent entity that has gravely obstructed the path of progress' (XVI: p. 19), adding: 'And much the same may be said of all the array of other quasi-personal entities, the CENSOR, the LIBIDO, the EGO, the EGO-IDEAL, the ID, etc., etc., with which Freud, indulging an unfortunate tendency of popular thinking, has cumbered the earth'. (When it is remembered that these are all 'concepts', or 'fictions', NOT 'names of phenomenal observations' or 'experiences' -- i.e., they must be classed as (A) DISPOSITIONS, and dispositions whose existence is merely conjectured, and NOT as (B) MENTAL FUNCTIONING or ACTIVITY -- then it is seen that criticism seems to be justified.

: :

But when all this has been said, the two

statements

statements, with which the consideration of Psycho-Analysis and Analytical Psychology began, can be repeated with but slight modification; only the insertion of two words ('traces of') seems to be necessary. The position may be re-stated thus:

There was conclusive evidence, it was believed,

(1) FOR THE EXISTENCE OF TRACES OF EXPERIENCE
SHUT OFF FROM CONSCIOUSNESS UNDER ORDINARY
CONDITIONS; a n d

(11) THAT THESE TRACES OF EXPERIENCE, THOUGH
THEY WERE NOT ACCESSIBLE TO CONSCIOUSNESS
DIRECTLY, WERE YET CAPABLE OF AFFECTING
IT INDIRECTLY.

What is the relation, then, of these 'traces of experience' to consciousness?

Dr Freud's earlier theories (in spatial terms, although he is speaking of experience as well as of dispositions, of mental functioning as well as of 'structure') mention, next to the UNCONSCIOUS STOREHOUSE, a SECOND, SMALLER APARTMENT -- a sort of reception-room. 'In this smaller chamber consciousness resides. On the threshold between the two rooms stands a door-keeper, who denies admittance to the

THE CENSOR reception room to those 'mental excitations' of which he does not approve.

It makes little difference whether this door-keeper (or 'censor') turns any one impulse back at the threshold, or drives it out again once it has entered the reception-room; 'that is merely a matter of the

degree

degree of his vigilance and promptness in recognition' (II: p. 249-250).^(a)

(Of course, these constructions -- the CENSOR, the RECEPTION-ROOM, &c. -- are simply assumptions, conceived -- like the LIBIDO, the UNCONSCIOUS, and the ID -- to explain certain facts of mental experience; but Dr Freud said that they 'must indicate an extensive approximation to the actual and reality' -- II: p. 250).

Dr Jung discounts the CENSOR or DOOR-KEEPER, but says that there is an automatic resistance to the emergence into consciousness of certain ideas. (In 1933 Dr Jung wrote: 'For the purposes of psychology, I think it best to abandon the notion that we are to-day in anything like a position to make statements about the nature of the psyche that are "true" or "correct"'-- XVIII: p. 133).

: :

Dr Freud, in his earlier exposition (as has been mentioned -- page 73) told of an 'UNCONSCIOUS', in which materials were stored; these materials were traces of experience; they did not conform to ethical and social ideals, and so were antagonistic to the more civilized life of the 'RECEPTION ROOM' where consciousness lived and where the forces of morality and social restraint had their abode.

Dr Jung, on the other hand, maintained that the 'UNCONSCIOUS' was the store-room of not only the
primitive

primitive, but also of the sublime (i.e., not only of the sensual, but of the compulsions of morality and social restraint).

Here are two contradictory views; and the Educationist may well ask: Which of these two is to be applied to the Theory of Religious Education?

DR FREUD'S: THAT THE 'UNCONSCIOUS' IS PACKED WITH 'EXCITATIONS', which have all, at one time, been part of the individual's experience, and which are antagonistic to morality and consciousness; O R

DR JUNG'S: THAT THE 'UNCONSCIOUS' IS THE ABODE OF (inter alia) THE SUBLIME (i.e., of the very forces that make for morality)?

It has been a problem; but it has now been solved. Dr Freud has (as already noted -- page 78) introduced the 'ID', which corresponds, in some considerable

DR FREUD'S 'ID'
'EGO' AND
'SUPER-EGO'

measure, to the Instincts (as defined later -- Chapter VII).

The concept of the UNCONSCIOUS (as a system) has gone; the air is clear again; for out of the 'ID' (a) comes the 'EGO', which, 'when properly developed, modifies the crude workings of the instincts' (XIX: p. 36), and which stands for reason and circumspection; and, out of the inner conflicts of the 'ID' (for the instinctive tendencies are not by any means a harmonious group) arises the

'SUPER-EGO'

(a) 'The Ego is after all only part of the ID' -- Dr Freud, 'New Lectures'.

'SUPER-EGO',^(a) which, though in part innate, is mostly a development in the individual through fear reaction (XIX: p. 36), and which is a 'function in the EGO'.

((a) 'Super-ego, ego, and ID, then, are the three realms, regions, or provinces, into which we divide the mental apparatus of the individual' -- Dr Freud, New Lectures)

This is a 'most startling' reform, a 'revolution within the palace ... made by the king himself'. Dr Jung and Professor McDougall are jubilant. They are converting the old master. He is turning to their paths -- one step at a time, perhaps, but surely. 'Again I shout -- HURRAH! For this is progress!' Professor McDougall said in a lecture in the University of London (1935).

The educationist is able to proceed. The DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGISTS have come to agree on several matters, which provide for him a foundation on which to build. But before noting points for a basis for the Theory of Religious Education, there is a third name which is usually associated with those of Dr Freud and Dr Jung -- that of the late Dr Adler. His

DR ALFRED ADLER 'much-despised INDIVIDUAL PSYCHO- AND INDIVIDUAL PSYCHOLOGY' is popular, and has been found useful; the very headings of the chapters of 'The Pattern of Life' show^{that} a practical application of his theories (or, to speak strictly, theory) is expected; these headings include 'Maternal Domination',

'The

'The Road to Crime', 'The Boy Who Wants to Lead',
'The Rebellious "Bad" Boy', and 'Follow the Leader'.^(a)

Although Professor McDougall, in speaking of Dr Adler's INDIVIDUAL PSYCHOLOGY, mentions 'its lack of any vestige of scientific quality' and its 'total disregard for logic, truth, consistency, and coherence', he has to admit that it is popular, and that it has 'probably a larger following among the general public than all forms of academic psychology together' (XVI: p. 15).

For the 'LIBIDO' of Dr Freud, Dr Adler has substituted the 'WILL TO POWER'. He says that Nietzsche's^(a) 'WILL TO POWER' and 'WILL TO SEEM' embrace many of his views (VII: p. ix); he speaks of an individual 'struggling for recognition' and 'actually attempting 'THE WILL TO POWER' to force it', 'aspiring ceaselessly to a god-like domination over his environment;' he mentions the 'old main object of triumphing and gaining prestige at any cost', and (referring to two children) points out that 'their ambition and vanity are signs of their craving for power and superiority' (VII: pp. 33, 347, 79).

When

(a)(Friedrich Nietzsche, 1844-1900, 'passionately pleaded for strength, will, impulse ...; heatedly attacked pity and humanitarianism...'; and praised struggle and - ultimately - war (XXI: 'Nietzsche')).

When this 'WILL TO POWER' is thwarted (as it may be in various ways, e.g.,

by 'any disfigurement or ugliness',

by 'external signs of degeneration', or

by 'externally visible indications of a more deeply rooted organ-inferiority')

then there is 'compensatory activity'. The 'objective symptoms' have evoked a 'feeling of inferiority and uncertainty in the child's psyche', and there follows the 'creation of a compensatory psychic

'INFERIORITY
COMPLEX'

superstructure' which is seeking to

regain a 'point of vantage', 'superiority in life'. In other words, the thwarting of the 'WILL TO POWER' results in the development of an 'INFERIORITY COMPLEX'.

(INFERIORITY FEELING is defined as 'a dominant affective attitude due to the inadequacy of some organ ... and leading to neurotic behaviour in varying degrees, according to environmental complications (e.g. upbringing, social relations, etc.) and insufficient compensation' (XXII)

COMPLEX: 'The best usage, I think, restricts the term "complex" to acquired conative settings which are in some degree morbid by reason of their lack of harmony with the rest of the character' -- Professor McDougall (XXIII: p. 418)).

(The use of the term 'inferiority complex' as synonymous with Professor McDougall's Instinct of Self-abasement -- with a corresponding feeling of Subjection -- is common in journalism, and even in the writings of highly-educated and widely-read men (a), but such use is not in keeping with the INDIVIDUAL PSYCHOLOGY of Dr Adler).

From

(a) e.g., Sir John Adams seems to have used the term with such a signification (XXIV: p. 382)

From his efforts to adjust himself, the 'life-goal' of the individual develops.

(GOAL, defined as 'an object or condition towards which an organism strives, referred by the organism to the immediate or remote future but acting in the present time' (XXII)

'The organism is a dynamic whole, moving through a definite life pattern toward a definite goal' (XX: p. 11), and using a characteristic technique for 'combating the environment' and attaining the goal. 'Patterns of life are usually fixed by the time a child is five or six years old.' A normal child would be one whose 'goal in life was to be a complete human being, compensating for his personal weaknesses ... by some socially valuable, productive work' (XX: p. 26).

On the other hand, there is a boy of whom Dr Adler says:

'This child's goal is fixed, and it is his pattern to avoid all situations in which he is not especially favoured. His greatest difficulty is remaining in a situation which he does not dominate' (XX: 115).

In regard to the same boy, Dr Adler says later:

'I am in great favour of camps for children, but I must say that you cannot expect a camp to change a child's life pattern if it is already well established' (XX: p. 119).

The Educationist may well say, 'Then what can we do if we do not have a chance to arrange his environment until he is, say, five years of age?' This is one

'Unconscious' (Dr Jung)

The 'WILL TO POWER' (Dr Adler) and
'WILL TO SEEM'

The 'LIFE-GOAL' (Dr Adler)

(The CONCEPTS included in this section
-- (iii) -- are not experiences, but
FICTIONS, RATIONAL STRUCTURES, CON-
JECTURES, proposed in order to account
for the facts)

- (iv) There is evidence of increased suggest-
ibility when the individual is in a
special sleep-like ('hypnotic') state;
- (v) There is evidence of activity which is
apparently the result of suggestions
that arise within the individual himself
without the individual being aware of
their source;
- (vi) There is evidence of FEAR having played
an important part in the development of
dispositions (Dr Freud -- and all other
psychologists).

: :

When this evidence has been further
envisaged, and when these
theories and concepts have been duly considered, it
will be necessary to decide how the methods of the
educationists may be employed in order to help to
educate the child -- and adult -- religiously; i.e.,

HOW THE ENVIRONMENT MAY BE MANIPULATED

so that the individual may find

That practical relationship with God, as
revealed by Jesus Christ,
which enables the believer to overcome even
death itself,
That fellowship with Him which gives happiness
and peace,
That satisfying view of existence as a whole,
That spiritual valuation of human life,

That

That moral ideal that towers above custom and convention,

which have been seen to be of the essence of Religion.

But, first of all, some of the theories already mentioned require detailed consideration, particularly the HORMIC THEORY, before their application to the Theory of Religious Education.

The word HORME has already been mentioned, in listing the concepts of DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY; it is of the essence of the present enquiry, and concerns the subject of Religious Education in two respects, viz.,

- (1) it throws further light on the
innate endowment of the child;

and

- (11) it furnishes some knowledge of
certain elements in human nature,
the development of which may
further the purposes of the
educationist.

The meaning of the HORMIC THEORY is the question which the next chapter attempts to answer.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- I A Manual of Psychology by G. F. Stout, M.A.,
LONDON: W. B. CLIVE LL.D.
8th Impression (Third
Edition) 1919
(3rd Edition prepared
in July, 1913)
- II Introductory Lectures on by Sigmund Freud,
Psycho-Analysis LL.D.
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & Vienna
UNWIN LTD.: Authorised
Translation by Joan
Riviere
1922
- III A Hundred Years of Psycho-logy 1833-1933 by J. C. Flügel
LONDON: DUCKWORTH Assistant Prof.
2nd Impression, 1934 of Psychology,
(first published, 1933) University Coll.
London
- IV A History of Psychology) edited by Carl
in Autobiography,) Murchison
Volume I
WORCESTER, MASS., U.S.A.
Clark University Press
1930
- V The New Psychology and the Teacher by H. Crichton Miller,
LONDON: JARROLD'S Publish- M.A., M.D., Hon.
ers (London) Ltd. Director Tavistock
4th Impressn. 1923 Clinic for Func-
tional Nerve Cases
- VI Psychological Types, Or by C. G. Jung
The Psychology of
Individuation
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL, TRENCH
TRUBNER & CO. LTD.
1926
- VII The Practice and Theory by the late Alfred
of Individual Psycho- Adler (Vienna)
logy
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL, TRENCH
TRUBNER & CO. LTD.
1924

VIII: 'Contributions

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS... (continued)

- VIII 'Contributions to Analytical .. by C. G. Jung
Psychology'
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
1928
- IX 'An Outline of Psychology' .. by Wm. McDougall,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD. F.R.S.
2nd Edition, 1924
(first published, 1923)
- X 'Character and the Uncon- .. by J.H. van der
scious' Hoop
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
1923
- XI 'The Interpretation of .. by Sigmund Freud,
Dreams' LL.D.
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN &
UNWIN LTD.
Revised Edition 1922
(first published 1913)
- XII 'Instinct and the Uncon- .. by W.H.R. Rivers
scious' M.D., D.Sc.,
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY LL.D., F.R.S.
PRESS
1920
- XIII 'The British Journal of .. Article by Chas.
Psychology', General S.Myers: 'The Rel-
Section. ation of Acts &
April, 1933. Contents of Con-
sciousness'
- XIV 'The Mind and its Place .. by C. D. Broad,
in Nature' M.A., Litt.D.
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
1925
- XV 'Abnormal Psychology: its .. by H.L. Holling-
Concepts & Theories' worth, Ph.D.,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD. Prof. of Psycho-
1931 logy, Barnard
Coll., Columbia
University

XVI: 'Psycho-Analysis

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS ... (continued)

- XVI: 'Psycho-Analysis and Social Psychology' by Wm. McDougall,
M.B., F.R.S.
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
1936
- XVII:('Dictionary of Psychology' Edited by Howard
XXII:)(LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & C. Warren,
UNWIN LTD. Princeton
1935 University
- XVIII: 'Modern Man in Search of a Soul' by C. G. Jung
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
Fourth Impression, 1934
(first published, 1933)
- XIX: 'Psychology: the Changing Outlook' by F. Aveling, M.C.,
D.Lit., D.Sc.,
LONDON: WATTS & CO. Ph.D., Prof.
1937 of Psychology,
Univ. of London
- XX: 'The Pattern of Life' (by Alfred Adler
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL, (Edited by W. Beran
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD. Wolfe, M.D.
1931
- XXI: 'Harnsworth's Universal Encyclopædia' Edited by J. A.
Hammerton
LONDON: The Educational
Book Co. Ltd.
(not dated; commenced in
1915; published several
years later)
- XXII: 'Dictionary of Psychology' (same as XVII)
- XXIII: 'Outline of Psychology' (McDougall)(same as IX)
- XXIV: 'Everyman's Psychology' by Sir John Adams
LONDON: UNIVERSITY OF
LONDON PRESS, LTD.
1929

The HORMIC THEORY is defined in the above
Dictionary of Psychology as 'the view that organic
phenomena are determined by purposive factors

(e.g., habits, instincts, etc.)
The HORMIC THEORY is also the basis of organic
psychology (II).

Also, HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY CHAPTER VI
describes the 'so-called habits or purposive
psychology' as 'the view that organic
phenomena are determined by purposive factors

THE HORMIC THEORY
The HORMIC THEORY is the basis of organic
psychology (II).

...
...
... (II, p. 11)

But the word HORMIC does not appear in
either the HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY or the
HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY (II, p. 11).
The HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY is the basis of organic
psychology (II, p. 11).
The HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY is the basis of organic
psychology (II, p. 11).

The HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY is the basis of organic
psychology (II, p. 11).
The HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY is the basis of organic
psychology (II, p. 11).

CHAPTER VI.

THE HORMIC THEORY

The HORMIC THEORY is defined in the modern
 'Dictionary of Psychology as 'the view that organic
 phenomena are largely determined by purposive factors
 (e.g., native dispositions, tendencies,
 THE HORMIC THEORY urges), which transcend the realm of physics
 and chemistry' (I).

Also, HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY has been described. Professor
 Aveling mentions the 'so-called Hormic or purposive
 psychologies' in his book 'PSYCHOLOGY: THE CHANGING
 OUTLOOK', and refers to them as those that 'make
 HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY behaviour and conduct issue from the
 internal impulses, drives, and urges that
 are unloosed in the animal and man by
 appropriate stimulation coming from their surround-
 ings' (II: p. 61).

But the word 'HORMIC' does not yet appear in
 either the 'OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY' or the
 'SHORTER OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY' (1933), although
 both these dictionaries give another adjective,
 'HORMETIC', which was used in the seventeenth century
 in the sense of 'having the property of urging on or
 impelling'.

In 'WEBSTER'S NEW INTERNATIONAL DICTIONARY OF
 THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE' (1934 edition) are found

HORME (as used in Psychology) defined as
 'vital energy as an urge to
 purposive activity';

HORMIC (adjective)

'(a) pertaining to hormone; as the
hormic theory of behavior

'(b) striving; purposive; not
mechanical; as, hormic
activities of the organism';

HORMIST (noun)

'a believer in the basic purposive
character of behavior'

(III)

The word HORMIC is derived from the Greek

HORME (*ῥομή*) = a vital impulse, incitement, passion-
ate feeling, or urge to action. The corresponding

Greek verb is HORMAO (*ῥομαίνω*) = to set in motion,
urge, spur, or cheer on. In this

DERIVATION
OF HORMIC

particular case, the derivation gives
a fair indication of the meaning of the English word
as used in Psychology.

:::

In the last chapter, the development of a 'New'
(Dynamic) Psychology was followed, and it was seen
that attention was being concentrated on the facts
of

(i) Mental Activity, particularly that
activity of which the individual
is not aware;

(ii) Conflict, struggle, and adjustment;

(iii) Motives, drives, 'Will-to-power'.

The words 'dynamic', 'forces' and 'excitations' were
often used; Dr Freud was found speaking of these

'excitations'

'excitations' as 'pressing forward' and as 'crowding upon one another'. Then the picture was seen to include a 'downward push' (in Dr Freud's earlier writings, this push is from 'consciousness'; in his 'New Lectures' it is the 'EGO' which is striving to conform to the necessities of reality, and there is a 'special function within the EGO' -- the 'SUPER-EGO' to apply the 'most severe moral standards'). The inevitable 'impulse of reaction' follows the repression by the 'Super-Ego'. Dr Jung also conceives the 'unconscious' primarily as a source of psychic energy; and Dr Adler views human beings as 'moving, living, purpose-fulfilling entities, striving for significance and security' (VII: p. 10).

Professor Stout had seen the same process in 'consciousness'. He draws attention to 'such words as INTEREST, CRAVING, LONGING, YEARNING, ENDEAVOUR, DESIRE, PURPOSE, WISH and WILL,' under the heading of 'THE CONATIVE ATTITUDE', and points out that these words all imply 'an inherent tendency of conscious states to pass beyond themselves and become something

different, an inherent tendency
 PROFESSOR STOUT
 ON 'CONATION' which continues to operate ...
 until a certain end-state is reached' (VIII: p. 64).
 He goes on to ask whether CONATION, in 'some form or degree' is not 'invariably a constituent of

consciousness'

consciousness', and concludes that conation is probably present even in the slightest and most transient of mental activities. He goes further, and adds that it may be true that 'conscious process' always involves a tendency towards an end, AND THAT THE TENDENCY IS NOT ALWAYS CORRELATED WITH A MODE OF BEING CONSCIOUS' (VIII: pp. 73-74).

(It may be well here to define CONATION. Professor Stout writes that 'CONATION constitutes the active side of our conscious being.' 'It is the activity of the subject in relation to its object' (VIII: p. 69). In the modern Dictionary of Psychology these meanings are given :

- 'CONATION = 1. purposive activity in its inception; i.e., the active phase of volition, desire, aversion, conscious impulse;
2. the mental state accompanying an impulse, desire, or voluntary act, in which kinesthetic components predominate;
3. the conscious tendency to act')

: :

But Professor Stout is not alone in concluding that mental functioning involves purpose. Professor McDougall (writing in 1908, before he knew of the work of Drs Freud, Jung and Adler) sees a principle 'of supreme importance for the understanding of the mental life and conduct of men' -- the principle that 'THE ORIGINAL IMPULSE OR CONATION SUPPLIES THE MOTIVE POWER TO ALL THE ACTIVITIES'; the activities are 'BUT MEANS TO THE ATTAINMENT OF THE DESIRED

END'

END' (VI: p. 152). He finds that a 'brute conflict of impulses' is 'characteristic of conation on the purely perceptual level of mental life' (VI: p. 153), and he has devised a list of cases illustrating 'the principal states in the transition from simple conflict of impulses to volition in the fullest sense'. For him, the energies of them all spring from instinctive roots. To this view he has held fast for a third of a century and more.

: :

Although many groups of psychologists have broken away from the psychology so systematically explained by Professor Stout in his 'Manual', and although some have not even studied the 'Manual' with care, yet many broad-minded psychologists do not reject the old when they find truth in a 'NEW' psychology; rather, they try to build on the earlier knowledge and to add to the earlier methods. 'If the "DYNAMIC" psychiatry be considered supplementary rather than antithetical to the descriptive method', Professor H. L. Hollingworth has written, 'it will be found to have called useful attention' -- and then he proceeds to show where we may be able to go if we are helped by more than one guiding light. In the Hormic Theory are included the findings not only of Psycho-Analysis, Analytical Psychology and Individual Psychology, but of Professors Stout and McDougall also. Indeed, it is claimed for the 'HORMIC

PRINCIPLE'

PRINCIPLE' that it has been recognised since the days of Aristotle, and has been taught by 'most of the psychologists of the Scottish School' 'more or less explicitly'. These Scottish Psychologists, Professor McDougall admits, 'sought the prime movers of human activity in what they

PSYCHOLOGISTS
OF THE SCOTTISH SCHOOL called the "implanted propensities".

(V: p. 269). Professor McDougall

continues: 'Dugald Stewart, in whose voluminous works the Scottish Psychology reached its most mature expression, distinguished five distinct classes of such propensities, falling into two natural groups' viz.,

(a) 'instinctive propensities
(comprising appetites, desires
and affections)'

(b) 'rational principles of ^{a n d} action,
(comprising self-love and the
moral faculty).

(V: p. 269)

These men of the Scottish School (a) had rejected
the

(a) In 1919, Professor McDougall, writing the Preface to the 14th Edition of his 'Social Psychology', admitted that Professor Drever had convicted him 'of injustice to some of the philosophers of the Scottish School, notably Dugald Stewart and Hutcheson, who had in many respects anticipated' him in his view of 'the place of instincts in human nature' (VI: pp. xiv-xv).

In 1922, when writing his 'Outline of Psychology' at Harvard, where he was then Professor of Psychology, Professor McDougall states that 'of contemporary authors Professor G. F. Stout' was the 'most able and consistent advocate of the dependence of feeling
on

the 'hedonist doctrine,' and this is important; the HORMIC THEORY implies the rejection of HEDONISM. It is not sufficient to say that 'hormic' means 'purposive', for a purposive psychology may assert -

(A) THAT FOR WHICH WE STRIVE IS PLEASURE.

That is, men act so as to obtain pleasant feelings and so as to avoid unpleasant ones; that, e. g.,

men desire food for the pleasure that
the food gives to them;

men desire victory, for the pleasure
the victory brings to them.

This pleasure-pain theory (the theory that men actually do desire the pleasure, and that men actually do desire to avoid the pain) is known as 'PSYCHOLOGICAL

HEDONISM.' It is to be distinguish-

'PSYCHOLOGICAL
HEDONISM' and
'ETHICAL HEDON-
ISM'

ed from 'ETHICAL HEDONISM', which
is the theory that assumes that

personal pleasure is the standard for human behaviour and conduct (IV: p. 24, and I) -- i.e., (more crudely)

'ETHICAL HEDONISM' asserts that men OUGHT TO DESIRE pleasure and OUGHT to avoid pain.

However, the HORMIC THEORY asserts that -

(B) THAT WHICH WE DESIRE, AND FOR WHICH WE
STRIVE, IS THE OBJECT ITSELF;

that is,

men actually desire the food, not the
pleasure that the food gives to them;

men actually desire the victory, not
the pleasure that victory brings to
them, or the absence of pain that

victory

(continued from foot of previous page)
on conation (in his 'Analytic Psychology'); but even
he wobbles a little in his later writings'(V: p. 269)

the 'hedonist doctrine,' and this is important; the HORMIC THEORY implies the rejection of HEDONISM. It is not sufficient to say that 'hormic' means 'purposive', for a purposive psychology may assert -

(A) THAT FOR WHICH WE STRIVE IS PLEASURE.

That is, men act so as to obtain pleasant feelings and so as to avoid unpleasant ones; that, e. g.,

men desire food for the pleasure that the food gives to them;

men desire victory, for the pleasure the victory brings to them.

This pleasure-pain theory (the theory that men actually do desire the pleasure, and that men actually do desire to avoid the pain) is known as 'PSYCHOLOGICAL

HEDONISM. It is to be distinguish-

'PSYCHOLOGICAL
HEDONISM' and
'ETHICAL HEDON-
ISM'

ed from 'ETHICAL HEDONISM', which
is the theory that assumes that

personal pleasure is the standard for human behaviour and conduct (IV: p. 24, and I) -- i.e., (more crudely) 'ETHICAL HEDONISM' asserts that men OUGHT TO DESIRE pleasure and OUGHT to avoid pain.

However, the HORMIC THEORY asserts that -

(B) THAT WHICH WE DESIRE, AND FOR WHICH WE STRIVE, IS THE OBJECT ITSELF;

that is,

men actually desire the food, not the pleasure that the food gives to them;

men actually desire the victory, not the pleasure that victory brings to them, or the absence of pain that

victory

(continued from foot of previous page)

on conation (in his 'Analytic Psychology'); but even he wobbles a little in his later writings' (V: p. 269)

victory brings to them. Professor McDougall has stated the facts as he sees them (in the light of

THE HORMIC
THEORY EX-
PLAINED

the HORMIC THEORY) thus: 'Man is so

constituted that, like animals of

other species, he desires and, under

appropriate circumstances, strives to attain certain great natural goals -- food, shelter, companions, a mate, knowledge, and so forth' (IV: p. 25).

: :

Although (as has been stated) it is claimed for the 'HORMIC PRINCIPLE' that it has been recognised since the days of Aristotle, the name 'HORMIC' has been used only in recent years. Dr C. G. Jung, in his 'Analytical Psychology' assumed a 'hypothetical fundamental striving' which he named 'libido',

DR JUNG

intending 'libido' to be an 'energising

expression for psychological values',

the 'psychological value' being something 'active' and 'determining'. In a footnote, Dr Jung added:

'This energy may also be designated as 'horme' ...

The concept 'horme' is an energetic expression for psychological values' (VI: p. 409, footnote).

(As mentioned in the footnote to page 80, in the last chapter -- DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY -- Dr Jung uses the term LIBIDO with a different significance from that of Dr Freud, whose 'pansexuality' Dr

Jung

Jung repudiates).

The adjective 'hormic' appears to have been coined by Professor T. P. Nunn. In his 'Outline of Psychology' (1923) Professor McDougall quoted from Professor Nunn's 'Education, Its Data and First Principles', a 'few sentences' -- actually about nine hundred words -- in explanation of the word

'hormic' (V: pp. 72-3). Professor
PROFESSOR
T. P. NUNN Nunn points out that, though an
'animal's life is permeated (as human physiology is) by chemical and physical factors', behaviour is not that of a mere 'physico-chemical machine', 'just as a poem, though permeated by grammar, is more than a sum of grammatical expressions'. An animal's life differs from 'purely mechanical processes' by the presence of an internal 'drive'. This element of 'drive' or 'urge' Professor Nunn calls 'horme', and to all the purposive processes of the organism he gives the name 'hormic processes'. These 'hormic' processes undergo a 'development in which they become organized into ever wider and more complex hormic systems', with a 'parallel development' in organization; and finally there are built up the 'great conative hierarchies'. These shape the man's individuality, and are the 'measure of his life's achievement'.

achievement'.

This word 'HORMIC' Professor McDougall has accepted as indicating his own views. In 'Psychologies of 1925' he appears as a representative of 'Purposive Psychology'; but in 'Psychologies of 1930' he tells us that he is endeavouring to justify the 'far more radically purposive psychology denoted by the adjective 'hormic', assuming that the purposive nature of human action is no longer in dispute' (VI: p. 444).

: :

One or two questions naturally arise. Firstly, if the Hormic Theory is accepted, how does the psychologist regard pleasure and pain? 'The correlation of pleasure with success or with progress toward the end of action, and of displeasure with failure and thwarting of action, must be accepted as fundamental, an ultimate fact of mind' (V: p. 191). But it is admitted that 'pleasure sustains, prolongs, and confirms the modes of striving'. Pain, on the other hand, has the opposite effect, 'checks us,' discourages us, turns us aside from the line of effort. But the securing of pleasure is not the object of the striving.

Secondly, as Dr Freud assumed a 'pleasure-pain' principle, can he be classed as a HORMIC PSYCHOLOGIST? Dr Freud holds that the 'ID' is ruled by

one .

one principle only -- the object being to avoid pain or to procure pleasure; it strives blindly to this one end. The 'EGO' on the other hand, strives to control the demands of the pleasure-principle, in order to adapt the organism to the requirements of the world, to external reality; this is the 'reality principle', which makes for harmony. These are dynamic 'mechanisms', operating alongside the instinctive impulses -- the 'sexual instincts' and 'those of aggression'. From these instinctive impulses spring human activities, and to this extent Dr Freud's psychology is hormic; but the hormic principle is, in Psycho-Analysis, complicated by the introduction of the 'pleasure-pain principle' and the 'reality-principle'. Dr Freud's psychology is, therefore, only partially HORMIC.

(Professor McDougall writes: 'Two fundamental virtues are possessed by all the psycho-analytical schools: ... they deal with human nature and human activities in terms which recognise that ... all human activity is purposive' ... 'This fundamental virtue ... is there in all his treatment...' (Dr Freud's treatment)
A second common virtue is the recognition and use by all these schools of the hormic principle' (IX: pp. 112-113).

Thirdly, in what respects does the HORMIC THEORY differ from other views that are also purposive? The HORMIC THEORY is that 'human activities are prompted and sustained by impulses and desires which spring from deeply-rooted

innate

Referred

one principle only -- the object being to avoid pain or to procure pleasure; it strives blindly to this one end. The 'EGO' on the other hand, strives to control the demands of the pleasure-principle, in order to adapt the organism to the requirements of the world, to external reality; this is the 'reality principle', which makes for harmony. These are dynamic 'mechanisms', operating alongside the instinctive impulses -- the 'sexual instincts' and 'those of aggression'. From these instinctive impulses spring human activities, and to this extent Dr Freud's psychology is hormic; but the hormic principle is, in Psycho-Analysis, complicated by the introduction of the 'pleasure-pain principle' and the 'reality-principle'. Dr Freud's psychology is, therefore, only partially HORMIC.

(Professor McDougall writes: 'Two fundamental virtues are possessed by all the psycho-analytical schools: ... they deal with human nature and human activities in terms which recognise that ... all human activity is purposive' ... 'This fundamental virtue ... is there in all his treatment...' (Dr Freud's treatment) 'A second common virtue is the recognition and use by all these schools of the hormic principle' (IX: pp. 112-113).

Thirdly, in what respects does the HORMIC THEORY differ from other views that are also purposive? The HORMIC THEORY is that 'human activities are prompted and sustained by impulses and desires which spring from deeply-rooted

innate

innate dispositions'---variously termed 'propensities', 'tendencies', 'instinctual dispositions', or 'instincts' (IX: p. 113).

As Professor Nunn noted, these IMPULSES (or element of 'DRIVE' or 'URGE') differentiate our lives from 'purely mechanical processes'.

: :

The words 'instinct,' 'instinctive', and 'instinctual' have been used in connection with these 'IMPULSES', and it is necessary to consider exactly what is meant by the term 'INSTINCT', before proceeding to list the various dispositions that are classed as 'instinctive', with a view to seeing how each may be adapted to the purposes of Religious Education.

: :

VI. 'The Instincts of the Human Mind' by W. McDougall
 London: Methuen & Co. Ltd.
 2nd Edition, 1928
 (First published, 1922)

VII. 'The Psychology of Life' (by Alfred Adler)
 London: George Allen & Unwin, Limited
 (First published, 1927)

VIII. 'A Manual of Psychology' by G. F. Stout
 London: George Allen & Unwin, Limited
 8th Edition, 1928
 (2nd Edition was prepared in July, 1925)

IX. 'Psycho-Analysis and Social Psychology' by W. McDougall
 London: George Allen & Unwin, Limited
 1928

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- I 'Dictionary of Psychology' edited by H. C.
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & Warren
UNWIN LTD.
1935
- II 'Psychology: The Chang- by F. Aveling, M.C.,
ing Outlook' D.Lit., D.Sc., Ph.D.
LONDON: WATTS & CO. Prof. of Psychology
1937 in the University
of London
- III 'Webster's New International Dictionary of the
English Language'
LONDON: G. BELL & SONS LD.
SPRINGFIELD, MASS.: G. & C.
MERRIAM CO.
2nd Edition Unabridged 1934
- IV 'The Energies of Man' by Wm. McDougall
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD.
4th Edition, 1939.
(first published, 1932)
- V 'An Outline of Psychology' by Wm. McDougall
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD.
2nd Edition, 1924.
(written in 1922)
- VI 'An Introduction to Social by Wm. McDougall
Psychology'
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD.
23rd Edition, enlarged, 1936
(first published, 1908)
- VII 'The Pattern of Life')(by Alfred Adler
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,)(edited by W. Béran
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.)(Wolfe, M.D.
1931
- VIII 'A Manual of Psychology' by G. F. Stout,
LONDON: W. B. CLIVE M.A., LL.D.
8th Impression (third
Edition) 1919
(3rd Edition was pre-
pared in July, 1913)
- IX 'Psycho-Analysis and by Wm. McDougall
Social Psychology'
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
1936

CHAPTER VII

INSTINCTS

:::

CHAPTER VII

I N S T I N C T S

Although this enquiry is concerned with the application of only the HORMIC THEORY in Psychology, yet there is information that will be indirectly useful in connection with the subject, information that has come not from the academic and dynamic psychologists, but from the Gestalt school and from the behaviourists. It would be an advantage, therefore, if, when fixing the meanings of terms, definitions could be found which would be acceptable to every school of psychology.

Unfortunately, this is, in many cases, not easy, and, in regard to the word 'INSTINCT', it seems quite impossible. By 'INSTINCT' the extreme mechanist means a 'response pattern'.

'For them' (the 'mechanist behaviourists') an instinct is merely an "action-pattern", a system of reflex arcs in the nervous system, which, on being appropriately stimulated, leads the nervous excitation through a fixed system of channels to a certain group of muscles and glands' (I: p. 19).

Such a definition leaves no place for the Hormic Theory. When the behaviourist is faced with such a description of instinctive activity and such a conception of 'INSTINCT' as is required by dynamic psychology, he says: 'There are then for us no instincts; we no longer need the term in psychology.'

Everything

Everything we have been in the habit of calling an "instinct" to-day is a result of training -- belongs to man's learned behaviour'. These are the exact words of Dr J. B. Watson; and he adds that 'there is no such thing as an inheritance of capacity, talent, temperament, mental constitution and characteristics; these things again depend on training that goes on mainly in the cradle' (II: pp. 74-75). Clearly, it is necessary to turn away from the paths of the behaviourists.

But, coming to the first of the three best-known dynamic psychologists, Dr Freud, and considering his writings in regard to the instincts, we find (as has already been mentioned -- chapter V, page 81) that it is necessary to ignore his views in this connection, if a definition is to be framed

DR FREUD'S VIEWS
AND DR JUNG'S

that will satisfy other psychologists who recognise the hormic principle. These include Dr Jung, who points out that the concept of instinct is 'anything but well defined in the scientific sense', and adds: 'it applies to a biological manifestation of great complexity, and is not much more than a notion of quite indefinite content standing for an unknown quantity' (V: p. 257).

Nevertheless, Dr Jung tells us elsewhere that, when he himself speaks of INSTINCT, he 'therewith

denotes

denotes what is commonly understood by this word, namely, an impulsion towards certain activities. In yet another place, he speaks of instincts as 'urges'.

In this connection, Professor G. F. Stout uses the word 'disposition', and so does Professor William McDougall, who adopts this term after speaking of an instinct as a 'fact of mental structure' (VI: p. 105). It is agreed by these writers (Dr Jung, Dr Stout, and Dr McDougall), then, that an instinct is

NOT an 'activity' or an 'experience' or a
'feeling' or 'mental functioning' of
any kind,

BUT a 'concept' or 'rational construct',
which has been proposed in order to
explain 'experience';

in other words, that the INSTINCTS must be classed under the first heading (A) ENDURING DISPOSITIONS and not under the second heading (B) MENTAL FUNCTIONING (to which reference has been made on page 65, in chapter V, DYNAMIC PSYCHOLOGY).

It remains to choose the word which is to describe this concept INSTINCT: 'impulsion', 'urge', 'disposition', and 'structure' have all been used for this purpose by leading writers on the subject, and of these terms 'impulsion' appears to convey the meaning as well as any, being defined (IV: IMPULSION)

as

as 'a state of the organism which predisposes it for some specific type of activity'.

: :

Is this 'impulsion' acquired or inborn? Dr J. B. Watson has been quoted as having written: 'Everything we have been in the habit of calling an "instinct" to-day is a result of training' (page 111), while Professor McDougall mentions that a few other writers, 'of whom Professor Wundt is the most prominent', apply the terms 'instinct' and 'instinctive' to the 'very strongly fixed, acquired habits of action that are more commonly and properly described

as secondarily automatic actions, as well as to the innate specific tendencies'. Professor Stout wrote: 'When we say that a bodily action or mental process is instinctive, or due to instinct, whatever else may be meant, it is implied that the bodily action or mental process is not acquired through experience, but that it has its source in the inborn constitution, bodily or mental or both, of the individual' (VII: p. 334). Professor McDougall also, with, as he says, the 'great majority' of 'professed psychologists', reserves the terms 'instinct' and 'instinctive' for inherited impulsions only (IX: p. 20). So that, although Dr Watson

declares

declares so dogmatically that 'everything' is to-day known to belong to 'man's learned behaviour', and although Professor Wundt and others have used the term in a wider sense, it seems necessary, in order to conform to the best usage, to limit the meaning of INSTINCTS so as to include only INNATE impulsions. (a)

However, it is questionable whether 'INNATE' is the best adjective for the purpose; for 'INNATE' may be taken as signifying 'manifest in 'INNATE' the individual at birth'. Professor OR 'CONNATE?' Stout had used the word 'inborn'; and others might prefer to speak of instincts as 'either connate or deferred', in order to make it clear that they recognise that there are 'delayed instincts', which, owing to the immaturity of the organism, do not show signs of activity in the period just after birth. Professor McDougall, however, uses the adjective 'INNATE' with a wide signification, as is clear when he writes: 'in the human being, the instincts, ALTHOUGH INNATE, are, with few exceptions, undeveloped in the first months of life, and only ripen, or become capable of functioning, at various periods throughout the years from infancy to puberty' (IX: p. 21).

Accepting the word 'INNATE', then, with this broad signification, an instinct may be said to be
an

(a) Whether the instincts are INNATE or 'learned' is a matter of much consequence for the Theory of Religious Education.

an 'INNATE IMPULSION'.

Are these 'INNATE IMPULSIONS' psychical or physiological?

Dr Jung describes them as 'physiological', traceable to the functioning of the glands; but he adds that they 'condition or influence psychic processes' (V: p. 257). Professor McDougall, however, says that 'if we use the adjective "physiological" or "neural", we should do so with the explicit understanding that it is not meant to imply the mechanistic interpretation of instinctive action' (VI: p. 110). In order to make this clear, the word 'psycho-physical' may be substituted, the use of this term implying that instinct 'plays a part in determining both bodily action and the course of experience' (VI: p. 110). The definition of INSTINCT, then, might commence with the words: INNATE PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION.

: :

Does this 'INNATE PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION', having once shown signs of activity, continue, throughout the life of the organism, to operate in its original form, or is there development?

When an instinctive act is performed for the first time, the impulsion is seen in its purest form (it is generally agreed); the behaviour becomes modified (at any rate, in man, and in the higher animals) by experience. Professor McDougall speaks

of

of the great 'complications' of the instinctive processes that are brought about 'in the long course of the development of each human mind',

INSTINCTIVE
BEHAVIOUR
MODIFIED BY
EXPERIENCE

complications 'so great that they have obscured until recent years the essential likeness of the instinctive processes in men and animals' (IX: p. 27). The possibilities of these 'complications' are of the greatest importance for Religious Education.

In order to understand this change in instinctive action, it is necessary to notice that the 'innate psycho-physical impulsion' does not behave blindly. Professor Stout notes that 'the course of the instinctive activity is throughout guided by and adjusted to complex and variable combinations of different impressions' (VII: p. 343); while Professor McDougall says that 'its possessor' perceives, and pays attention to 'objects of a certain class' (IX: p. 25). Elsewhere, Professor McDougall asks us to

COGNITIVE ASPECT
OF THE INSTINCTIVE
PROCESS

take the word 'object' in the very 'widest sense, namely, to include not only material things

and organisms, but also various situations in which the creature may find itself, consisting in conjunctions of internal and external conditions' (VI: p. 110). This may be called the COGNITIVE aspect of the instinctive process.

Accompanying instinctive action there may be also an EMOTIONAL EXCITEMENT. In 'An Introduction to Social Psychology', first published in 1908, Professor McDougall set forth the theory that EMOTION

EMOTIONAL	was a mode of experience that
EXCITEMENT	attended 'the working within us
IN INSTINCTIVE	of instinctive impulses', and
EXPERIENCE	

that 'the operation of each instinct, no matter how brought into play, is accompanied by its own peculiar quality of experience, which may be called a primary emotion', the 'human emotions being regarded as 'clues to the instinctive impulses, or indicators of the motives at work in us'. In 'An Outline of Psychology' (written not at Oxford, but in America, in 1922) Professor McDougall states that he still holds to this theory (VI: p. 128), having meantime, in the Preface to the fourteenth edition of his 'Social Psychology', declined to accept Dr Drever's suggestion

'THAT the instinct-emotion is not an invariable accompaniment of instinctive activity, but that the instinct interest is'

a n d 'THAT the instinct-emotion is due to what we previously called 'tension',

that is, in the ordinary case,
to ARREST OF THE IMPULSE,
to THE DENYING OF IMMEDIATE SATISFACTION

to

'to the interest' (ix: p. xiv).

It is clear that there is not agreement, even among psychologists of the highest standing who both use the method of introspection and also endeavour to use the methods and to appreciate the views of the various schools of psychology. It would seem to be a case for decision by introspection; and the fact that findings do not coincide, tends to strengthen the position of those who see in the methods of introspection and retrospection serious weaknesses.

However, although there is no general agreement as to the source of the emotional excitement, it is still possible to speak of the AFFECTIVE aspect of instincts.

: :

Psychologists generally agree, however, in regarding instinctive behaviour as exhibiting a 'persistent striving towards the natural end of the process' (IX: p. 24). This impulse to act in a particular manner may be called the CONATIVE aspect of the impulsion.

: :

An INSTINCT, therefore, may be regarded as

AN INBORN PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION
WITH COGNITIVE, AFFECTIVE and CONATIVE
ASPECTS;

or (using Professor McDougall's phrases so far as
they

they meet with general agreement by most psychologists with a broad outlook)

'AN INNATE PSYCHO-PHYSICAL DISPOSITION'
&c.

: :

A further limitation is required, however, before the definition is narrow enough to exclude all other types of impulsion except INSTINCTS. The cognitive, affective and conative aspects relate to certain objects only; that is, the INSTINCT is of such a nature as to impel the individual

to perceive appropriate objects,

to experience an impulse to act in a
particular manner in regard to these
appropriate objects,

and to feel an emotional excitement.

These appropriate objects may be, e.g., certain places -- in these places certain insects lay their eggs, and these are the ONLY PLACES 'WHERE THE GRUBS, WHEN HATCHED, WILL FIND THE FOOD THEY NEED' (IX: p. 21). Or, for a hunting dog, the appropriate object may be a rabbit; this the dog perceives; his hunting instinct determines him to experience an impulse to run after this 'appropriate object'; there is evidence of emotional excitement. This is typical of all instincts -- perception, conation, and emotion, IN CONNECTION WITH A CERTAIN CLASS OF OBJECT.

With this in mind, a definition of INSTINCT may be given:

'AN

'AN INNATE PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION
WHICH DETERMINES THE ORGANISM
TO PERCEIVE, AND TO PAY ATTENTION TO,
OBJECTS OF A CERTAIN CLASS,
TO EXPERIENCE AN IMPULSE TO ACT
IN A PARTICULAR MANNER IN REGARD
TO SUCH OBJECTS,
AND TO FEEL AN EMOTIONAL EXCITEMENT
IN CONNECTION WITH THE IMPULSE
OR THE ARREST OF IT'. (a)

This definition will be found to exclude certain 'INNATE TENDENCIES', which are often classed as INSTINCTS or INSTINCTIVE tendencies; but these 'INNATE TENDENCIES' or 'PSEUDO-INSTINCTS' are not therefore excluded from the realm of the HORMIC THEORY, for the term HORMIC (as has been mentioned in the previous chapter -- page 105) includes ALL THE PURPOSIVE PROCESSES OF THE ORGANISM (i.e., the 'drives' or 'urges' whose presence differentiates animal and human life from 'purely mechanical' movements).

To the consideration of these PURPOSIVE PROCESSES (as seen both in instinctive activity and in behaviour prompted by more general innate tendencies), in so far as they have a bearing on the Theory of Religious Education, the next chapter is devoted.

(a) This definition follows in most respects Professor McDougall's, but includes also some words -- or qualifications -- suggested by Dr Jung and Professor Drever.

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- I 'An Outline of Abnormal Psychology' by Wm. McDougall, F.R.S.
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
1926
- II 'Behaviorism' by John B. Watson
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LTD.
1925
- III) 'Dictionary of Psychology' edited by Howard C.
IV) LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & Warren
UNWIN LTD.
1935
- V 'Modern Man in Search of a Soul' by C. G. Jung
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LTD.
1934
- VI 'An Outline of Psychology' by Wm. McDougall, F.R.S.
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
2nd Edition, 1924
(first published, 1923)
- VII 'A Manual of Psychology' by G. F. Stout, M.A., LL.D.
LONDON: W. B. CLIVE
8th Impression (third
edition) 1919
(3rd edition was prepared in July, 1913)
- VIII 'Behaviorism' by J. B. Watson! (same as II)
- IX 'An Introduction to Social Psychology' (by Wm. McDougall, F.R.S.)
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD.
23rd Edition, 1936
(first published, 1908)

CHAPTER VIII

SOME SPECIFIC INSTINCTS

AND

THEIR RELATION TO RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

: :

- (a) THE GREGARIOUS INSTINCT
- (b) THE CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT
- (c) THE SUBMISSIVE INSTINCT
- (d) THE PROTECTIVE INSTINCT

: :

'Of unimproved metal hot and full'

-- Shakespeare

(Hamlet: I: 1: 96)

CHAPTER VIII

SOME SPECIFIC INSTINCTS AND
THEIR RELATION TO RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

An attempt having been made to describe the HORMIC THEORY, and to define the concept of INSTINCT, the way is now open for a detailed consideration of some of the PURPOSIVE PROCESSES of the human organism, which (the HORMIC THEORY maintains) prompt and sustain human activity, and which spring from deeply-rooted dispositions (or 'IMPULSIONS') such as INSTINCTS and other INNATE TENDENCIES. After each INSTINCT or TENDENCY has been considered, it is proposed to make an endeavour to discover in what way the Theory of Religious Education is affected by the functioning of that particular urge.

: :

(a) THE GREGARIOUS OR HERD INSTINCT.

It seems natural to commence with the instinct that gives the educator an opportunity of 'manipulating the environment of large numbers of persons at the one time, viz., the GREGARIOUS OR HERD INSTINCT. This is sometimes called the SOCIAL INSTINCT, but sociability 'although it has the gregarious instinct at its foundation, is a more complex, more highly developed, tendency' (I: p. 74).

Description of the Gregarious Instinct.

'Gregariousness' is defined as 'the tendency, manifested within certain species, to congregate or to live

in groups', and the term 'Gregarious Instinct' implies that this behaviour is the function of an inherited trait'. The word 'gregarious' has been used in reference to persons for a century and a half (II and III). It seems to be a general rule that 'the more numerous the herd or crowd or society in which the individual finds himself, the more complete is the satisfaction' of this gregarious impulse (I: p. 72).

The GOAL or AIM of the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT is to be in the company of other members of the species; their presence is desired, nothing more (V: p. 154). In its simplest form, the working of the instinct shows that there is satisfaction in being one of a herd, and an uneasiness in isolation (I: p. 72).

BY MAN, MORE
THAN MERE
PRESENCE
DESIRED

But in human nature, there is a felt need, not only for the mere physical presence of other members of the race, but for fellowship with them, and for the sharing of our emotions with them (V: p. 432). (This will be further considered in a later chapter).

Professor William James included SOCIABILITY in his list of those instincts (VI: p. 407) that 'begin very early in life'. He describes elsewhere the experience of the normal man:

'To be alone is one of the greatest of evils for him. Solitary confinement is by many regarded as a mode of torture

too

Description of the Gregarious Instinct (continued)

'too cruel and unnatural for civilised countries to adopt. To one long pent up on a desert island the sight of a human footprint or a human form in the distance would be the most tumultuously exciting of experiences' (I: p. 73).

This is quoted by Professor McDougall, who himself adds:

'For all but a few exceptional, and generally highly cultivated, persons, the one essential condition of recreation is the being one of a crowd'.

Proceeding to illustrate this, he mentions that the evening recreation of the population of our towns consists in going out and walking up and down those streets in which the throng is densest -- the Strand, Oxford Street, or the Old Kent Road (London). Among other instances of the functioning of the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT, he refers to the few days on which the people are free to go where they please; on these holidays the working classes rush together, choosing those resorts in which they
THE PEOPLE'S CHOICE
OF HOLIDAY RESORT are assured of the presence
of a large mass of their fellows (I: p. 73).

The GREGARIOUS INSTINCT is also observed to operate so as to determine the individual to feel a 'primary responsibility' to the populace or to the herd -- a responsibility which may even take precedence over his own protection. This may be
observed

Description of the Gregarious Instinct (continued)

observed in some animals, who give warning of the approach of an enemy, and in many men and women, who have stayed on duty after their position has become perilous, though in human beings it is admitted that other impulsions may co-operate with the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT in determining such behaviour.

The functioning of the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT also is seen in another fact: THE INDIVIDUAL IS SENSITIVE TO THE VOICE OF THE HERD. 'Practically all normal individuals obey the dictates of the community to an extent which is seldom appreciated', Professor R. J. S. McDowall writes (IV: p. 71).

Yet another activity, of which the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT seems to be a determining factor, is seen in the acceptance, by men and women as well as by some of the higher animals, of CO-OPERATIVE WORK under leadership; human beings are 'SUSCEPTIBLE to LEADERSHIP.' However, here again other dispositions also seem to be functioning (e.g., the instinct of submission); and the same may be the case when the individual is 'sensitive to the voice of the herd'.

: :

Application to the Theory of Religious Education.

As the satisfaction of the gregarious impulse is more complete 'the more numerous the herd or crowd

or

Gregarious Instinct: Application ... (continued)

or society in which the individual finds himself, it seems to follow that

(1) LARGE CONGREGATIONS MEET AN INSTINCTIVE NEED. A single quotation will show the opinion of one who had every opportunity for observing the facts. When the Church of Scotland, Rosyth, was worshipping in a long, narrow, wooden hall, which seated about four hundred persons, and was crowded Sunday evening after Sunday evening, there was a demand for a large Church; the late Dr Dunlop replied: 'If you had a Church twice the size, you would have an evening congregation half the size'.

From this it would appear that not only does the individual desire large numbers, but that he desires to be in a crowd that is well packed together; or, as Professor R. J. S. McDowall puts it; he is 'attracted by warmth'.

However, physical proximity does not satisfy the whole man; the instinctive longing to be part of a great organization, is apparent also. The feeling of loneliness or isolation is abhorrent in both the physical and the mental sphere.

(In regard to Sunday School work, the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT is on the side of those few who still desire the young people all together in what they call 'one large

Gregarious Instinct: Application ... (continued)

large school'; but there will be other considerations, which should be taken into account before coming to a decision on this question; and these other considerations may turn the scales in favour

'ONE LARGE SUNDAY
SCHOOL' OR A
'GRADED SCHOOL?' of 'departments', with smaller groups of children, graded with respect to age. In this

case, the educationist is faced with the problem of how to adjust the environment so that girls and boys may have the benefits accruing from large gatherings.

(In connection with the present enquiry, attention has been given to this problem, and, after considering certain other impulses of the child, arrangements were made for an experiment, a report of which is included in the last section of this study).

: :

If the individual has an impulse to feel a primary responsibility to society, it would follow that he may be ready (when the environment affords a suitable opportunity) to take his place among workers in Religious Education -- remembering always that Religious Educational work is not only teaching in a Sunday School, but also providing an environment, by other means, so that the girl or boy may develop satisfactorily. Other impulses that might help a person to engage in such activities

include

include -

The Parental (or Protective) Instinct; and

The Instinct of Construction;

under these headings, the possibilities of including suitable work in the Theory of Religious Education will be further examined.

: :

As the individual is sensitive to the 'voice of the herd', clearly there is an urge towards orthodoxy. But here, again, other tendencies are involved, and these include

The Pseudo-Instinct of Suggestion,

which is one of the 'General Innate Tendencies', which are to be described later, when ORTHODOXY will be considered.

: :

'Co-operative work under leadership' is sustained not only by the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT, but also by

The Pseudo-Instinct of Imitation, and

The Submissive Instinct;

these impulses will be defined before details of possible activities are discussed.

: :

The need, felt by human beings, for the physical presence of other members of the race, and for overcoming isolation, too, in the mental sphere, has already been mentioned; but Mr W. Trotter (in

'Instincts

Gregarious Instinct: Application ... (continued)

'Instincts of the Herd in Peace and War') mentions the 'deeper personal necessities' of men and women, who feel a 'sense of incompleteness' 'in the deepest recesses of personality'. Whereas physical and intellectual loneliness are 'effectually solaced by the nearness and agreement of the herd', the deeper 'sense of incompleteness' compels us to 'reach out towards some larger existence' than that of our own 'race', towards 'some encompassing being' in whom our 'perplexities may find a solution' and our 'longings peace'.

There is no need to accept the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT as the principal factor in religious belief, though the activity of the instinct may be one of those 'uncontrolled factors in the environment' of which Professor Drever has written. There are other instincts which have been proposed by other authors as being responsible for religious activity; e.g., THE INSTINCT OF SELF-PRESERVATION, and the SENTIMENT OF LOVE (which has an instinctive basis). It is possible, in each case, to argue that RELIGION often comes into conflict with the ordinary activities of the instinct. Dr Thouless points out that 'the suppression of the normal mode of satisfaction of the herd-instinct is a preliminary condition of the more intensive religious life;' as in the case of the hermits (XIV: p. 141). As to self-preservation,

Gregarious Instinct: Application ... (continued)

is was definitely laid down by our Master Himself:

'He that findeth his life shall lose it; and he that loseth his life for My sake shall find it'. While, with regard to human love, He said: 'He that loveth father or mother more than Me is not worthy of Me; and he that loveth son or daughter more than Me is not worthy of Me' (Matthew's Gospel: x: 39, 38).

The religious life is not necessarily the expression of any one instinct or of a combination of instincts; it may demand the suppression of instinctive behaviour, and the use of the psychic 'HORME' for what are sometimes called 'higher' purposes. Under the heading of 'SUBLIMATION', this process of deflecting the energy of the impulse to new objects and socially useful goals, will be considered later.

: :

Meantime, the application of the teaching of Hormic Psychology (in regard to the GREGARIOUS OR HERD INSTINCT) to the Theory of Religious Education may be summarised:

(I) Large congregations meet an instinctive need; human nature desires not only physical presence, but intellectual fellowship, and a sharing of emotional experience, too; there is a longing to be part of a great organization.

Several

Gregarious Instinct: Application ... (continued)

Several corollaries have been mentioned, but, before they can be fully discussed, it is necessary to examine carefully other dispositions; to one of these dispositions (the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION) it is now proposed to turn.

: :

(b) THE CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT.

The INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION is defined as 'an inherited tendency in certain individuals or species to put material objects together with the result of meeting the needs of life' (II). Examples of behaviour that indicates the presence in human beings of such an instinct are given, viz.,

The building of shelters;

The devising of weapons, etc.

Human beings generally manifest a propensity toward such work.

The INSTINCT of CONSTRUCTION impels the individual to put together, also, that which cannot be classed as 'material;' for instance, when an author is working, his activities show that he has inherited this instinct, which is finding expression in what he probably calls 'creative' work. Sir John Adams describes a man who has sat down to write his first novel: 'he cannot clothe his

characters

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

characters aright -- just because he is a man and so many of his characters are women ... If he is wise, he will settle down to describe scenes through which he has actually himself passed, deal with trains by which he has actually travelled, put his characters into clothes he (or his wife) has actually worn' (XVI: p. 190). Although he -- and everyone else -- will be speaking of his work as 'creative', it is clear that he is 'putting together' in exactly the same way as might be expected, seeing that he possesses the CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT, which has been defined on the previous page. He has 'put together' characters, clothes, scenery, trains, after having chosen (from hundreds of possible samples) sufficient of each for his purpose; he chooses incidents from life, of which he has knowledge, and uses his IMAGINATION to supplement these incidents (in much the same way as a business man may, by the aid of his IMAGINATION, and with his knowledge of the past, foretell the future, and indulge in a 'far-reaching planning of action' to forestall and prepare for what he sees ahead). The author may be said to CREATE the novel, or he may be said to CONSTRUCT the novel; the business man may be said to CREATE his business, or he may be said to CONSTRUCT his business.

(The word IMAGINATION has been used; this term is defined by Professor McDougall as 'thinking
of

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

of remote objects' -- a 'remote object' being 'any object not affecting the senses at the moment of thinking of it' (V: p. 284); and the primary function of imagination is stated to be the depicting of the future, anticipating the course of events.

¶ 'Imagination requires for its higher and more productive flights the co-operation of REASONING -- the function which selects in any object or situation the features essential to the purpose in hand and constructs the picture of the future, not in the exact semblance of the past, but as it is likely to flow from the particular conditions of the present' -- V. p. 293¶.

It is noteworthy that in this connection, Professor McDougall has used the word 'CONSTRUCTS', thereby implying the functioning of the INSTINCT which is now being examined).

: :

The behaviour of a bird when building her nest may seem far removed from the 'CREATIVE WORK' of an artist or poet; but two facts have to be borne in mind, viz.,

(1) The term 'CREATIVE WORK' is not used in any theological sense when men speak of the production of a novel, poem, or painting, and employ the phrase; i.e.,

TO CREATE (said of God) = to bring into being,
cause to exist.

TO CREATE (in the sense in which the word is
used in this chapter)

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

= 'to constitute; cause, produce, give rise to (a condition, etc.)' --- in use since 1599 with this signification (III).

(11) The INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION, as it is seen in humanity, is 'at a very low degree of specialization'. 'The construction of nests, homes, webs, combs, and so forth' by birds, by insects, by spiders, by bees, 'affords some of the most marvellous examples of instinctive activity' (V:p162), and the behaviour of some of these creatures 'illustrates in the richest and purest manner the operation of "INSTINCT"' (V: p. 70); attention is paid only to 'objects of a certain class' (e.g., 'the Yucca moths "emerge from their chrysalis cases just when the large, yellowish-white, bell-shaped flowers of the Yucca open, each for a single night" -- and it is to the flowers of the Yucca that this moth pays attention); the impulse is to act 'in a particular manner in regard to such objects' (e.g., the female Yucca moth "from the anthers of one of these flowers ... collects the golden pollen and kneads the adhesive material into a single pellet ... seeks another flower ... pierces with the sharp lancets of her ovipositor the tissue of the pistil, lays her eggs among the ovules, and then ... stuffs the fertilizing pollen-pellet into

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

its funnel-shaped opening"; in this way the moth places her eggs where they can develop, if the ovules develop; but the ovules can develop only if the moth pushes the pollen from another flower into the open stigma^(a). This is the type of behaviour that is associated in the minds of many with the term 'INSTINCT'; it is highly specialized, and there is little scope for the play of INTELLIGENCE. But in human nature, the instinctive activities are less specialized, and there is greater scope 'and demand' for INTELLIGENCE, which supplements the INSTINCT. Particularly is this true in regard to the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION.

: :

But that the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION does exist, and that, if it were functioning properly, it could be a great factor in Education -- and particularly in Religious Education -- can hardly be doubted. Although, in the case of many, it has been allowed but little chance to develop in childhood^(b) and in adolescence ^(c), and although the circumstances of the

(a) The quotations from the definition of INSTINCT (chapter VII; page 120) are supplemented from Professor McDougall's 'Outline of Psychology', which cites the instance of the Yucca moth from Professor Lloyd Morgan's 'Habit and Instinct'.

(b) Childhood = from 2 to 14 years (roughly)

(c) Adolescence = from 14 to 21 years (roughly)

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

the majority of adults allow it but small scope to-day, yet it still survives. 'For most of us, the satisfaction of having actually made something is very real, quite apart from the usefulness of the thing made; and the simple desire to make something, rooted in this instinct, is probably a contributing motive to all human constructions from a mud-pie to a metaphysical system or a code of laws' -- Professor McDougall (I: p. 75).

While the Psycho-Analysts stress the desirability of cultivating the ARTS -- 'the CREATIVE rather than the acquisitive aspects of knowledge and power' -- and while Dr Jung states that the 'creative energy lives and waxes in a man as a tree in the earth from which it takes its nourishment' ^(a) (XVII: p. 238) and mentions the possibility of regarding 'the creative process as a living thing, implanted, as it were, in the souls of men', the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION does not occupy a large place in many books on Psychology. In order to discover the truth or otherwise of the statement: 'FOR MOST OF US, THE SATISFACTION OF HAVING MADE SOMETHING IS VERY REAL', two girls, aged 8 years 7 months and 7 years 8 months respectively, have been asked: 'What do you like doing best of all?' They were in their own home at the time the question was asked,

and

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

and this fact may account for their answers all having reference to INDOOR ACTIVITIES. Although they discussed their preferences a little among themselves, they finally agreed on the following list, which they gave in the order here set out:

FIRST: Making dolls; (a)

SECOND: Making dresses for dolls; (b)

THIRD: Putting dresses on dolls;

FOURTH: Making blankets; (c)

FIFTH: Making castles. (d)

(a) They themselves make the 'dolls' out of old cloth, stitching on buttons for 'eyes' and using coloured thread for 'mouth'. (b) They possess a number of 'bought dolls', for which they make dresses (as well as they can!). (c) The 'blankets' are for the dolls' cots. (d) These 'castles' they build out of blocks, which they possess in considerable variety.

The two girls were then asked what they like doing best in the garden -- which is a large one. They agreed, finally:

FIRST: Making daisy chains;

SECOND: Building houses (e)

and on being asked what they liked doing best outside their own home and garden, replied without hesitation:

Making castles in the sand.

(e) They

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

(e) They are able to use, for building, firewood (in lengths up to six feet), galvanized iron (corrugated), orange boxes, and slates; they prefer to build against the stone wall of the garden.

When asked what they liked best in the Church Services, they put their preferences in this order:

FIRST: Reading the Bible; (f)

SECOND: The singing;

and in Sunday School:

FIRST: Drawing; (g)

SECOND: The singing.

(f) Genesis; and Matthew, Mark, Luke and John, 'better than Psalms'. (They follow the readings in their Bibles; and seem to be pleased with the fact that they are able to do so; also they are proud of their Bibles). (g) Technically called 'hand-work'.

All this came out in the course of two 'free-and-easy' conversations. The final question was, 'Do you like "making daisy chains", in the garden, better than eating turnips?' (turnips are, for some reason, a favourite food). One of the girls had just answered, 'Don't know', when, unfortunately, a young lady (who had sat for a teachers' examination only a month before, and was therefore more than ordinarily interested) asked what was the underlying aim of

the

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

the questions. Her words, of course, called the children's attention to the fact that there was a purpose in the conversation; which, of course, could not then be continued with frankness. But already their replies had shown clearly that there was a real desire to do constructive work, a desire rooted apparently (as had been stated) in the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION. 'Making dolls', 'making dresses for dolls', 'putting dresses on dolls', 'making blankets for dolls' cots', 'making castles', 'making daisy chains', 'building houses', 'drawing' -- the choice of these activities confirms the assumption of a CONSTRUCTIVE URGE, which operates 'quite apart from the usefulness of the thing made'.

: :

There is one interesting way in which children, before they reach school age, may give expression to the INSTINCT FOR CONSTRUCTION, viz., in speech, by 'coining' words, and by dictating letters.

Examples of terms coined recently by young children (ages in brackets, years and months) are: 'Little lights' = stars (4.8); 'Gooders' = Sunday clothes (3.10); 'Shoon' = shoes (cf. child, plural children) (2.4); 'Funnel' = steeple (3.4); 'Climber' = ladder (4.7); 'Piece of cow' = red hair in gentleman's ear (3.7).

It

It has sometimes been possible to take down in shorthand the words a child is singing, without the child being aware of the fact that she is being observed. Following a black-out accident, one girl (aged 4.9) was heard singing:

'One was a boy who broke his eye;
Lah, la-lah, la-lah, la, lah, lah, lah;
Dashed into a window,
Fast, fast, fast-fast; fast-fast-fast;
Dashed into a window, terr-rib-ly;
One little boy was broken; his eye
It was a lovely little shiney thing;
Oh, it's bleeding; Oh, it is bleeding....'

The CONSTRUCTIVE URGE is finding expression so long as no one laughs at any crude phrase, and so long as the shorthand-typist takes the girl seriously. The letters that have been dictated are all quite natural; here is one written by a girl (aged 4.4), enclosing a snap-shot of her mother and sister:

'Dear Daddy's Mummy, .
Here is a picture; Mummy in the water! And who is this wee girlie? It is wee Sheila. She is a nice wee girlie. You see the water; it is white and black in the picture; but it is all white. I play in the water, bathe, make pies, make shells clean, and get my photogram taken. Do you think wee Sheila is too far in? How does she get out? I get out a funny way; I climb out! Sheila runs out...
Dear Grandmother, we are going to a lady's to-day for some tea and some sandwiches, a cake, a biscuit and a scone... We will have to say a blessing first; I think so. I wish I could have that tea now, but I have not had my dinner. Love from'

The INSTINCT for CONSTRUCTION is often found
expressing

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

expressing itself in behaviour that cannot be permitted, and 'DON'T' after 'DON'T' may be heard, if one listens to the mother, nurse or housemaid. However, sometimes it is possible to help a child to see the reason for changing his mode of behaviour; here is a letter from a girl (age 6.4) to her mother, who was away from home:

'Darling, Lovely Mummy,

I hope you are keeping fine, Lovely Mummy.

This afternoon, we are going up the hills. Is it right to put on a clean frock if we are having no coats, when we go up the hills? Nurse put on me a spotted frock, red spots, and green spots; it is a clean frock. And Nurse put on Elspeth a blue frock; it is a clean frock, too ...

For breakfast, Nurse gave us prunes, and porridge, and toast. That's all for just now, darling Mummy.'

Clearly, IMAGINATION ('thinking of remote objects') with REASONING ('which selects ... the features essential to the purpose in hand...') is seen CONSTRUCTING the picture of the future. It would appear that the child will soon have little need for the NEGATIVE TYPE OF PROHIBITION which comes from the outside world in the form of 'DON'T'. But is the CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT to be allowed to continue its activity?

When Education was being discussed (Chapter I), a definition was quoted which may give a true picture of

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

of many schools and homes -- not as the educationist would have them, but as they actually are :

'The provision for suitable instruction to fit the child for the duties of social life';

and 'instruction' is 'the systematic imparting of knowledge to others!'

Professor McDougall, it would sometimes seem, has written in vain of the 'constructive play of little children, their delight in making things, especially caves, houses, and shelters, and their satisfaction in being within such constructions'; and Dr Jung, in vain, of 'the strength of the creative impulse springing from the unconscious' (V: p. 162; and XVII: p. 238).

The Danish Psychologist, Vilhelm Rasmussen, writes: 'The kindergarten must be a TRAINING INSTITUTION ... and not commit the error of diverting the child's evolution from its natural course. The FROEBEL KINDERGARTEN, however, as far as I have been able to judge, is guilty of this error; for it is characterised by the fact that the teacher sets the children to work, showing them what to do and how to do it.'

He goes on to tell of an occasion, when he was watching the 'play' at the Froebel kindergarten in his own centre:

'The

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

'The lady teacher gave out wooden bricks and told the children to build a chair. They did so. But one child, having made a chair in a manner other than prescribed, was reproved by the teacher, who said,

"Now I will show you how to do it".

This, in my estimation, condemned the system of instruction at once. The chair the child constructed was good enough and should have been accepted; nay, more, the child should have been praised for its originality, and the others should have been permitted to understand how a chair could be made in a new manner. This could perhaps have resulted next time in the children constructing thirty DISSIMILAR chairs. The teacher, instead of training novices, was manufacturing imitators. She was in the process of strangling the child's noblest characteristic without for one moment suspecting the crime she was committing, or intending to do otherwise than good' (XVIII: pp. vi-vii).

Yet the teacher no doubt was satisfied that the children were 'constructing'! In the illustration quoted, there is clearly seen the difference between

(i) an environment (provided by the educator) which affords opportunity for activity; and ... (ii) an environment (also provided by the educator)

educator) which permits of the perfecting of the individual 'who must develop according to the laws of his own nature', remembering that in man the instincts (including the INSTINCT for CONSTRUCTION) are not as highly specialized as in (say) the insects, and 'demand' the co-operation of other human endowments, e.g., IMAGINATION, INTELLIGENCE.

This Danish Psychologist contrasts the Froebel Kindergarten, which he visited -- and which his little daughter was attending -- with the system of Dr Maria Montessori, with which he had, however, only a literary acquaintance, 'due chiefly to the study of educational material.' He believes Dr Montessori's methods to be 'far and away better', and mentions that these 'throw the initiative on the child, both in the physical and psychical spheres' of activity; she

THE SYSTEM OF
DR MARIA
MONTESSORI

'rationalises spontaneous "play", and allows an "Edison" to unfold itself in accordance with its latent

talent'. He goes on to speak of the Montessori Kindergarten as 'an epoch-making discovery, an "America" in education.'

From Madame Montessori's own writings, it would appear that she would not approve of the behaviour of the teacher who 'reproved the child' who had 'made a chair in a manner other than prescribed'. Dr Montessori tells us that, if the child makes

mistakes

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

mistakes which he does not notice for himself, the teacher should let him put the material away without correction, and simply show him all over again 'the NEXT TIME HE ASKS HER'.^(a) She says that the child is not interested in understanding things through the medium of others, but has within him 'an uncontrollable urge towards activity which directs him, according to the stage of development he has reached, TO GRASP THINGS FOR HIMSELF', and that 'to gather in by means of sensations, and to express himself in action unceasingly, is the real way of mental work for the child'. She advises us to educate 'by means of noticing what a child is interested in, providing suitable material to satisfy this interest, and giving help only when it is asked'. (XIX). (b)

After a child has started to go to school, it is often found that he has lost his ability to 'amuse himself'. Formerly, he had chosen his own occupations, and had been independent; now he seems to have lost his ability to choose, and stands about helplessly on Saturdays and after school hours, waiting for someone to give him a lead; mothers find that it becomes necessary to provide activities that will occupy the whole of his time; and he appears to have become 'a little imitator, a poor echo'. It is not surprising that many educationists see

in

(a) (b) In teaching 'skills' this has not worked well with adolescents

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

in the methods of the school, the cause of the change. (The methods of training in the Army, as practised in earlier years, appeared to have had a similar effect; the less-disciplined troops from the Dominions compared, in regard to initiative, favourably, it is said).

: :

Teachers often find their pupils liking one subject and disliking another. Woodwork is a subject for which one master finds the students in his evening classes expressing a preference; and the INSTINCT for CONSTRUCTION may account (at least, in part) for this. Another subject, which seems to have a peculiar attraction for many, is Pitman's Shorthand. At first sight, this is surprising; the system seems to be extremely complicated; there are 230 paragraphs or rules, etc., all numbered, and containing numerous 'exceptions', 'contractions', and other special forms; the lines, strokes, circles, hooks, etc., have to be written with accuracy as to size, angle, and weight; the teacher has to be continually correcting, and the 'Mistake Book' and 'Drill Book' mean much weary repetition in writing the same outlines over and over again. A weekly examination (in some classes) seems to be the 'last straw'. Yet the subject is, with

many

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

many students, extremely popular. One writer (who is clearly not himself a Pitman enthusiast) gives, as the reason for the popularity of the system of Sir Isaac Pitman, not only its intrinsic merit and the energy of the inventor, but 'the enthusiasm of his disciples'. This enthusiasm is shared even by some of those who are forced to rush their study of shorthand, having often only twelve months or less in which to become efficient in both this subject and typewriting. To begin with, typewriting is generally the more popular of these 'twin arts', but it is found that zeal for Pitman's shorthand, in the cases of those students who persevere, grows apace. It is difficult to account for this until it is observed that the construction of the outlines for words and phrases requires the exercise of imagination and intelligence, and is 'creative work' in the sense in which the term is being used in this chapter; in short, THE INSTINCT FOR CONSTRUCTION has every opportunity to function.

: :

So OBSERVATION tends to confirm the hypothesis that the ABSENCE OF OPPORTUNITY FOR THE PROPER FUNCTIONING OF THE INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION MILITATES AGAINST SUCCESS IN EDUCATION. It would follow from

this

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

this that the provision of such opportunity should tend to make the education successful.

According to the DEFINITION OF EDUCATION (Chapter I: page 17) the educator must proceed by manipulating the environment, which may include personal forces.

An opening for an EXPERIMENT on these lines was awaited, preferably in connection with GENERAL EDUCATION. The chance came when the Headmaster of a

EXPERIMENT IN
GENERAL EDUCA-
TION

Scottish Public School wished to withdraw from various classes those boys and girls of fourteen and

fifteen years of age who were not working well, and were considered by their teachers to be the 'dregs' of the classes. His primary object was to separate these boys and girls, so that they would not keep back those who wanted to work, and were capable of working. A special teacher was found for the pupils who were segregated; these pupils were not up to standard, and were not supposed to be 'brainy,' but their new teacher found they were good with their hands, and the Art Master set them to work on 'woodcuts', which they did well. Their new teacher desired to arouse their interest, and was ready to carry out an EXPERIMENT, by providing opportunity for ACTIVITY of a kind that would bring into play -- as fully as possible -- the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

in conjunction with intelligence, to supplement the knowledge that they would be able to gather from books or observation.

Problems were found, to answer which the students would have

- (i) to discover facts;
- (ii) to link these facts together;
- (iii) to use their imaginations to augment this body of information;
- (iv) to construct their theories; and
- (v) to set them out on paper.

Each Monday morning a new problem was set out; each Friday, every member of the class set to work to write out in detail his own statement of problem, facts and solution.

An endeavour was made to select questions that had not yet been solved by anyone in the world (to the satisfaction of most people); and that^{involved} occurrences regarding which the students could obtain information. The school was situated close to an important shipping centre, and one of the first problems given to the class had reference to the loss at sea of a steamer built by Messrs. Barclay, Curle & Co., on the Clyde:

'On July 26, 1909, the liner WARATAH, 9,300 tons, with 211 people aboard, left Durban for London, via Capetown.

She

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

'She was due at Capetown on the 29th, but there was no sign of her. No trace of ship, cargo, or wreckage has yet been found, and nothing has yet come to light to solve this great secret of the ocean. One passenger, Mr C. Sawyer, who had booked for England, left the WARATAH at Durban, and transferred to another steamer.

SUPPOSING THAT, THIS WEEK, A BOTTLE HAS BEEN FOUND ON THE ISLAND OF KERGUELEN, AND THAT THIS BOTTLE CONTAINS A DIARY WRITTEN BY A BOY, 15 YEARS OF AGE, AND THAT THIS DIARY SOLVES THE MYSTERY OF THE LOSS OF THE WARATAH,

WRITE THE DIARY'.

The 'NOW-I-WILL-SHOW-YOU-HOW-TO-DO-IT' attitude (of some teachers) was avoided; it became necessary (if the student was to write a good diary)

(i) to find out facts of geography (steamship routes, ports, islands, winds, ocean currents, etc.);

(ii) to obtain some knowledge of naval architecture (the theory that the WARATAH 'turned turtle' before foundering, causing her complement to be trapped, has been put forward);

(iii) to learn what the cargo of the steamer was (mostly Australian produce -- timber, wheat, tallow, butter, wool);

(iv) to use reasoning powers, imagination, and the 'CONSTRUCTIVE DISPOSITION' generally.

The special teacher was available for only six months, but in that time her students had become enthusiasts, with questions that they were eager

to

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

to have answered before Friday, in order that their statement and solution of the week's problem might be as satisfactory as possible.

From an educationist's point of view, the question which it was hoped the experiment would answer was this:

DOES THE PROVISION OF OPPORTUNITY FOR
THE PROPER FUNCTIONING OF THE INSTINCT
OF CONSTRUCTION MAKE THE EDUCATION
SUCCESSFUL?

The special teacher's answer is:

(i) The ultimate aim of Education is moral; and it would not be right to assume that the six months' work had a determining effect on character.

(ii) However, it did give them some happiness, and did show them that it was possible to enjoy school work in a way that they had never anticipated.

(iii) As to their progress, the Head Master was genuinely surprised; he had had 'no time' for them, and was thankful when they were out of the way of the other classes and not hindering good students; but what they did in the six months astonished him.

(iv) The experiment made it clear that there is no need for school to be the place some boys and girls suppose it to be, and that unsatisfactory

pupils

The Constructive Instinct (continued)

pupils can become interested in some of their school work by change of method. However, much that is mere 'drudgery' still remains.

(v) The six months' experience gave the students the knowledge that they could at least do something.

: :

Application to the Theory of Religious Education.

As the individual has inherited a tendency to CONSTRUCT (to put together, to do 'creative work'), selecting in any situation the features essential to his purpose, and using his IMAGINATION to supplement his knowledge; and

as this INSTINCT IN HUMANITY is at a VERY LOW DEGREE OF SPECIALIZATION; and

as the satisfaction of having made something is VERY REAL;

it would seem desirable

(A) that CONSTRUCTION (of a type that would allow scope for the use of INTELLIGENCE and IMAGINATION) should find a place in Religious Education; and -

(B) that an ENVIRONMENT should be provided which would give opportunity for every one -- old and young -- ^{to do} such CONSTRUCTIVE WORK.

Therefore -

(2)(a) THE FOLLOWING ACTIVITIES SEEM NATURAL

FOR

(a) on page 126, the first corollary is noted (1)

The Constructive Instinct (continued) ..(Application)

FOR THE RESPECTIVE STAGES OF DEVELOPMENT,
viz.,

Beginners' Department (for Children
of four and five years of
age)

Free expression of impulsive nature
rather than set form of ser-
vice in Sunday School, with

Music,

Children themselves being allowed
to make the room beautiful
with flowers, pictures, low
tables, chairs, and picture-
books,

Children themselves telling their
news,

Children themselves taking part
in prayers, suggesting 'Thank-
You' subjects,

Building, Drawing, or Looking at
picture-books (as each child
chooses),

Listening to Story (if they wish
to do so),

Singing, when they are all ready
for it

(LEADERS AND TEACHERS to follow
the lead of the children,
giving each freedom to choose
-- as far as is possible)

(ACTIVITY WITH DEFINITE OBJECT OF
EXPRESSING CHRISTIAN PRINCIPLES
IS NOTED LATER)

(XXa)

Primary Department (for Children of
six, seven and eight years
of age)

Expression

The Constructive Instinct (Application ... continued)Primary Department

Expression of Emotions^(a) of
Joy, &c., in

Music (including Hymns)

Prayers

Offertory

Birthday Exercises;

Handwork, following the story;

(all being done more 'decently
and in order' than in the Beginn-
ers' Department)

Children both taking part in the
preparation and tidying of the
room, beautifying it -- as in
Beginners' Department -- and
planning and doing as much as
possible in connection with the
Service;

Carrying the teaching of the less-
on into behaviour at home, at
school, and in playground.

(XXb)

(ACTIVITY, EXPRESSING CHRISTIAN
PRINCIPLES, NOTED LATER)

Junior Department (for Children of
eight plus, nine, ten and
eleven years of age)

As in Primary Department, but
modified for developing boys
and girls

Free Drawing and Colouring (until
child becomes too critical of
own work; then colouring out-
lines, preferably water-colours,
at home)

Picture Plans, Maps, Models,
Written Expression of Story
(letter, summary, diary)

Finding

The Constructive Instinct (Application ... continued)

Finding and Copying Biblical
Texts that have reference to
the teaching of the lesson

Dramatization.

(OTHER ACTIVITY ... noted later)

Intermediate Department (or 'Senior
Department')(for Children of eleven
plus, twelve and thirteen years of
age),

Co-Operative Work, the girls and
boys being treated as 'grown-
up', planning with the teachers,
and sharing, with the teachers,
responsibility,

Criticism of Department's Work
with Constructive Suggestions,

Taking Part in both week-night
and Sunday Activities (mental
and physical, as well as religi-
ous and moral),

Keeping records, preparing maps,
tracings, sketches, &c.,

Discussion,

Expression in life of ideals found
on Sunday.

(XXd)

Senior Department (or 'Junior Bible
Class') for Adolescents from
thirteen years (plus) to sixteen.
and Bible Class (or 'Senior Bible Class')
for Adolescents from sixteen
years (plus)

Discussion and Planning (adapted
to the stage of development now
reached) on lines suggested for
Intermediate Department,

Drama,

Camps,

Organizations

The Constructive Instinct (Application ... continued)

Organizations,

Activities in connection with the
actual work of the Church and
Sunday School,

Helping in Play-Hours or Gymnasias,

Painting Toys, Sending Parcels to
the sick or needy, Repairing
or Making Articles either for
Church or invalids,

Presenting Plays or Concerts
in Hospitals, Workhouses, &c.

&c. &c. &c.

Most of these activities are suggested in the small books (published by the National Sunday School Union, Ludgate Hill, London, and written by such practical educators as Mr E. H. Hayes, Mrs Ethel Archibald Johnston, and Mr Godfrey S. Pain), and, in the gathering of information in connection with this study, nearly every one of them has been seen in actual practice.

But after further consideration of one or two more of the INSTINCTS, it will be seen that something more is required; in this connection, arrangements were made for an experiment (as already mentioned -- page 127); in the last section of this study there is a note on this experiment, which lasted over several years, and was repeated under different conditions.

Meantime, other dispositions fall to be considered.

(c) THE INSTINCT OF SUBMISSION.

Description of the Submissive Instinct.

'Submission' is defined as 'a mode of behaviour in an individual's face-to-face relations with others, characterized by the tendency to yield to others, or to adjust one's behaviour to the domination of others' (II); and 'Submissive' (adjective) as 'disposed or inclined to submit; yielding to power or authority; marked by submission or humble and ready obedience' (III).

Professor R. J. S. McDowall gives examples of the normal, exaggerated, and pathological operation of this impulsion, viz.,

NORMAL.- Clothes, operations, loyalty.

EXAGGERATED.- Feelings of inferiority, guilt, unworthiness, temporary depression, sycophancy.

PATHOLOGICAL.- Delusions of persecution, prolonged depression, melancholia.

The INSTINCT of SUBMISSION is naturally of more than ordinary interest to the 'INDIVIDUAL PSYCHOLOGISTS' who follow the late Dr Alfred Adler. Dr Adler lived in America for some years, and in a book on his work there, a chapter on 'THE TOO DOCILE CHILD' runs into twenty pages. This chapter tells of a boy named Saul. 'When his mother punishes him, he cries a little, but quickly gets over it.' He is eight-and-a-half years old. As to the punishment,

he

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

he says, "All right, you're the boss; you're the mother, you're right." '

Of course, Dr Adler does not see, in this, merely the normal functioning of the IMPULSION OF SUBMISSION. He says that 'the boy's attitude toward punishment is the humble criticism of a weak person'; and, 'it is not wise to make this boy too obedient'.

Dr Adler suggests that the mother should discuss her plans with Saul; that she should never demand anything from him simply because she wants it; that she should take him into her confidence, and even seek his advice. That the boy should not be humiliated, Dr Adler feels, is important.

Clearly, Dr Adler fears that the boy will give up hope, will believe progress to be impossible, and will not trust himself, unless care is taken to see that he is not discouraged and blocked on all sides. (XXI; pp. 207-226).

: :

So much for the dangers which may arise when the SUBMISSIVE URGE in a child is coupled with an exaggerated SELF-ASSERTIVE (or dominating) DISPOSITION in parent, teacher or other person in authority. Professor McDougall, on the other hand, draws attention to another danger.

In his 'Social Psychology', Professor McDougall

couples

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

couples the 'INSTINCT OF SELF-ABASEMENT (OR SUBJECTION)' with the EMOTION OF 'NEGATIVE SELF-FEELING' (OR 'SUBJECTION'), which he classes as a 'PRIMARY EMOTION', and which he describes elsewhere by the adjectives 'humble, meek, submissive, docile' -- these adjectives being used to refer to the 'disposition' of the person in whom the instinct is strong.

Unfortunately, he does not clearly distinguish between

(i) the NORMAL expression, a n d

(ii) the EXAGGERATED operation

of the INSTINCT of SUBMISSION (as is done, following Professor McDowall's classification, on page 157), and therefore has written: 'The impulse of this instinct expresses itself in a slinking, crestfallen behaviour, a general diminution of muscular tone, slow restricted movements, a hanging down of the head, and sidelong glances. In the dog the picture is completed by the sinking of the tail between the legs. All these features express submissiveness, and are calculated to avoid attracting attention or to mollify the spectator' (I; p. 55). He continues:

'The nature of the instinct is sometimes very completely expressed in the behaviour of a young dog on the approach of a larger, older dog; he crouches or crawls with legs so bent that his

belly

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

'belly scrapes the ground, his back hollowed, his tail tucked away, his head sunk and turned a little on one side, and so approaches the imposing stranger with every mark of submission'

(I: p. 55).

Much of this, of course, refers to the 'EXAGGERATED OPERATION' of the instinct, the 'NORMAL EXPRESSION' of which is natural, becoming in every person in the land, and essential for the harmonious working of every organization, be it educational, military or business. In the Army, even in that Corps the individuals of which are highly trained in various skills -- the Royal Engineers -- every sapper obeys promptly each order; in school, implicit obedience

THE NORMAL ACTIVITY
OF THE SUBMISSIVE
INSTINCT

is required; in business, the youth, who has lately left school and who believes he now

is to have 'freedom', finds that he must obey the Despatch Clerk; who, in his turn, obeys the Manager of the Branch or Department; who obeys the instructions of the General Manager; who carries out the directions of the 'Board'; who have to submit to the shareholders; but the shareholders can only act as Regulations (administered by Civil Servants) permit; the Civil Servants themselves are 'servants' under the Government; the Cabinet Ministers themselves are not free, but have to bow to the will of the

majority

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

majority of the Members of Parliament; and these members, finally, must do the bidding of the people -- the Despatch Clerk, the Sapper, and the Sapper's wife -- or the people will, at the next election, return members who will carry out their wishes. (However, each, in his place, also adds something to the instructions which he has received; the school-boy, by the functioning of his CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT, produces a new 'CREATION' -- as illustrated on page 149; so do the others).

Professor McDougall's description, then, is a travesty of the proper functioning of the INSTINCT of SUBMISSION; but when he traces the development of the 'SELF-REGARDING SENTIMENT' of the man of normally unfolding moral nature, he finds an important place for 'THE DISPOSITION OF NEGATIVE SELF-FEELING' (as he happens to be calling this impulsion at the time), and points out that it is the presence of this 'disposition' within the sentiment that 'distinguishes SELF-RESPECT from PRIDE'.

PROFESSOR McDOUGALL:
THE DEVELOPMENT OF
'PRIDE'

'Pride' (taking the 'word in
the narrow and strict sense')
develops when the INSTINCT

of SUBMISSION does not function properly. 'Imagine', he writes (I: p. 166) 'the son of a powerful and

foolish

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

foolish prince ... Suppose that he is never checked, or criticised, but is allowed to lord it over all his fellow-creatures without restraint'. There necessarily develops 'unshakable pride, a pride constantly gratified by the attitudes of deference, gratitude, and admiration, of his social environment; the only dispositions that would become organised in this sentiment of pride would be those of positive self-feeling (or elation) and of anger (for his anger would be invariably excited when any one failed to assume towards him the attitude of subjection or deference)'. Professor McDougall then describes the young man:

'His self-consciousness might be intense and very prominent, but it would remain poor in content; for he could make little progress in self-knowledge; he would have little occasion to hear, or to be interested in, the judgments of others upon himself; and he would seldom be led to reflect upon his own character and conduct'
(I: pp. 165-166)

Professor McDougall mentions the 'only influences that could moralise a man' so brought up -- either

(1) Religious Teaching

('which might give him a sense of a power greater than himself, to whom he was accountable')

or (ii) A very strong natural endowment of the

TENDER EMOTION and its ALTRUISTIC

IMPULSE,

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

'IMPULSE,

or a conjunction of these two influences' (I: p. 166).

But the normal development of a boy, who is morally healthy, would involve the proper functioning of

(1) The Instinct of SUBMISSION, a n d

(11) The Protective (or PARENTAL) Instinct,

with, of course, good

(111) Religious Education -- 'Religion' (in this country, at any rate) implying 'Morality' as well as 'Religion' in the narrower signification of the term.

: :

Unfortunately, Dr Freud, seeing the activity of the INSTINCT of SUBMISSION in conjunction with the activity of other instincts, has, with the aid of the broad term 'LIBIDO', classed AS PART OF 'SEXUAL' ACTIVITY, many types of behaviour, including

(1) ALL SUBMISSION, OBEDIENCE, &c.

(11) ALL TENDER, PROTECTIVE, ALTRUISTIC ACTION,

(111) ALL BEHAVIOUR THAT CAN BE CALLED 'SOCIAL',

as well as other activities which have already been listed in Chapter V (page 80).

Psychologists do not expect to find each instinct operating in its own water-tight compartment, any more than they expect to ^{find} aspects of experience (such as 'feeling', or 'affection'; 'cognition', or 'perceiving'; 'conation', or 'striving') operating singly, apart

from

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

from one another; but some Psychologists have taken care to observe, experiment, and to discuss INSTINCTIVE behaviour (in a way which Dr Freud has not), and it is these Psychologists who can help the educationist most in regard to propensities such as the SUBMISSIVE.

They say that, immediately life begins, it is necessary for the mother and nurse to commence, and 'NOT TO YIELD'; their authority is sustained from both external and internal sources, i.e.,

from simple physical strength, a n d
from the INSTINCT of SUBMISSION innate in
the child.

CONSISTENCY is essential; nurse, mother, father, all must follow the same lines; one day must be every day.

(Aunts, uncles, and others, wishing to earn a place in the 'good books' of the child, may desire to see that the little one has a 'good time', and may even suggest that parents are 'too hard'; this may tend to give the impression, in the mind of the growing girl or boy, that PUBLIC OPINION -- as represented by these relatives from the great world beyond the home -- is not in agreement with the parents' attitude; this is subversion, catastrophe! The strength of the position of parents, teachers, and authorities

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

and authorities in general, lies in this: PUBLIC OPINION SUPPORTS THEIR AUTHORITY).

: :

But, meantime, authorities have had another method by which to sustain their dominating position: THE METHOD OF REWARDS AND PUNISHMENTS.

As to REWARDS, Dr Montessori (in Rome) included the abolition of rewards in her educational programme; and educationists commonly claim that, unless rewards are 'merely the accentuated natural satisfaction appropriate to the actions, they are likely to be STIMULANTS and not NUTRIENTS'; asking the question, DO THE REWARDS STRENGTHEN THE INTERNAL URGES THAT SHOULD NATURALLY BRING ABOUT RIGHT CONDUCT, OR ARE THEY A MERE SUBSTITUTE?

As to punishments, Dr Montessori's method would abolish these also, and there is much support for this. However, in earlier and later INFANCY (0-40 weeks after birth; 40-104 weeks after birth) something in the way either of 'conditioning' or of 'punishment' is, it would seem, necessary. It is undesirable that the infant (or the child, either) should be 'terrorised', either by severe corporal punishment(^{or}_A threats) or (for instance) by being shut up in the dark; but the infant and child must find that certain behaviour is followed by certain painful experiences.

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

experiences.

Under the heading of the IMPULSION, the emotional accompaniment of which is FEAR, methods of dealing with such problems will be further considered, but meantime, it is noted that the PARENT or NURSE has three methods of enforcing obedience, each more or less suitable in connection with the child at a particular stage of development:

- (1) AT EARLY INFANCY: Simple Physical Strength
- (11) AT LATER INFANCY: 'Conditioning', Punishment, and Natural Rewards (strengthening internal urges)
- (III) LATER: PUBLIC OPINION (which seems to be capable of influencing human beings to an extent that is almost unbelievable)
- (iv) ALSO LATER: INTELLIGENCE, the parents' good sense and the child's good sense helping each to the same decision.

Although ages are indicated in connection with 'simple physical strength' and in connection with 'conditioning', etc., much overlapping must take place, one method gradually replacing another, or several methods being employed simultaneously in connection with various types of behaviour.

Throughout, however, the parent (or teacher, or nurse)

The Submissive Instinct (continued)

nurse) knows that there is, innate in the child's nature, the IMPULSION to SUBMIT -- combined with many other impulsions, which have also to be taken into account.

: :

Application to the Theory of Religious Education.

As the INSTINCT of SUBMISSION impels individuals to be susceptible to leadership; a n d

As the GREGARIOUS INSTINCT tends to bring together numbers of human beings and (in conjunction with other innate tendencies) to make it natural for them to take their place among workers in Religious Education; a n d

As the INSTINCT for CONSTRUCTION demands expression in activities that allow scope for INTELLIGENCE and IMAGINATION:

IT WOULD SEEM TO FOLLOW

(A) THAT THE CHRISTIAN WHO IS FIRED WITH ENTHUSIASM FOR THE KINGDOM OF GOD IS NOT COMPELLED TO WORK ALONE, BUT MAY GUIDE A TEAM OR EVEN A VAST ORGANIZATION, IF HE CAN PROVIDE AN ENVIRONMENT (OR 'MANIPULATE THE ENVIRONMENT') SO THAT EACH PERSON MAY HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO CONSTRUCTIVE WORK THAT INVOLVES THE USE OF HIS INTELLIGENCE AND IMAGINATION.

(An experiment has -- as mentioned on pages 127 and

The Submissive Instinct: Application ... (continued)

156 -- been made in this connection; a report of it is included in the last section of this study).

: :

As the TENDENCY of SUBMISSION is innate in each individual, the first requisite is present for the ADJUSTMENTS that are necessary in life, viz.,

(1) The Adjustment to Society --

viz., Adjustment to Parents, Nurse, etc.;

" " School Teachers, Other Children;

" " Others in Business and Social Life;

&c.

Adjustment
to

(11) The Partner in the Home;

" " (111) The Eternal.

(Religion has been defined as 'a practical relationship with God as revealed by Jesus Christ' -- page 32; this 'relationship' involves SUBMISSION to the will of God, i.e., OBEDIENCE).

: :

As 'unshakable pride' would develop if 'THE DISPOSITION OF NEGATIVE SELF-FEELING' is not functioning, there is necessity (in the interests of Religious Education -- the term 'Religious' including also 'Moral') for the CONSISTENT EXERCISE OF AUTHORITY on the part of parents, nurse, teachers, &c., from Earliest Infancy.

: :

As

The Submissive Instinct: Application ... (continued)

As the 'only influences that could moralise a man' of 'unshakable pride' are (i) Religion and (ii) the Tender Emotion, the VALUE OF RELIGION (in the narrower signification of the term) for MORALITY is seen.

: :

As the strength of the edicts of parents, teachers, Church, &c., lies largely in the weight of public opinion that supports their authority, it is desirable that -

- (A) Home, School, Church, State, Press, Literature, Cinema, Broadcasting House, &c., should all speak with one voice; and
- (B) Those Newspapers, Books, Pictures, AND PERSONS, that give the impression that public opinion favours a 'new morality', or a different moral code, SHOULD BE EXCLUDED FROM THE ENVIRONMENT OF THE DEVELOPING CHILD.

(Literature, e.g. Some authors tend to relish 'shocking Mrs Grundy'; others take some new half-truth -- perhaps from psychology -- and elevate it into THE PANACEA; if they contradict generally-accepted dicta of honoured institutions, these authors may be pleased with themselves; but for youth,

The Submissive Instinct: Application ... (continued)

youth, this is serious. 'If the trumpet give an uncertain sound, who shall prepare himself to the battle?' AND IF THE TRUMPETS GIVE CONTRADICTIONARY SOUNDS !)

Parents, Teachers, Church, &c., must, however, take care to discover if the TRUTH that is in the new idea is one to which some of their dogmas must -- sooner or later -- bow.

(An illustration of the clash of ideas is seen in the writings of a Psycho-Analyst, who condemns the clause in the Scout Law that requires the Scout to abstain from the use of undesirable language).

: :

As, after Infancy, the INTELLIGENCE of the child must play a large part in modifying his activities, the Parent, Teacher, Church, &c., should take full advantage of the development of the REASONING POWERS of the child and adolescent. In Sunday School and Bible Class, the building up, by the co-operation of all members of the class, of Creed and of pattern for conduct, should be accompanied by the provision of opportunities to express, both in word and by deed, such Creed and behaviour-pattern.

: :

Mention having been made of the fact that the
child

The Submissive Instinct: Application ... (continued)

child tends to conform (or to 'SUBMIT') to the opinion of others regarding himself, the consideration of this tendency can be postponed until the Pseudo-Instincts have been examined, as they seem to be, in part, responsible for this behaviour.

But, meantime, the 'TENDER EMOTION' (which has already been mentioned -- page 162) falls to be considered.

: :

(d) THE PARENTAL OR PROTECTIVE
INSTINCT.

'Nature's brightest and most beautiful invention' (Professor McDougall); 'Like as a father ... so the LORD' (Psalm 103: 13); 'A mother is a mother still, the holiest thing alive' (Samuel Taylor Coleridge): thus are the instinct and each parent pictured.

Description of the Protective Instinct.

'Parental behaviour' is defined simply as 'Behaviour concerned with the care and protection of the young', in the modern Dictionary of Psychology; such activity is not seen only in parents; but it is in parents that it is seen in great strength (e.g., the mother's protection of her child).

'This instinct ... is the source, not only of parental tenderness, but of

all

The Protective Instinct (continued)

'all tender emotions and truly benevolent impulses, is the great spring of moral indignation, and enters in some degree into every sentiment that can properly be called LOVE' (I: p. 237).

Professor McDougall mentions an assumption that is 'commonly made by writers in the newspapers, viz., THAT, 'UNDER SOME MYSTERIOUS INFLUENCE OF CIVILISATION', there is a 'DECAY OR PROGRESSIVE WEAKENING' OF THIS INSTINCT. There is, he says, no good evidence that any such decay is occurring (I: p. 234).

On the contrary, 'everywhere one may see traces of its influence' to-day, while 'in the ancient classical societies it seems to have played a very restricted part'.

: :

This 'PARENTAL' or 'PROTECTIVE' instinct is distinguished from the other FAMILY INSTINCT (the 'REPRODUCTIVE' instinct) by most psychologists -- though Dr Freud has classed together the two under the heading 'SEXUAL INSTINCT'. It is admitted, however, that 'the social operations and effects of these two instincts are in certain respects so intimately interwoven and blended that they cannot be clearly distinguished' (I: p. 229).

They are easily distinguished in experience,
nevertheless,

The Protective Instinct (continued)

nevertheless 'by the typical primary emotions that accompany their activities, and by the kind of goal secured, or aimed at, by the behaviour that issues from each of them' (XXII: p. 66). The 'PARENTAL' or 'PROTECTIVE' instinct is associated with the 'TENDER' emotion (though Mr A. F. Shand does not recognise the 'TENDER' emotion as primary); the goal aimed at (by the mother) is 'TO PROTECT and CHERISH' her young.

: :

It has been admitted that it is in parents that the PROTECTIVE INSTINCT functions in great strength, but the statement has also been made that 'everywhere one may see traces of its influence'. At first sight, there is here (It would seem) contradiction. Then it is remembered that, in this country, not only do we inherit a set of instincts, but we are also heirs of a Christian tradition, and that the influence of the teaching of Jesus Christ is still strong even among those who are not Church members. 'Some writers would seem to regard the charity and benevolence displayed', indeed, 'as wholly due

THE PROTECTIVE
INSTINCT AND
CHRISTIANITY

to the' teaching of religion. This, however, does not seem to be the whole truth. 'No teaching and no system of social

or

The Protective Instinct (continued)

or religious sanctions could induce benevolence in any people if their minds were wholly lacking in this instinct' (I: p. 237), Professor McDougall writes; he goes on to tell of the influence of 'custom' and 'training', and elsewhere he traces the development of the instinct in a parent, who sees the 'helplessness', 'delicacy', 'distress', of a young child; this 'evokes sooner or later the TENDER EMOTION of the parent', and if the parent does not restrain the

DEVELOPMENT OF
'PROTECTIVE'
BEHAVIOUR

PROTECTIVE IMPULSE, 'it finds its satisfaction in a series of tender acts'. Every time this 'emotion and its impulse are brought into operation, they are rendered more easily excitable in the same way ... Thus all the tender and attracting emotions are repeatedly aroused by this one object ... ;' there comes a time when the child 'learns to reciprocate the parent's sentiment, and, by its expressions of tenderness or gratitude, intensifies the satisfaction of the parental emotions; in so doing it welds the father's sentiment still more strongly' (I: p. 142).

As, also, 'the parent is apt to identify the child with himself in a peculiarly intimate way', the purely altruistic sentiment becomes fused with the extended 'SELF-REGARDING SENTIMENT', and the

PARENTAL

The Protective Instinct (continued)

'PARENTAL SENTIMENT' in its completest form is the result (I: pp. 142-143).

The 'TENDER EMOTION' is, then, ^{evoked} in a human being by the sight of the helpless child; Or (to use the phrases found in the definition of INSTINCT)

THERE IS AN INNATE PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION

WHICH DETERMINES THE INDIVIDUAL TO PER-
CEIVE, AND TO PAY ATTENTION TO,

A HELPLESS CHILD,

AND TO ACT IN A PROTECTIVE MANNER IN
REGARD TO THAT CHILD

(OR TO EXPERIENCE AN IMPULSE SO TO ACT)

AND TO FEEL TENDER EMOTION
IN CONNECTION WITH THE IMPULSE
(OR THE ARREST OF IT)

(cf. page 120-).

The 'widespread prevalence of infanticide among existing savages' only confirms this statement, as (it is said: I: p. 60) 'an infant is only killed during the first hours of its life. If the child is allowed to survive but a few days, then its life is safe; the TENDER EMOTION has been called out in fuller strength, and has begun to be organised into a sentiment of PARENTAL LOVE that is too strong to be overcome by prudential or purely selfish considerations'.

So far, only the development of LOVE for a

single

single child has been explained; but the Christian is required 'To brother all the souls on earth'(a). How do his sympathies broaden? In the poem, the line is found,-

.... 'I knew that Christ had given me birth' in explanation of this; but can Psychologists give any explanation of the development in the individual of broader sympathies, or tell how a person is prepared, by the unfolding of inherent propensities, for the experience called CONVERSION? (For Religious Education is interested not only in the CRISIS, but in the whole process of moral and spiritual growth).

Professor McDougall states that, in the human being, there does actually take place 'a vast extension of the field of application of the maternal instinct'. He accounts for this by the similarity of various objects to 'the primary or natively given object'; that is, if the 'natively given object' is 'the helplessness, delicacy, distress of a young child', the TENDER EMOTION and its PROTECTIVE IMPULSE may be evoked (in a highly developed mind) by the

EXTENSION OF
THE FIELD OF
APPLICATION OF
THE PROTECTIVE
INSTINCT

mere sight or thought of a child,
though the child may be perfectly
happy; its 'liability to a
thousand different ills' may

'suggest to the mind its need of protection.'

'By a further extension of the same kind, the

emotion

(a) From THE EVERLASTING MERCY, by John Masefield.

The Protective Instinct (continued)

'emotion may be evoked by the sight of any very young animal, especially if in distress... and indeed it would be easy to wax enthusiastic in the cause of an instinct that is the source of the only entirely admirable, satisfying, and perfect human relationship, as well as of every kind of purely disinterested conduct' (I: p. 63).

Although the INSTINCT is the inborn impulsion, without doubt PROTECTIVE BEHAVIOUR has been both broadened and deepened by the teaching and practice of Jesus Christ -- the Christian ideal which has for so long been held up before our eyes.

: :

Application to the Theory of Religious Education.

As the 'PARENTAL OR PROTECTIVE INSTINCT' is
'source of

'all tender emotions',

all 'truly benevolent impulses',

'moral indignation',

'LOVE' ('the only entirely admirable,
satisfying and perfect human
relationship')

'every kind of purely disinterested
conduct',

&c.,

IT FOLLOWS THAT

(A) THE ENVIRONMENT SHOULD BE MANIPULATED SO
THAT

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

THAT OPPORTUNITY IS GIVEN THE INDIVIDUAL
TO PERCEIVE AND TO PAY ATTENTION TO
A HELPLESS CHILD, OR
A HELPLESS ELDERLY PERSON (OR INVALID),
AND TO ACT IN REGARD TO THAT CHILD, ELDERLY
PERSON, OR INVALID,
IN SUCH A MANNER AS THE 'PROTECTIVE' (OR
'PARENTAL' INSTINCT DICTATES,
so as to strengthen the IMPULSE of this INSTINCT, and
to broaden the outlook of the individual.

: :

The question arises, Should such opportunities
be given to children, or to adults and adolescents
also?

Before answering, it is necessary to take note
of two facts:

(1) That this instinct, in man, functions
over a very wide realm indeed. Nature 'has pushed
her greatest invention, the PARENTAL INSTINCT, for
'all it is worth'. Professor McDougall sees its
working in a father, who hands to his son, a cheque,
believing the son to be a good student, and that a
post-graduate course of study will 'really further
his intellectual development' (V: p. 134). The
purpose of the instinct is not only to protect the
young

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

young from danger, but to provide an environment that makes for the unfolding of their capacities and for their happiness.

(11) That, although there is an increase in the strength of the TENDER EMOTION and the PROTECTIVE IMPULSE at the age of ADOLESCENCE, yet an observer, watching a child with a doll or with a younger child, will see behaviour that will justify him in regarding the parental instinct as already operative. Such incidents as the following can often be noticed:

A little girl (aged three years and two months) travelling in an L. M. S. day train from London, had a corner seat on the right hand (Eastern) side of the coach. She had never before been in the North, and between Preston and Carlisle she became excited, as she saw the hills rising more abruptly than the gentle slopes of the South, and as she noticed a fast stream rushing down the valley. As she gazed, she turned, took up her doll (a very large one), and placed its face against the window pane, holding it there for a long time, and clearly believing that the doll was seeing the wonderful sights. The fact that the presence of the doll spoiled her own view of the scene was outweighed, apparently, by

the

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

the strength of the PARENTAL INSTINCT.

Seeing, then, (1) that this instinct impels the individual not only to protect the weak, but also to help them in many ways, and (11) that this instinct appears to be functioning in childhood, it would seem desirable that

OPPORTUNITIES SHOULD BE GIVEN TO CHILDREN

BOTH TO PERCEIVE THOSE WHO ARE HELPLESS

AND TO ACT AS THE INSTINCT DICTATES.

By experiment and observation it has been found that the results are usually satisfactory. However, in one isolated case, where a little girl (then four years of age) wished to see an elderly lady of whom she was fond, the result was disappointing. Although the nurse admitted the child and her father, and although there were no distressing signs, it was clear that the lady was 'not long for this world'. Even the child sensed something, and gazed sadly in silence. She was told:

CHILD AT A
'SICK BED'

'Mrs Hunter is very tired';

'Not "tired", Daddy, not "tired"', she replied. She knew it was not mere physical tiredness; and after she had left the room, she was depressed.

: :

The PROTECTIVE INSTINCT so works in parents that
they

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

they are at their very best, in religion and morality, when their children are concerned.

For instance, one hard-worked medical practitioner had been irregular in his Church attendance; but, when his son was about three years of age, the doctor said to his minister: 'For the sake of that boy, I must be regularly in my pew'.

The instinct may work in young men and young women, who are not parents, in the same way. One elder brother said, when it was suggested by some of his friends, that they should enjoy certain amusements: 'For myself, NO! I have to think of the youngsters'.

The PARENTAL INSTINCT, then, brings both PARENTS and many YOUNG MEN AND WOMEN to the aid of the educator.

: :

At the foot of page 167, reference is made to an experiment which is also mentioned on pages 127 and 156; the impulsions (of the child and adolescent) which were taken into consideration when arrangements for this experiment were being made, included the 'PARENTAL INSTINCT'. It was seen that, while teaching in Sunday School was a suitable activity in connection with the expression of this INSTINCT,

many

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

many young men and women were not fitted for this work; and it was desired to find work for which they were fitted, and which would permit of the satisfactory functioning of the following innate impulses:

The Gregarious (Herd, or Social) Instinct,

The Instinct of Construction, a n d

The Protective or Parental Instinct.

In the GREAT PUBLIC SCHOOLS of England -- and of some other countries -- a PREFECT SYSTEM was working well, and it was suggested that a similar system might be successful with the young people of the Church.

The Minister and Kirk Session of a large Church were approached; they granted permission for the carrying out of an experiment on these lines:

The Charge (or Parish) to be divided into five districts, with two senior and two junior prefects in charge of each district; these four prefects to be a committee for the well-being of the children of the parish who resided in their particular district.

All the prefects of all the districts, meeting together, to form a council, which would elect its own leader (who would be chairman) and deputy leader, treasurer, and secretaries; this council to be allowed to meet on one evening every week

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

week in the Church hall, and to have the sole use of one of the Church rooms, where the whole of the records of the prefects would be kept, and where the secretaries and leader would have permanent tables.

(iii) The prefects to be at liberty to encourage attendance at forenoon worship of all children, and their parents, and to give to each child each Sunday a coloured stamp as he entered the Church.

(iv) The prefects to be free to visit every house in the parish, in the name of the 'League of Worship' of the Church, but not to have access to elders' books, Sunday School rolls, or any other of the Church records, it being understood that the prefects would, by house-to-house visitation (or in any other way they could devise) discover the children who should be connected with the Church. On their part, the minister and elders agreed that neither they themselves nor any official of the Church would expect to be represented at the meetings of the council, but that they would leave the prefects free to make their own plans, and carry them out to the best of their ability.

(v) The whole of the cost (of picture stamps, stamp albums -- specially printed and containing a picture of the Church building --, office equipment, refreshments, etc., etc.) to be paid by the prefects

themselves

The Protective Instinct: Application ... (continued)

themselves.

: :

The way was now open for the prefects to practise activities, which (whether they looked at their opportunity from a psychological point of view or not)^(a) would give them a chance to develop their capabilities and which would allow of the functioning of their

CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT (with full scope
for the use of INTELLIGENCE and
IMAGINATION),

GREGARIOUS (or SOCIAL) INSTINCT (with
co-operative work under leadership),
and

PARENTAL INSTINCT (which would impel them
not only to protect, but to promote
the development and happiness of the
young and weak).

(The working out of this experiment is included in
the last section of this study).

: :

Meantime, there are several 'pseudo-instincts'
or 'non-specific innate tendencies' which have a
bearing on the Theory of Religious Education, and
these 'pseudo-instincts' are now to be examined.

: : : :

(a) Only those who planned the experiment were
students of psychology; those who carried it out
were interested in the welfare of the children only.

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN
MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

- I 'An Introduction to Social Psychology' by Wm. McDougall,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD. F.R.S.
23rd Edition, 1936
(first published, 1908)
- II 'Dictionary of Psychology' edited by Howard C.
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & Warren
UNWIN LTD.
1935
- III 'The Shorter Oxford English Dictionary on
Historical Principles'
OXFORD: CLARENDON PRESS
2nd Edition, 1936.
- IV 'A Biological Introduction to Psychology for Stud- by R.J.S. McDowall,
ents and Practitioners of Medicine' M.D., D.Sc.,
LONDON: JOHN MURRAY Prof. of Physio-
1941 Coll., Univ. of
London.
- V 'An Outline of Psychology' by Wm. McDougall,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LD. F.R.S.
2nd Edition, 1924
(first published, 1923)
- VI 'Instinct in Man' by Jas. Drever, M.A.,
CAMBRIDGE: UNIVERSITY B.Sc., D.Phil.
PRESS
- VII 'Modern Man in Search of a Soul' by C. G. Jung
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
1934
- VIII 'Commonsense in Education and Teaching' by P. A. Barnett,
LONDON: LONGMANS, GREEN M.A.
& CO.
5th Edition, 1913.
- IX 'A Modern Philosophy of Education' by G.H. Thomson,
LONDON: GEO. ALLEN & Bell Professor of
UNWIN, LTD. Education,
2nd Impression 1931 University of
(first published 1929) Edinburgh
- X 'New Psychology...

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS ... (continued)

- X 'The New Psychology and the Teacher' by H. Crichton Miller,
LONDON: JARROLD'S M.A., M.D., Hon.
(Publishers) Ltd. Director,
4th Impression, 1923. Tavistock Clinic
for Functional
Nerve Cases
- XI 'Psychological Types, or The Psychology of Individuation' by C. G. Jung
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.LD.
1926
- XII 'An Outline of Abnormal Psychology' by Wm. McDougall,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD. F.R.S.
1926
- XIII 'Moral Principles in Education' by John Dewey, Prof.
BOSTON &c.: HOUGHTON of Philosophy,
MIFFLIN COY. Columbia Uni-
versity
1909
- XIV 'An Introduction to the Psychology of Religion' by Robert H. Thouless,
CAMBRIDGE: UNIVERSITY M.A., Ph.D.
PRESS
2nd edition reprinted
1936 (first published
1923)
- XV 'Energies of Men' by Wm. McDougall,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO.LD. F.R.S.
4th edition 1939
(first published 1932)
- XVI 'Everyman's Psychology' by Sir John Adams
LONDON: UNIVERSITY OF
LONDON PRESS, LTD.
1929
- XVII 'Contributions to Analytical Psychology' by C. G. Jung
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.
LTD.
1928

XVIII: 'Child ...

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS ... (continued)

- XVIII 'Child Psychology' by Vilhelm Rasmussen
 'II: The Kindergarten
 Child'
 LONDON, COPENHAGEN, &c.
 GYLDENDAL
 (not dated)
- XIX 'The Quiver' for May Article: 'Your Child
 1933 Must Keep His
 LONDON: CASSELL Secret'
 & Co. by Maria Montessori,
 M.D., D.LITT.
- XXa 'What is the Beginners' Department?' (leaflet)
 XXb 'The Encyclopædia of Sunday Schools and
 Religious Education': NEW YORK: THOS.
 NELSON & SONS: 1915.
- XXc 'More About the Junior Department' by Ethel
 Archibald Johnston
- XXd 'More About the Senior Department' by Godfrey
 S. Pain
 (XXa, XXc, XXd: LONDON: NATIONAL SUNDAY
 SCHOOL UNION: all not dated)
- XXI 'The Pattern of Life' by Alfred Adler
 LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
 TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO.
 LTD. 1931.
- XXII 'Psychology: The by Francis Aveling,
 Changing Outlook' D.Lit., D.Sc., Ph.D.
 LONDON: WATTS & CO. Prof. of Psycho-
 1937 logic, University
 of London
- XXIII 'Child Psychology, Vol.1) by Vilhelm Rasmussen
 LONDON: GYLDENHAL)
 (& COPENHAGEN)
 1920
- XXIV 'Psychology' by William James
 LONDON: Macmillan
 & Co. Ltd.
 1892
- XXV 'A Study of Conversion' by L. Wyatt Lang, M.A.
- XXVI 'Practice and Theory by Alfred Adler
 of Individual (Vienna)
 Psychology'
 LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
 TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LD.
 1924

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS (continued)

- XXVII 'The Psychology of Character' by A. A. Roback
LONDON: KEGAN PAUL,
TRENCH, TRUBNER & CO. LTD.
1927
- XXIX 'Abnormal Psychology:
Its Concepts and Theories' by H.L.Hollingworth,
Ph.D., Prof. of
Psychology,
LONDON: METHUEN & CO. LTD. Barnard Coll.,
1931 Columbia Univ.
- XXVIII 'The British Journal of Psychology' Article: The Rela-
General Section tion of Acts
April, 1933 & Contents of
Consciousness
by C. S. Myers
- XL 'Psychology' by William James
(same as XXIV)
- L 'Practical Theology' by J. J. Van
LONDON: HODDER & Oosterzee, D.D.
STOUGHTON
1878

CHAPTER IX

SOME NON-SPECIFIC INNATE TENDENCIES

IMITATION

SUGGESTION

SYMPATHY

: :

CHIEF JUSTICE:

God send the prince a better
companion!

FALSTAFF:

God send the companion a better
prince!

-- Shakespeare

(King Henry IV, Part
II: 1; 11: 227)

CHAPTER · IX :

SOME NON-SPECIFIC INNATE TENDENCIES

An INSTINCT has been defined (page 120) as a 'PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSION, WHICH DETERMINES THE ORGANISM TO PERCEIVE, AND TO PAY ATTENTION TO, OBJECTS OF A CERTAIN CLASS, TO EXPERIENCE AN IMPULSE TO ACT IN A PARTICULAR MANNER IN REGARD TO SUCH OBJECTS ... ' Also the AFFECTIVE STATE or EMOTION is 'OF SPECIFIC QUALITY' and the IMPULSE is 'TOWARDS SOME SPECIFIC END'.

However, there are other 'PSYCHO-PHYSICAL IMPULSIONS', which are also 'INNATE', but which have not the 'SPECIFIC' characters that are to be observed in a true INSTINCT. These are sometimes called 'PSEUDO-INSTINCTS' or 'GENERAL INNATE TENDENCIES' or 'INHERITED NON-SPECIFIC PROPENSITIES'.^(a) Three may be mentioned as of importance for Religious Education, viz., IMITATION, SUGGESTION, and SYMPATHY. Of these Professor McDougall writes (I: p. 77):

'They are closely allied as regards their effects, for in each case the process in which the tendency manifests itself involves an interaction between at least two individuals, one of whom is the agent, while the other is the person acted upon or patient;

and

(a) PROPENSITY is defined as 'a strong tendency toward some given action or more of behaviour, whether due to inheritance or to habit'(II)

'and in each case the result of the process is some degree of assimilation of the actions and mental state of the patient to those of the agent. They are three forms of mental interaction' (of impression and reception) 'of fundamental importance for all social life'.

: :

IMITATION.

Although Professor Drever does not see that the facts warrant the statement that there is no general INSTINCTIVE TENDENCY of IMITATION (VI: p. 231), Professor McDougall gives reasons for not including IMITATION among his list of INSTINCTS (I: p. 88; V: p. 173), and points out

(1) That imitative actions are extremely diverse; every kind of action may be imitated;

(11) That there is great variety in the sense impressions that excite the movements.

However, the impulse to imitate is admittedly CONNATE; and there are cognitive and conative aspects (attention; striving), although the affective state is not an outstanding feature, either during the action or as a result of the impulse being arrested.

Further, all gregarious animals (Professor McDougall writes) have 'in some measure the

tendencies

tendencies of primitive sympathy, which lead them to behave as they perceive their fellows doing, to flee when they flee, to approach cautiously when they approach, and so on' (V: pp. 173-174). Without

using the word 'INSTINCT', then, IMITATION
IMITATION
DEFINED may be said to be 'the process of performing an act, which act is stimulated by the observation of similar behaviour in another person or animal'.

: :

SYMPATHY AND SUGGESTIBILITY.

There is not only a tendency to imitate behaviour; there are also

(1) A TENDENCY TO IMITATE FEELING (this form of imitation is called 'SYMPATHY', sympathy being defined as 'the supposed tendency to repeat in oneself any emotion observed in another' -- II);

a n d

(2) A TENDENCY TO IMITATE BELIEF (this tendency may be called 'SUGGESTIBILITY', i.e., the inducing in another of an idea or belief, not by logical reasoning, but through stimulation, whether verbal or otherwise ¶ -- II).

In other words, whereas copying another in ACTION may be termed IMITATION, copying another in FEELING is called SYMPATHY, and copying another in COGNITION (in knowledge) is called SUGGESTION.

(However, not every psychologist is particular

in

in observing these distinctions; Dr Crichton Miller, for instance, writes: 'Suggestion may be defined as the attainment of a state of mind or the execution of an act upon an inadequate rational basis' -- X: p. 34).

: :

What are the conditions of this imitation, sympathy, suggestibility?

Before answering this question, another arises: To which style of imitation does the question refer? Dr Drever distinguishes three types:

- (1) Perceptual (which is purely 'instinctive')
- (ii) Ideational (which is not necessarily imitation at the moment when the action imitated is perceived)
- (iii) Rational or 'deliberative' (VI: pp.232-3)

It is with the second type that Dynamic Psychology is chiefly concerned, this type having been less understood at the time when INTROSPECTION was the main method of the psychologists; and it is important, for the Theory of Religious Education, to discover the circumstances in which 'ideational imitation' takes place.

: :

CONDITIONS OF IDEATIONAL IMITATION.

There seem to be three important conditions of ideational imitation.

- (1) One condition Professor Drever has stated

in logical form:

'IMITATION' will certainly depend on 'ATTENTIVE-
NESS'

'ATTENTION' will be determined by some 'INTEREST'

h e n c e

'IMITATION' will be of behaviour which is 'INTER-
ESTING'

and presumably 'interesting' because of its appeal to
'INSTINCTIVE TENDENCIES' (VI: p. 231).

: :

(2) A SECOND CONDITION OF IMITATION: THE
TENDENCY IS TO IMITATE ONE'S SUPERIORS, RATHER THAN
ONE'S INFERIORS.

'Negative Self-Feeling', in other words, 'will
favour' imitativeness (provided always that the superior-
ity is not too great, for then it would cause wonder
rather than simple admiration) -- VI: p. 234.

Professor McDougall writes:

'Whatever quality of a person ... makes
him seem to you powerful, or, as we
significantly say, impressive, whatever
lends prestige (whether
mere size,
an air of confidence,
of energy,
of competence,
a piercing eye,
costly apparel,
social position,
past achievements,
or great reputation known to you)
adds to his power of exerting suggestion
upon you'

(XV: p. 253).

: :

(3) A third condition of IMITATION: THE

INTRINSIC

INTRINSIC VALUE OF THE CONDUCT, FEELING OR BELIEF of the one who is to be the pattern.

'Ideas and purposes that belong to the higher levels of the mental life of the community', Dr Crichton Miller writes, 'gradually percolate down, and multiply and enrich their content'. He instances the conquest, by a great scientific conception, of

INTRINSIC VALUE OF THE FEELING OR BELIEF	popular thought, and the gradual progress and final triumph of a political or religious truth, held, at first, by only a small and probably despised minority (X: p. 203).
--	--

: :

So far, mention has been made only of that form of IMITATION which is conscious. But PSYCHO-ANALYSIS recognises an 'UNCONSCIOUS IMITATION', which is

termed 'IDENTIFICATION'.

'IDENTIFICATION'
OR 'UNCONSCIOUS
IMITATION'

'IDENTIFICATION' is defined as

'an unconscious mental process
which expressed itself in the form of an emotional
tie with other persons or situations, in which the
subject behaves as if he were the person with whom
he has the tie' (II).

This, Dr Jung tells us, may be progressive. The individual way may not yet be available, and the purpose of the IDENTIFICATION may be to proceed after the manner of the other individual -- FOR THE PRESENT (XI: pp. 551-552).

This

This has its dangers; and a warning note must be sounded before passing from the Theory of these 'TENDENCIES'. The copying of a leader may result in good actions, feelings, and beliefs, but may, nevertheless, be unsatisfactory, in that it may prevent the development of a suitable individual method, and consequently hinder the unfolding of the powers of the individual imitator himself -- who is ONLY FOLLOWING HIS GUIDE. Dr Jung makes this clear (XI: p. 551).

In defining Education, it was seen that the person to be educated was a 'LIVING ORGANISM', and that he must develop according to the principles of his own nature; further, that it is the business of an educator to provide an environment that promotes satisfactory growth, that enables inherent potentialities to unfold (a). Some people (as Dr Crichton Miller has pointed out -- X: p. 39) are 'ultra-

SOME PEOPLE ARE 'ULTRA-SUGGESTIBLE' suggestible'; they continue to accept authority (or the leading of another or of others) in a 'childish' way; they respond 'inevitably to the opinion of the majority.' They may come to hold most admirable opinions; they may appear to be the very pillars of orthodoxy; but they hold their beliefs in a precarious and unsatisfactory way.

Some

(a) It is said that foreign missionaries are given this piece of advice: Never do anything yourself that a native can do half as well. I.E., EDUCATE THE NATIVE.

Some free-thinkers, who may be proud of what they believe to be their independence of thought, are, nevertheless, no doubt free-thinkers simply because they have responded, as 'ultra-suggestible' people do, all too easily to opinions held by someone in their immediate surroundings.

: :

The manner in which a suitable individual method may be over-shadowed by the functioning of the PSEUDO-INSTINCTS (imitation, suggestion, &c.) is illustrated by the beliefs of a little girl. At the age of 3 years 10 months, she watched carefully during the Christmas season, and spent her time making a study of the phenomena, exploring^{for}_A (AND FINDING!) the gown of Santa Claus, and actually seeing, through a window, a man carrying away the Christmas tree. The reindeer she did NOT see; nor did she find any chimney capable of fulfilling its supposed purpose. Having apparently weighed all the evidence and found it wanting, she announced, after Christmas was over, to her father: 'OO, Father Christa!' (YOU, Father Christmas!). Yet, four years later (age 7.10), having meantime spent nearly three years at school, mixing with children who firmly believed in the reality of Father Christmas, she was accepting the current theories!

: :

Application

Application to the Theory of Religious Education.

As 'IMITATION' will be of behaviour which is interesting -- and presumably interesting because of its appeal to specific instinctive tendencies'

IT WOULD SEEM TO FOLLOW THAT

(I) IT BECOMES THE CONCERN OF THE PREACHER TO UNDERSTAND THE INSTINCTIVE PROPENSITIES OF HIS HEARERS, so that he may build upon them the structure of which he dreams (or, rather -- for he is an (a) educator, not a stone-mason -- that the members of his congregation may 'grow' into perfect manhood) 'a perfect man ... the measure of the stature of the fulness of Christ' (Ephesians iv: 13).

: :

As the 'tendency is to imitate one's superiors, rather than one's inferiors', the preacher, as well as understanding the instinctive nature of his hearers, should be himself a man of deep spirituality, and should be, in other respects, one to whom others will look up, i.e., an eminent man intellectually and in as many other ways as may be possible.

: :

As a 'condition (for ideational imitation, for sympathy, for suggestibility) is the intrinsic value of the conduct, feeling, or belief of the one who

is

(a) Remembering definitions of Education (Chapter I), e.g., 'By Education I mean the influence of the environment upon the individual to produce' &c.

is to be the pattern,

IT WOULD SEEM TO FOLLOW THAT

(2) THE MESSAGE OF THE MINISTER SHOULD HAVE --
FOR HIS CONGREGATION -- ESSENTIAL VALUE

'The minister must never forget that he has been trained to look at things from a point of view that is different from that of most members of his congregation', Dr Hywel Hughes writes (XXIII: p. 109).

'The message .. should have essential value,' and yet the minister finds 'dry periods, when ideas refuse to come and the mind and soul seem barren!'
'What then?' Dr Hywel Hughes asks. He answers:
'The only way to master the barren periods and to transform them into means of greater fruitfulness is by more intense concentration and greater openness of soul to God' (XXIII: p. 106).

: :

In regard to the POSSIBILITIES in connection with 'IDENTIFICATION' (or 'UNCONSCIOUS IMITATION'), it may be difficult for the minister to see how he
THE MINISTER AND
'IDENTIFICATION' can prepare himself to benefit his people through this channel, except by preparation in the ways already noted in connection with conscious imitation; nevertheless, having so equipped himself for his work in general, he may find that he has become so fitted that this

'IDENTIFICATION'

'IDENTIFICATION' (or 'UNCONSCIOUS IMITATION') is an important factor in his work.

: :

It has been pointed out that, as it is but natural that the minister should be the 'agent' and that members of the congregation should assimilate in some degree his mental state, he should be himself

a man of deep spirituality, and

in other respects one to whom others
will look up,

and that his message should have intrinsic value.

What has been said of the minister applies, also, to each parent, Sunday School teacher, leader of organisation, elder, deacon, elder brother -- in fact, to all Church members.

: :

An example of the quiet effective working of the 'PSEUDO-INSTINCTS' ('IMITATION', &c.) was seen in the case of a little girl who came from the South in 1939 to a Scottish country manse. She sang tune-fully, but she did not know all the words of some of her little songs. However, this did not trouble her; she had one word which she substituted (with the addition of 'Oh' or 'it') for all the words that she did not remember; the word was one never before heard in the manse, 'DAMN!' She filled out each line glibly, singing away:

"Damn it, O damn it! O damn, damn, damn'.

Not

Application ... to Religious Education (continued)

Not the slightest indication was given by anyone that there was anything unusual about the word; but the effect on a younger child was awaited with interest. However, a change occurred very soon. The little girl (age 3 years 2 months) was particularly fond of music, and she would slip quietly into the Church, and sit in silence for long periods, if the organ were being played. Sometimes, she found herself listening to a Sunday afternoon choir practice. The choir was

WORKING IN CHILD
OF PSEUDO-INSTINCT
OF IMITATION

a good one, but many of the members sang from the Sol-fa notation, and practised new tunes, using 'Doh, Me, Sol, La' and other such syllables. Soon, the girl was singing her tunes to 'La, Sol, Doh', etc., though it was clear that she did not grasp the fact that each of these syllables generally represented a note of the major scale, and only one particular note. Now, when she did not know a word or a line of any song, she substituted Sol-fa syllables, and 'Damn' has never been heard again.

: :

The fact that individuals actually do imitate each other's actions, and do accept each other's ideas and beliefs, has been recognised by men of many nations: the 'proverbs' of various races

make this

Application ... to Religious Education (continued)

make this clear: the phrase now most commonly used in this country ('A man is changed by the company he keeps') in order to express the truth, seems to have come to us from the Greeks; St Paul wrote:-

'Bad company is the ruin of good character'
(1 Cor. xv: 33 -- Dr James
Moffatt's Translation);

The Earl of Chesterfield (eighteenth century):-

'Take the tone of the company that you
are in';

and Shakespeare makes one of his characters say:

'Company, villainous company, hath been
the spoil of me'
(King Henry IV, Part I:
iii: iii: line 10)

Simon Peter, in the company of his Master and the
disciples, is a strong man for Christ:

'Though I have to die with you, I will
never disown you'
(S. Mark Xiv: 31 -- Dr James
Moffatt's Translation)

b u t

Simon Peter, in the company of those who do not
acknowledge Jesus Christ as their master, does not
acknowledge Him either:

'I don't know the man you mean'
(S. Mark xiv: 71 -- Dr
Moffatt's Translation)

Biographies confirm the truth; and psychology but
reiterates it, and tries to discover the conditions
of its operation -- which have already been con-
sidered.

It

Application ... to Religious Education (continued)

It only remains to look at the question: 'If I am changed by the company I keep, and others are changed by keeping my company, how can there ever be any spiritual or moral advancement? Must not all move in circles, bringing the world ever back to the same moral level as before?'

Some men keep not only the company of other men: 'personal fellowship with God' was seen to be of the essence of Religion (page 27); 'here we are at the centre: it is the meeting of spirit and spirit ... God and the soul have met'; and 'a man is changed by the company he keeps'---'by the Company he keeps'.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN
MADE IN THIS CHAPTER:

page 185-187.

(The same list has been used for Chapter IX as for Chapter VIII, as the subjects are similar).

CHAPTER X

SOME TROUBLESOME INSTINCTS

: :

: :

(a) THE INSTINCT OF PUGNACITY

(b) THE INSTINCT OF CURIOSITY

(c) THE INSTINCT OF ESCAPE

(d) THE INSTINCT OF SELF-
ASSERTION

: :

' I'm afraid you've got a bad egg, Mr Jones. '

' Oh no, my Lord, I assure you! Parts of
it are excellent '

-- London 'PUNCH'

(Vol. cix, p. 222:
1895).

CHAPTER X :

SOME TROUBLESOME INSTINCTS

The instincts that have been examined in Chapter VIII, and the Non-Specific Tendencies that have been considered in Chapter IX, have all been of such a nature that the educationist can plan an environment to permit of their normal expression furthering his purposes. But there are instincts that give him cause for anxiety. One of these is the Instinct of Pugnacity.

(a) INSTINCT OF PUGNACITY.

Description of the Instinct of 'Combat' or 'Pugnacity'

'PUGNACITY' is defined as 'an instinct or innate tendency to fight or quarrel with other individuals'.
(II).

'Combat' = 'an encounter or fight between two persons (parties, animals, etc.).

This is the impulsion of aggression; and the corresponding emotion is ANGER, RAGE, FURY (or, more mildly felt, ANNOYANCE, IRRITATION, DISPLEASURE).

Here, then, is an INNATE DISPOSITION that makes for wars, and arouses the very emotions against which we are specially warned.

(Matthew's Gospel, v: 22: '... every one who is angry with his brother shall be in danger ...' -- REVISED VERSION.

Epistle of Paul to the Colossians iii: 8:
'But now put ye also away all these;
anger, wrath, malice, railing ...' REV.VERS.)

Instinct of Pugnacity (continued)

Little help is likely to be given to Religious Education by the normal expression of the instinct; much is said about 'righteous anger', but much anger is not 'righteous'. What can the educator do?

'Wise guidance and control' is suggested by Professor Aveling, who says that 'control is generally learned and secured through the painful experience of giving way to rage without effect', and that the child 'soon' learns, by discovering for himself 'that CONTROL OF ANGER exhibitions of anger and tantrums do not pay, and so holds himself in check' (XXII: p. 97).

Professor McDougall notes that 'a soft answer turneth away wrath'. No doubt, it turns away the 'wrath' of each party, for who could give a soft answer when angry? Training could, then, be positive, i.e., a child could be schooled to give the 'soft answer'.

Also, the PUGNACIOUS or COMBATIVE URGE might find expression in sport. (It is possible for some other tendencies, which cannot, in professional, business, or social life, be allowed to function, also to come to light in recreation; e.g., the tendency to act in a wily, cunning way; on the cricket field the 'googly' bowler is admired; on the football ground, the greatest hero is often the player

Instinct of Pugnacity (continued)

player who manages most often to deceive an opponent).

The question as to whether the educator should himself say (as regards ANGER and COMBAT, e.g.) 'THOU SHALT NOT' to the child, and as to whether the educator should encourage the child to say to himself, 'I MUST NOT', may be held over until several other instincts have been discussed, e.g., the INSTINCT OF CURIOSITY, the INSTINCT OF ESCAPE, and the INSTINCT OF self-DISPLAY.

: :

(b) INSTINCT OF CURIOSITY.

Description of the Instinct of Curiosity.

'CURIOSITY' = 'a tendency, regarded by many as congenital, to seek information or knowledge, especially to acquire information regarding a partly known event or situation' (II). The term may mean either

(i) 'inquisitiveness about trifles or
about other people's affairs', O r

(ii) 'artistic or scientific interest'.

(It is 'not called into action by any one specific object or range of objects', and, in this respect, it differs from all other impulses that are usually classed as 'instincts', with the single exception of 'pugnacity').

The feeling that accompanies the INSTINCT OF CURIOSITY is one of mystery, or wonder; strangeness;

of

Instinct of Curiosity (continued)

of the unknown.

The Danish Psychologist, Vilhelm Rasmussen, first noticed one of his daughters asking a question when she was one year and ten months old; 'after that her passion for interrogation, as in the case of other children, overflowed all bounds' (XVIII: p. 139). Often she asked a question for which she herself gave the answer; but some other questions showed the child's strong craving 'to get at the reason of things':

3½ years: (she was in a train looking out of the window, and asked):
'Mother, why are the trees riding too?'

2 years: (when told not to touch books):
'MUST not! WHY MUST not?'

3 yrs. 7 mos.: (she saw the end of a syringe put into some water):
'Mother, why does that stick BREAK in the water?'

Such questioning is helpful to the educator, who thereby discovers the interests of the child.

Also, it is possible, by the aid of a well-framed question, to arouse CURIOSITY about things in which the educator wishes the child to become interested. For instance, in the experiment mentioned in Chapter VIII (pages 149-151), just enough was stated in the problem that was given each Monday morning, to arouse curiosity. This method has long been used in

Religious

Instinct of Curiosity (continued)

Religious Education also, and is not in need of elaboration here.

This functioning of the instinct may come under the second heading stated on page 204, viz.,

'(ii) artistic or scientific interest'; and may be classed as an important root of knowledge. It is the other type of 'CURIOSITY' that makes the instinct 'troublesome', the type which Jeremy Taylor had in mind when he wrote:

'Curiositie after the affairs of others cannot be without envy and an evil minde'.

Again, 'Thou Shalt Not?' Or, shall we encourage the child to say, 'I **Must** NOT?'

Other instincts which involve these same questions will now be examined.

: :

(c) INSTINCT OF ESCAPE.

Description of 'FEAR'.

'FEAR' is described by William James as a 'reaction aroused by the same objects that arouse ferocity'; he states that it is a 'genuine instinct', and 'one of the earliest shown by the human child'.

(XXIV: pp. 407, 408). But in the modern 'Dictionary of Psychology' 'FEAR' is defined as 'emotional behaviour characterized by a feeling-tone of unpleasantness, and accompanied by activity of the sympathetic nervous system, together with various types of

postural

Instinct of Escape (continued)

postural and motor reactions, e.g., trembling, prostration, flight, convulsive seizures'. (II)

Neither of these descriptions is satisfactory.

'FEAR', in modern English, is an 'emotion' -- an emotion 'of pain or uneasiness caused by the sense of impending danger, or by the apprehension of evil'.

(In Old English, 'FEAR' = a peril, sudden calamity, danger; but a peril is not an 'instinct'. Also, the use of the term 'FEAR' for the more violent extremes^(a) of the emotion is early, not present-day, usage).

The 'INSTINCT'^(b) is the IMPULSION to avoid (or escape from) danger; 'FEAR' is 'its characteristic emotional accompaniment'.

The instinct finds expression in more than one type of behaviour, e.g., in flight, in concealment. In civilised man, 'the instinct exhibits ... considerable differences;' but its great importance (from the educationist's point of view) is due to the fact that it 'tends to bring to an end at once all other mental activity, riveting the attention upon its object to the exclusion of all others; ... the excitement of this instinct makes a deep and lasting

impression

(a) The word 'terror' is used to signify the 'most intense degree' of the emotion; but terror may involve so great nervous disturbance, with trembling, as to incapacitate the limbs and defeat the ends of the 'instinct of escape'.

(b) Professor McDougall, however, 'sees no reason' why the word 'fear' should not be used to name both the 'instinctive behaviour' and the emotion (V: p. 150).

Instinct of Escape (continued)

impression on the mind.... Fear, once roused, haunts the mind; it comes back alike in dreams and in waking life, bringing with it vivid memories of the terrifying impression. It is thus the great inhibitor of action, both present action and future action, and becomes in primitive human societies the great agent of social discipline through which men are led to the habit of control of the egoistic impulses' (I: p. 47).

Here, then, we seem to find the very impulsion for which parents and all educators have been looking, the 'GREAT INHIBITOR', innate, and functioning from Early Infancy. Pugnacious behaviour, "curiositie" after the affairs of others', and the expression of other 'troublesome instincts' -- cannot ^{these} all be kept in the 'proper place' by the educator who sees the effectiveness of 'FEAR?'

No doubt, they could; but what would be the effect on the child?

Before this question can be answered by quotations, it is necessary to remember that the word 'FEAR' is not used by every writer in the strict sense indicated on the previous page. Already it has become clear that 'FEAR' is a term (in the writings of some eminent psychologists) signifying

(1) an instinct

(11)

Instinct of Escape (continued)

(11) instinctive behaviour

(111) an emotion

(1v) exaggerated or extreme emotion
(1.e., TERROR)

All these significations are from the writings, (1908 or 1922) of Professor McDougall alone; the Dictionary of Psychology has clearly followed his lead. A fifth use of the term 'FEAR' to signify

(v) anxiety (and 'anxiety' to signify fear)
e.g.,
is found, in the translations of the works of Dr Freud (though the Dictionary of Psychology defines 'anxiety' clearly as an 'emotional attitude or sentiment concerning the future', and Professor McDougall distinguishes 'anxiety' from 'fear', using a splendid illustration -- V: p. 340). Further, the word 'fear' is continually used to signify a 'complex compound' which includes admiration, and for which the current English term is

(vi) awe,

and also to signify an 'attitude of solemn regard for a person or object, marked by a judgment of the superiority (usually moral superiority) of that person or object'; this 'solemn regard' is to-day -- and sometimes in the Authorised Version of the Bible -- called

(vii) reverence.

When the term 'FEAR' is met, therefore, in psychological works, the writer may be speaking of any one of

a number

Instinct of Escape (continued)

a number of emotions, dispositions, or activities; he may be speaking of a 'STRUCTURE' (to use Professor McDougall's word; other writers would prefer the term 'concept' or 'fiction') or he may be speaking of 'MENTAL FUNCTIONING' (Column 'B', page 65).

: :

With this in mind, the question,

WHAT WOULD BE THE EFFECT OF FEAR ON
THE CHILD?

may be answered largely by quotation.

(1) Professor McDougall mentions that, during the last war, many soldiers suffered from tachycardia^(a), induced (he sees no reason to doubt) by repeatedly evoked fear (XII: p. 264).

(11) 'FEAR' causes

general disturbance of functions

-- more especially of sleep,
and of appetite --

'nerves', irritability,

digestive disturbance,

sometimes complete functional
paralysis,

and (it is possible to add

from observation of cases

between the two wars)

(111) 'FEAR' inhibits effectiveness,

and

(a) 'Tachycardia' = 'excessive (often paroxysmal) rapidity in the action of the heart. Term usually limited in the human heart to a rate of over 130 beats per second.

Instinct of Fear (continued)

and (iv) 'FEAR' can bring the patient to the point where death is expected by the medical practitioner.

(It is simple to observe FUNCTIONAL PARALYSIS in certain animals; if a man looks fixedly at a snake and the snake sees that the man's eye is on it, the snake lies motionless, as if rivetted to the spot; it is paralysed -- biologists say--by FEAR).

In this short summary of the effects of 'FEAR', the term has been used in the broadest sense, and comprises both conscious and repressed 'FEAR'.

: :

The power of 'FEAR' to restrain instinctive impulses has long been known. In the primitive age of ancient Greece and Rome, the dominant religious emotion was FEAR; the FEAR of God is of the essence of Old Testament religion; ^(a) fear of punishment, that would be inflicted by his fellows in their anger, is regarded as the great agent of discipline of primitive man; it is thought that through such fear man first learned to control and regulate his impulses, and to conform them to the needs of social life (I: p. 261).

The

(a) Why did not David kill Saul, when he had the opportunity, in the cave, or in camp? David seems to have FEARED to kill Saul. 'Who can stretch forth his hand against the Lord's anointed, and be guiltless?' he asks (1 Samuel xxvi: 9).

The Psalms themselves confirm the place of fear even in later Old Testament times. Psalm 11:11: 'Serve the Lord with FEAR, and rejoice with TREMBLING'. Psalm 96:9: 'O worship the Lord in the beauty of holiness; FEAR before him, all the earth'.

Instinct of Fear (continued)

The teachers of mankind, throughout the ages, seem to have found that the most effective^{ive} part of the environment which they can provide, is that which arouses FEAR.

In this connection, Professor McDougall raises a 'nice question' (as he himself terms the problem). 'To what extent is the lapse from orthodox observances, so remarkable and widespread among the more highly civilised peoples at the present time, due to the general softening of religious teaching, to the lapse of the doctrine of divine retribution to a very secondary position, and to the discredit into which the flames of hell have fallen?' (I: p. 269).

Mr L. Wyall Lang, however, seeks to justify the more modern teaching, saying that peace is only attainable with a change in the idea of God's character from 'hatred to love', and that 'if the self is obsessed with fear of God's wrath, harmony is impossible' (XXV: p. 104).

But no educated man to-day would wish to see 'hatred' taught as a Divine attribute. Nor did the theologians who drew up the Shorter Catechism (three hundred years ago); but they did include JUSTICE. It is generally agreed that nothing that contradicts the New Testament picture of the Father should be taught;

Instinct of Fear (continued)

taught; however, JUSTICE does not contradict that picture.

Is there not a proper place for 'FEAR'? Should not some impulses be inhibited through the agency of 'FEAR?' Is not such a 'FEAR' as David's (in regard to the taking of Saul's life) good?

Other questions arise: Was not the British citizen, who did not fear a war, a danger to his country (1919-1938)? Is not 'FEAR' often like a RED LIGHT, warning of danger ahead? (Fear for the safety of his family, leads a man to erect an air-raid shelter).

'Happy is the man that FEARETH alway: but he that hardeneth his heart shall fall into mischief' (Proverbs xxviii: 14).

: :

Agreement among psychologists as to the use (and abuse) of 'FEAR' cannot be expected while the one term has so many significations. But this much may be said with some degree of certainty:

(1) The most intense degree of 'FEAR' (the emotion) may induce general convulsions or even death. The nervous disturbance, in these cases of 'TERROR', defeats the natural ends of the instinct of ESCAPE.

(11) Perpetual 'FEAR'(abnormal excitability
of the

Instinct of Escape ('FEAR')... (continued)

of the instinct) is seen in certain cases of mental disease.

(111) But 'FEAR' is not always 'TERROR', and is not always 'abnormal' or unduly frequent. 'FEAR' has its uses. Indeed, though 'FEAR' has been defined as being 'characterized by a feeling-tone of unpleasantness, it is remarkable how children (and young people generally) seem to enjoy situations that involve a modicum of fear. Children of Kindergarten and Primary Age (4-5 years; 6-8) commonly like a game with an adult acting as a lion, and springing on them; later, when they can read well, books of adventure are firm favourites, even with many girls.

(One minister's 6-year-old daughter, who had a cousin in India, asked a gentle and kindly elder, of whom she was very fond, to be, in future, a 'growling tiger'! She had been to the Edinburgh Zoo, where one tiger -- behind bars -- had been walking to and fro, apparently in a savage mood, and emitting ominous sounds).

It would seem that there is still a proper place, even in Religious Education, for 'FEAR', but not for 'TERROR'.

: :

Application to the Theory of Religious Education

Religious Education is concerned with two

classes

Instinct of Escape ('FEAR') ... (continued)

classes of 'VIRTUE' (as has already been seen --

Chapter II: pages 30-32):

- (1) Religion (in the stricter sense of the term, viz., relationship with God);

and (ii) Morality.

In regard to '(i) Religion', FEAR has, in times past, often been evoked. To-day, it is felt that 'nothing that contradicts the New Testament picture of God' should be taught (page 212); that picture includes the JUSTICE of God.

In regard to '(ii) Morality', opinions differ.

The late Dr Alfred Adler regarded an atmosphere of

DR ALFRED
ADLER AND
FEAR

fear of life and punishment as the 'most
venomous kind of poison', developing in
children pessimism instead of healthy

moral and mental life; he believed that such a perspective would be retained throughout life, and that it checked the natural growth of self-confidence, and made the individual indecisive (XXVI: p. 342). This would check spontaneous activity.

Dr J. B. Watson draws attention, in his own forthright way, to a distinction that has been noted on pages 208 and 209, though he does not use the term 'FEAR', and of course avoids all reference to 'INSTINCT': he says that he can 'build in' 'negative behaviour' to a snake in two ways, viz.,

Instinct of Fear: Application ... (continued)

(1) Just as he shows the snake he can make a terrible noise and cause the child to fall down and cry out, terror-stricken; soon the mere sight of the snake will have the same effect: OR

(11) He can present the snake several times, and each time, as the infant reaches for it, he can tap its fingers with a pencil, thus gradually establishing the negative reaction without shock.

He says that he has not tried this with a snake, but that he has tried it with a candle. To 'condition' a child with a severe burn involves a severe

DR J. B. WATSON
AND 'CONDITION-
ING' ('FEAR')

reaction; but by presenting the candle flame many times, and each time allowing it to **heat** the finger just sufficiently to produce withdrawal of the hand, a 'negative conditioned response' can be built up without the severe features of shock. The disadvantage of this latter method is that it requires time and patience.

In other words, FEAR, like medicine, may be suitable at certain times and in certain carefully-regulated doses. Much that has been written about fear might have been written also about strychnine; but strychnine has saved many lives.

: :

One other instinct is of great importance from
the

Instinct of Escape ('FEAR'): Application .. (continued)

the point of view of Religious Education, the INSTINCT of SELF-ASSERTION, which is considered at the end of this chapter. Meantime, it is noted that Professor McDougall lists the following INSTINCTS and accompanying EMOTIONS, in addition to those already examined in this study:

(A) The INSTINCT of REPULSION and the EMOTION of DISGUST.

(The impulse here is of AVERSION; it has high biological value; and, through an extension of the range of objects, gives moral protection, too).

(B) The INSTINCT of REPRODUCTION.

(The 'specific character' of this instinct may remain 'submerged and unconscious', while its 'immense energy', deflected to objects or aims of a non-sexual and socially valuable goal, enables useful work to be accomplished). (I: p. 70; and II: 'Sublimation').

(C) The FOOD-SEEKING INSTINCT.

(D) The INSTINCT of ACQUISITION.

(This 'ripens naturally, and comes into play independently of all training').

(E) The INSTINCT of APPEAL.

(F) Several Minor Instincts; such as Laughter, Scratching, Sneezing, Coughing, etc., seem to indicate.

: :

(d).

(d) INSTINCT of SELF-ASSERTION

Description of the Instinct.

'Self-Assertion' is defined as 'a tendency to emphasize one's own importance in the presence of other individuals or in dealing with others' (II), a n d as 'the action of asserting one's individuality, or insisting upon one's claims or supremacy' (III). The term has been in use since the beginning of the nineteenth century.

'When the self-assertive tendency is unduly preponderant and takes the relatively passive form of finding satisfaction in merely contemplating the superiorities of the self' it is called 'PRIDE'; and 'when the superiorities (fancied or real) are 'trivial' it is called 'VANITY' (V: p. 428).

The late Dr Alfred Adler saw 'VANITY' and 'PRIDE' as signs of the individual's CRAVING for POWER -- 'I must be the centre of all human attention'. When the 'main line of development is closed', he tries to obtain prestige along some side-path (as is indicated in the case mentioned on page 158, under the heading 'Submissive Instinct').

Already, methods of counteracting the tendency to 'laud it over his fellow-creatures' have been mentioned, viz.,

(1) Religious Teaching

(11) Exercise of the altruistic impulse

of

Instinct of Self-Assertion (continued)

of the Protective Instinct

- (111) Training in Submission, the 'Submissive Instinct' co-operating with the authority of the educator.

A fourth method will be apparent when it is remembered that Dr Adler considered the goal in life of a normal child to be 'a complete human being' (as noted in Chapter V: page 90). If the parent, teacher, and others, also have this goal in mind, respect the child whom they are trying to educate, and see the best in him, they will help to develop the best in him.

A child (or man) is liable to accept the estimate of others. The teacher who, in his own private thought, sees in his boys possibilities of becoming the future scientists, statesmen and professors of Europe, will tend to bring out such possibilities in those boys. Horace Walpole wrote of Sir Joshua Reynolds:

'All his own geese are swans,
all the swans of others are geese'.

Each mother tends to see her own 'geese' as swans; a teacher (in day school or Sunday School) may find this difficult, when he sees some deliberately disturbing a class, and hears Dr Montessori's words echoing, ironically, in his ears:

'They MUST be active, they don't
MEAN to be disobedient' (XIX).

He

Instinct of Self-Assertion (continued)

He may begin to see even the 'swans' as 'geese', and, if he does so, they will tend to accept his verdict, and to live up to it.

(It is interesting to find that the Master saw in Simon a future 'Rock-Man', and thereby no doubt helped Simon to develop into a 'Rock-Man'; in a Roman centurion, He saw not a 'Gentile dog', but a man of 'great faith').

If the child can be given an environment in which he can do some 'socially valuable, productive work' (as suggested on page 90), he will feel his value as he accomplishes it.

(Moses is referred to as 'very meek, above all the men which were upon the face of the earth'. Moses, apparently, having done a greater work than any man upon the earth -- having brought a slave band out of the grip of the Egyptians -- had no INFERIORITY FEELING for which he must COMPENSATE by PRIDE).

('Blessed are the meek, for they shall inherit the earth' -- S. Matthew v: 5).

: :

The HORMIC THEORY having been traced in some of the writings of a few leading psychologists, and certain possibilities having been envisaged, so far as Religious Education is concerned, it remains now to

(1) Look as fairly as possible at some misunderstandings of the Theory;

(2) See how the Theory of Religious Education was viewed in the latter half of last century, so as to discover what changes have taken place (or are taking place) as a result of this -- and, of course,

other

Instinct of Self-Assertion (continued)

other knowledge;

(3) State the results of experiments that have been carried out in regard to the Application of the Hormic Theory in Psychology to Religious Education; a n d

(4) Summarise the position in the light of any confirmed hypotheses, in which more confidence can now be placed.

To this, the concluding chapters are devoted.

: :

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS TO WHICH REFERENCE HAS BEEN
MADE IN THIS CHAPTER pages 185 to 187

(same as for Chapter VIII)

CHAPTER XI

OTHER ENDOWMENTS

: :

' I'll never

Be such a gosling as to obey

instinct')

-- Shakespeare

(Coriolanus: v: 111: 34)

CHAPTER XI

OTHER ENDOWMENTS

IS EVERY HUMAN ACTION AN EXPRESSION OF SOME INSTINCT?

The Hormic^{Theory} maintains, as has been stated in Chapter VI, that the instinctive nature of a man furnishes the original material from which his character is built. Man, Dr Jung says, is characterized by 'unmitigated instinctiveness;' Dr A. A. Roback asks, To what psychological entities can we hitch character? and answers, THE INSTINCTS; Freudian psychologists maintain that the raw materials of the individual are inherited instincts.

But Hormic Psychologists do not stop there; and Professor McDougall rightly complains when it is asserted that he ascribes every human action to the 'direct' expression of some instinct. When character has developed, very few actions proceed 'directly' from a man's instinctive disposition, according to the best exponents of Hormic Psychology.

Dr Jung has pointed out other connate endowments of man; the Freudians, while believing that the instincts remain dynamic throughout life, mention 'subsequent complex changes;' Dr Roback stresses man's power of inhibiting instinctive urges (XXVII: p. 161 &c.); and Professor McDougall mentions that 'the innate structure of the human mind comprises much more than the instincts alone', and refers

to

to aesthetic, moral and intellectual endowments, which compel the psychologist to recognise facts of 'structure' which he terms 'guiding principles'. These 'guiding principles' represent 'universalizations, involving naturally also the individual who is acting, but directed toward humanity in general, of which this or that person appears as a case'. Dr Roback (who quotes Professor McDougall in this connection) concurs. (XXVII: p. 484).

: :

The position may, then, be summed up as follows:
WITH AN INSTINCTIVE EQUIPMENT, and WITH TENDENCIES
(described by Professor Hollingworth -- XXIX: p. 123 --
as MORE OR LESS VAGUE AND RANDOM, INHERITED FROM
IMMEDIATE ANCESTRY, BASED ON REMOTE SOCIAL HERITAGE,
PERHAPS VESTIGIAL RELICS OR ONLY UNSHAPED POTENTIAL-
ITIES) WE COMMENCE LIFE.

The INSTINCTS and INSTINCTIVE TENDENCIES ARE
ONLY PART OF THE INNATE ENDOWMENT OF EACH CHILD.

: :

'SHOULD ALL TABUS BE ABOLISHED?' (a)

There is a common popular opinion that psychologists generally (and Dynamic Psychologists in particular) favour the abolition of 'tabu', 'repression', 'inhibition'.

(a) The title of an essay written by Professor McDougall in 1924.

Should All Tabus Be Abolished? (continued)

What is the position in regard to 'all those acts which religion forbids, expressions of the instincts (which) it represses?' (Dr Freud's terms). Should the decrees of society be fearlessly disregarded, and the instincts be freely expressed?

The subject has been taken up in press and pulpit. Father Woodlock, preaching at Oxford in 1937, deplored 'amorality' as widely spread, and declared that one of the most harmful causes of the moral chaos was superficial acquaintance with the jargon of 'new psychology', (unaccompanied by any real knowledge of the meaning of its terminology), which had been picked up by POPULAR MIS- UNDERSTANDING OF 'NEW PSYCHOLOGY' young people; he explained that a dangerous misunderstanding of the word 'repression' had given serious-minded young men and women a new phobia, many of them fearing that any self-denial of instinct, appetite, or passion, would be dangerous to psychological health and crippling to personality. (a)

This popular opinion admittedly finds support

from

(a) In a report of the sermon in one of the most careful of British daily papers ('The Daily Telegraph', London) it is interesting to find lack of 'acquaintance with the jargon of "new psychology"' on the part of someone: the report makes Father Woodlock say that many young people fear 'any withholding of complete self-suppression'.

Should All Tabus Be Abolished? (continued)

some
from ^AFreudians; Professor Wm. McDougall is able to refer to one British Professor of Psychology (b) as a 'fervent exponent (strictly in theory, of course)' of such morals; but it is noteworthy that Professor McDougall speaks of these, not as the doctrines of psychology or of the psycho-analysts, but as the 'sex-morals of the Russell-Wells school'.

It is easy to see how there has become current the idea that suppression of instinctive impulses is injurious, and that their unrestrained expression is advisable in the interests of healthy mental life (and of moral and physical life, too); we read, even in text-books of psychology such statements as this:

UNRESTRAINED
EXPRESSION
OF INSTINCTS

'Her early training, both at home and at the convent, was one of repression, one that put a strict taboo upon all reference to sexual matters. The result upon (her) at the time highly sexual nature was to isolate this desire and drive it underground' (XII: p. 496)

Even a quotation, from such a writer as Professor G. H. Thomson, can be misleading if read apart from its context and without reference to his general teaching.

For instance, Professor Thomson has written:

'The main contribution of the psycho-analytic schools of Freud and Jung to the psychology of education has been, I think, their discovery of the frequency and magnitude of the dangers of endeavouring to eliminate instincts'.

But it is important to remember that Professor Thomson does not stop there; he proceeds to point out that

the

(b) Dr J. C. Flügel

Should all Tabus be Abolished? (continued)

the schools of Drs Freud and Jung stress the necessity for redirection and sublimation, adding that the 'sowing of wild oats is not the best way of preventing the evils of repression'.

This is evident from the writings of Drs Freud and Jung themselves. Dr Freud mentions a 'progressive renunciation of inherent instincts' as one of the foundations of human civilization, although he admits that the satisfaction of these inborn instincts is capable of giving direct pleasure.

Dr Jung sees the abolition of inhibition not as a forward step, but as a backward one, which would entail fearful misery for humanity.

DR JUNG ON
NECESSITY FOR INHIBITION
Christianity, he points out, was accepted in order to escape from this very thing, which he calls the 'brutality of antiquity'; some would discard Christianity and Christian morality, and let licentiousness return, allowing themselves to be transported by the ancient 'frenzy of sexuality, from which the burden of guilt has been removed' -- a licentiousness 'impressively exemplified' in large cities to-day; BUT, Dr Jung insists, THEY PERMIT THIS TO THEIR OWN GREATEST DETRIMENT. He says that it must not be imputed to him that he is wishing by Analytical Psychology to return men to the primitive expression of their instincts, to stages that they have now almost outgrown.

Professor

Should all Tabus be Abolished? (continued)

Professor Hollingworth raises the question as to whether failure of inhibition is not to blame for the 'abnormalities;' that is, as to whether INHIBITION is not the 'very means of adult salvation', rather than the cause of occasional mental distress (XXIX: pp. 123-124). According to this view, development is largely a matter of 'INHIBITION, CONTROL, and REPRESSION'. This view appears to be sound.

: :

HOW SHOULD INHIBITION BE EFFECTED?

The method is of great importance. The theory of INHIBITION BY DRAINAGE underlies the method which has been found in practice to work best. This theory, Dr J. C. Flügel states, is 'almost beyond a doubt the most successful neurological theory that has ever been propounded' (XXX: p. 270). Dr Flügel illustrates it by referring to our household water supply. When the tap of the bath is turned on, the stream of water flowing into the hand-
INHIBITION
BY
DRAINAGE basin is diminished. INHIBITION,
accordingly, would be the 'negative aspect of a positive process'---'a re-distribution of energy rather than a mere prevention of something that would otherwise occur'. Professor McDougall has been given credit for originating this theory, and among the phenomena to which he applies it is
the

How Should Inhibition Be Effected? (continued)

the mutual inhibition of instincts. This theory fits in with the psycho-analysts' concept of 'SUBLIMATION'.

If this theory is correct, the corollary would be: THE BEST METHOD OF INHIBITING 'TROUBLESOME' INSTINCTIVE BEHAVIOUR is by the POSITIVE PROCESS OF ENCOURAGING THE EXPRESSION OF DESIRABLE INSTINCTIVE ACTIVITIES (as has already been suggested -- Chapter VIII).

: :

BUT ARE NOT THE TEN COMMANDMENTS NEGATIVE?

Historically, it must be admitted, PROHIBITIONS have figured largely in the early laws on which our British legal code has been built. We are a Christian civilization, and the Jewish law has been accepted as a basis for both our religious and our moral standards, as well as our statutes. Of the ten commandments, nine are stated in negative terms. But in the teaching of Jesus Christ and the apostles, the commands are, for the most part, positive. Instead of 'Thou shalt not covet' there is found 'Covet earnestly the best gifts' (1 Cor. xii: 31); instead of 'Thou shalt not kill' there is found 'Love your enemies' (S. Matt. v: 44); instead of 'Thou shalt not bear false witness' there is found 'Speak every man truth' (Eph. iv: 25).

: :

ARE NOT NEGATIVE COMMANDS SOMETIMES NECESSARY?

Even Dr J. B. Watson is thoroughly 'old-fashioned' here, and answers, emphatically, YES! He says that

there

Are Not Negative Commands Sometimes Necessary? (contd.)

there is a certain amount of sentimentality 'going the pedagogical rounds' in his country (the United States of America) to the effect that no negative reactions should ever be forced on a child; however, he himself believes that certain negative responses must be implanted, in order to protect the child, and that this should be done scientifically. He says he cannot see any other way out of it, and continues:-

'May I just say dogmatically that our civilization is built upon 'don'ts' and taboos of many kinds? ... Society exists -- it is a fact, and if we live under it we must draw back when social customs say draw back'.

To this, however, Dr Freud tells us, the child 'unwillingly submits'. The child sees the 'social compulsion' in concrete form -- to the son (Dr Freud says) the father is the embodiment of it -- the person who stands in the way of the child 'following his own will'. To some, the Church is the embodiment of it -- or religion, represented by some person or organization. A minister in New York described such a case:

'Religion for him was doing what they (his parents) wanted him to do. And so naturally religion began to seem like a constant source of limitation, a cramping and confining of himself' (a)

The poet, William Blake, states the case in 'The

Garden

(a) 'Children of the Second Birth' by Rev. Samuel M.

Are Not Negative Commands Sometimes Necessary? (contd.)

Garden of Love':

'I went to the Garden of Love,
And saw what I never had seen:
A Chapel was built in the midst,
Where I used to play on the green.

And the gates of the Chapel were shut,
And "THOU SHALT NOT" writ over the door;
So I turned to the Garden of Love
That so many sweet flowers bore;

And I saw it was filled with graves,
And tomb-stones where flowers should be,
And priests in black gowns were walking their
And binding with briars (rounds,
my joys and desires'.

: :

While, on the one hand, there is good reason for not allowing 'indiscriminate liberty', yet there are certain liberties which some psychologists think it is often necessary to defend: Dr Crichton Miller lists some:

- (i) The freedom of the child to grow up
- (ii) The liberty to develop views -- even views opposed to those of his parents
- (iii) Freedom from emotional domination and the tyranny of unwise affection.

: :

There are aids FROM WITHIN THE PERSON, as well as compulsions from WITHOUT, to inhibit instinctive behaviour, and Religious Education can build^{these} up -- OR, RATHER, MANIPULATE THE ENVIRONMENT so that these COMPULSIONS FROM WITHIN may develop. There is, for instance, SELF-RESPECT.

Professor

Are Not Negative Commands Sometimes Necessary? (contd)

Professor McDougall tells us that 'character goes to pieces and volition is undermined, if self-respect is destroyed', and instances men who are the victims of alcohol or of other drugs, pointing out that there are but 'few social circles which will continue to approve or to tolerate the habitual drunkard'; 'his self-respect is therefore in more danger than his liver'. Referring to the so-called 'shell-shock' cases, he states that the 'only means of retrieving character and will-power is to restore self-respect'.

For the educator the corollary is clear: HE MUST RESPECT THE PERSON WHOM HE IS TO HELP. (This has been noted previously).

: :

Then, with CONVERSION emotions of a new quality arise. The 'expulsive power of a new affection' operates.

'CONVERSION', however, belongs to a field of psychology which is not covered by this enquiry; and so do these new affections. They are noted here, because of their tremendous importance.

It is for HORMIC PSYCHOLOGY to stress that the blessings of the GREAT SPIRITUAL AWAKENING may fade if men do not follow the Master's command, and,
with

Are Not Negative Commands Sometimes Necessary? (contd.)

with sincere purpose, strive to put into effect His teachings, finding their joy in the success they are able to attain in His service, as well as in that 'fellowship with God' which, as noted in the chapter on RELIGION, 'gives happiness and peace'.

: :

For purposes of comparison, the Theory of Religious Education, in the latter part of last century, is included in this study; and the next chapter will not only endeavour to make a precis of Professor Van Oosterzee's book on the subject, but also to look at his views from the standpoint of the Hormic Theory.

: :

CHAPTER XII

THE THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE
NINETEENTH CENTURY

'Ne'er look for the birds of
this year in the nests of the
last'

-- Miguel de Cervantes

('Don Quixote': Part II;
Book IV; Chapter 74,
page 932).

CHAPTER XII

THE THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE
NINETEENTH CENTURY

For purposes of comparison, it is proposed to examine the Theory of Religious Education, as interpreted in the last part of the Nineteenth Century, before the appearance of the first psycho-analytical journal (edited by Dr Jung), and before the issue of Dr McDougall's 'Social Psychology', in which he first set forth the Hormic Theory (though without using the term 'hormic', which appeared only in later editions of the book). The first publication of the 'Journal' and of 'Social Psychology' was contemporaneous.

The Theory of Religious Education, as understood sixty-six years ago by the Dutch Professor Van Oosterzee, is set out by him in four main divisions; the first two deal with Public Worship, and are headed respectively 'HOMILETICS' and 'LITURGICS'; the other main sections appear under the titles 'CATECHETICS' and 'POIMENICS'. The same order is being followed in the exposition here.

: :

(1) HOMILETICS

1. EXPOSITION.

Homiletics comprises that which is, in common speech, called 'PREACHING' or 'THE SERMON'.

ITS PURPOSE:- The advancement of the Kingdom
of

of God. The Minister explicitly aims at the edification of the people, at bringing the WHOLE man to that point at which he (the minister) would have him, to the glory of God and the spiritual upbuilding of the congregation.

THE METHOD:^(a) The delivery of carefully prepared sermons, in an unfettered style, but with dignity, to the congregated assemblies at Public Worship.

ITS MATERIAL:^(a) NOT philosophy, NOT natural science, NOT non-sacred history and literature, NOT social, economical, or merely philanthropic questions, NOT doctrines of morals severed from the root of the doctrine of FAITH; BUT CHRIST JESUS THE LORD, the Sermon explaining and developing a text of Scripture, and being charged with the spirit of the Bible, especially that of the New Testament.

THE PREACHER should be a man wholly penetrated by the spirit of his message, which should be an outpouring of his own spiritual life, so as to reach the heart and powerfully to affect the life of his hearers (L: pp. 166-201, 342).

: :

II. CRITICISM FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF THE HORMIC THEORY:-

(1) The 'Congregated Assemblies'. These

----- satisfy

(a) The division into PURPOSE, METHOD, MATERIAL, etc., is not Van Oosterzee's, though in this exposition (or precis) of his large book, as many as possible of his own words (or the translator's equivalent of them) are retained.

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

satisfy the 'GREGARIOUS INSTINCT' in man.

The 'GREGARIOUS INSTINCT' appears to be strengthened and established by habit. This is not only the teaching of psychology; it has been confirmed by observation in these days of war, when there has been evacuation of city people to country areas.

(11) 'The Preacher, so as POWERFULLY TO AFFECT THE LIFE OF HIS HEARERS' should 'reach the HEART'.

'Heart' is, in this connection, not a scientific word, but its meaning would be understood by all; we commonly speak of 'heart-ache' (meaning 'sorrow' or 'anguish'), of 'heart-broken' ('grieved'), of 'heart-whole' ('unaffected in the affections').

That, in the latter half of last century, 'reaching the heart' should be stressed in expounding the theory of Religious Education, is noteworthy; for Protestant Churches have been adversely criticised in this very connection. Dr Jung speaks of a man's 'unreasoned need of what we call a "spiritual life"', and comments: 'This he cannot obtain from universities, libraries, or even churches. He cannot accept what these have to offer, because it touches only his head and does not stir his heart' (VII: p. 224). As noted when definition of 'INSTINCT' was being sought, the 'AFFECTIVE PROCESS' of mental life is important; our 'primary emotions are rooted in our
instinctive

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

instinctive dispositions'. But this thesis is concerned with the CONATIVE, and not the EMOTIONAL aspect of mental life.

(iii) The Preacher 'should be a man wholly penetrated by the spirit of his message, which should be an outpouring of his own spiritual life.'

There are two good reasons for this:

1. That he may be a pattern for his congregation to copy with benefit to their own spiritual lives; (already examined; page 196).

2. It is only a belief which is accepted with sincerity by his hearers that can effectually change their lives. (We do not expect a sincere decision as the result of an appeal by a minister who is not himself sincere).

: :

It has been seen throughout this study, and particularly in Chapters I and VIII, that the ADJUSTMENT TO ENVIRONMENT SHOULD BE CARRIED OUT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE BY THE LEARNER'S OWN ACTIVITY AND INITIATIVE. But in the Theory of Homiletics -- and of Religious Education generally -- that is set before us in Van Oosterzee's book, little room is left for activity and initiative, except on the part of the minister.

It

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

It is the minister who has the great purpose in his mind, the minister who is entrusted with the creative work of constructing the 'carefully-prepared sermon', the minister who knows that his message must be the 'outpouring of his own spiritual life'; and it is to the minister that the active work falls

CONSTRUCTIVE
WORK, BUT BY
MINISTER ONLY

of delivering this sermon 'in an unfettered style'. Such Religious Education seems to be excellent

for promoting the growth of the minister; in the environment pictured by Van Oosterzee he has every chance to unfold the possibilities latent within himself.

But the minister is only one among hundreds, or perhaps thousands, of members of the congregation; and Hormic Psychology sees in the native constitution of every member, as the most fundamental characteristic, an urge to activity and to self-development -- a purposive striving towards ends or goals. It is the province of Religious Education to arrange an environment that will permit of this activity, and that will be suited to the requirements of every individual person.

Man is not only endowed so that he can perceive objects and situations (as he does when he listens to sermons of the type envisaged by Van Oosterzee),

and

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

and so that he can feel (OR, BE STIRRED EMOTIONALLY) in sympathy with the preacher; but he is also endowed with a 'CONSTRUCTIVE INSTINCT' (Chapter VIII); and if the sermon is to make a full contribution to the education of the worshipper, then he should have some part in the construction of it. As already seen, each

one of us has a great supply of
THE 'INSTINCT FOR
CONSTRUCTION' IS 'horme' available for sending
INNATE IN EVERYONE out along such a channel -- for

creative work. Joy is experienced when there is an opportunity for planning and building.

With sermons as at present, how is it possible to utilise this energy? This is a problem for Religious Education. The 'horme' is there, in the pew, waiting. One worshipper occasionally suggests a subject, or asks a question that may be answered from the pulpit; sometimes members of a congregation are asked to hand in such suggestions. But the idea awaits development on a much broader basis.

(One small experiment has been made in connection with this study; a short note of it is given in Chapter XIII).

: :

Yet another essential in good Education is commonly stated by the phrase 'NO IMPRESSION WITHOUT EXPRESSION'. In other words, there is need to pass,

'FROM

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

'FROM AN OBSERVATION, WHICH IS SELFISH, TO A SERVICE, WHICH IS SOCIAL' (Professor Dewey's words).

If a man listens to a sermon by which he is stirred emotionally, he feels an impulse to do something; but if he has no opportunity to act -- if he can go no further -- there is not full satisfaction. Successful striving (as has previously been noted) is normally pleasant; there is joy in progress towards the goal; but when progress is thwarted, the experience is painful. The result of sermons should be at least pleasant; so there should be some opportunity for putting the message of the address into effect; but HOW?

One modern preacher concluded a sermon with some such words as these:

HERE ENDETH THE EXPOSITION OF OUR TEXT:
NOW BEGINNETH THE PUTTING OF IT INTO
PRACTICAL EFFECT.

Other instances come to mind: Savanarola, preaching in Florence; some evangelical missions. But they are exceptions to the general practice, which seems to be this: A MINISTER DOES NOT PLAN BEYOND THE END OF HIS SERMON.

As to the hearers, they may go to the duties of the week determined to put the message into action day by day -- or they may forget all about it. If they had even written down the message, the impression might have been more lasting. But the only EXPRES-
sion

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

sion, often, is the singing of a suitable hymn following the sermon.

It is for the preacher to see that, as far as lies in his power, his sermons are not only written so as to be heard, and so as to touch the heart and arouse an impulse to action, but so that they may actually issue in action; and it would seem that the co-operation of others will be necessary if this is to be planned and carried out satisfactorily.

Without much foresight by the minister, SOMETIMES THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES FOR EXPRESSION, as when a lay

EXPRESSION OF SERMON'S MESSAGE BY CONGREGATION	preacher (or 'local preacher') listens to a sermon that rouses his enthusiasm, and goes forth
--	---

himself to write and to preach; or when men listen to a story of great work waiting to be done, are 'moved', and take out their cheque books in order to make a fitting contribution through the offertory. In these instances, the sermon may have satisfactorily accomplished its purpose;^(a) the impulse of the listener has found expression. Also, when a sermon is heard on prayer, and men and women go home to pray each day with deeper understanding of the true nature of prayer, and of the Father Almighty, the proper goal may be reached.

But it

(a) 'Therefore whosoever heareth these sayings of Mine,
AND DOETH THEM,
I will liken him unto a wise man....' (Matthew vii:24)

(1) HOMILETICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

But it still remains for Religious Education to discover how every worshipper, at every service, may not only hear and feel, but have the opportunity to ACT.

(A small experiment on the lines of these suggestions has been carried out, and details are given in the next chapter).

: : : : :

II. LITURGICS.

I. EXPOSITION.

The theory of the conducting of Public Worship is called 'LITURGICS'. Its sources are to be found partly in Scripture, partly in the history of the Church, and partly in the Christian consciousness of the minister himself and of the congregation (L: pp. 345 ff.).

Public Worship must be, as far as possible, in full harmony with the supreme majesty of God and the deepest needs of the truly religious man; it should be animated by the free but uncorrupted spirit of the Reformation; and it needs to be conducted at suitable times, and in suitable places; for, although God dwells not in temples made with hands, man has need of setting apart, from all that is worldly and unholy, the time and place for adoration, that the spirit of devotion be awakened (L: pp. 361 ff.).

The

(11) LITURGICS: EXPOSITION (continued)

The LANGUAGE should be the language of the country, understood by all, but such as to lift up the congregation to God. To this end, the simplicity and majesty of Sacred Scripture should be retained (L: p. 382).

THE MINISTER, who conducts these services, does so as the inspired mouthpiece and living organ of the Holy Spirit, aware of his own unworthiness, yet being continually perfected to the unity, beauty and growth of the whole spiritual organism (L: pp. 418 ff.).

THE DRESS OF THE MINISTER should be appropriate, but no other garb can replace the clothing with humility (L: p. 382).

LITURGICAL ACTIONS include, in Public Worship, (1) SPECIAL READING OF SCRIPTURE, the portion being deliberately chosen as being in definite harmony with the subject for the occasion; (11) THE VOICE OF SACRED SONG AND CHURCH MUSIC, adapted to raise spirit and heart to the subject; and (111) PUBLIC PRAYER -- the worthy expression of the highest life of the soul (L: pp. 383-417).

THE SACRED ORDINANCES OF HOLY BAPTISM AND HOLY COMMUNION are to be administered with reverence, in the most impressive manner, and in the genuine spirit of the Founder of the New Covenant; while other PUBLIC RITES OF RELIGION, which should be conducted with fidelity to the tried principles of the Gospel and the Reformation, include the CONSECRATION OF

(11) LITURGICS: EXPOSITION (continued)

YOUNG COMMUNICANTS, the ORDAINING OF ELDERS, the SOLEMNISATION OF MARRIAGE, and the BURIAL OF THE DEPARTED. And so the Church accompanies its children with PRAYER and BLESSING from the first step to the last upon their life's path, and minister being the 'mouthpiece' of 'The Holy Spirit' (L: pp. 418 ff.).

: :

II. CRITICISM FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF THE HORMIC THEORY.

The Hormic Theory maintains, it has been pointed out, (Chapters VI-X), that man inherits various instincts, the outstanding characteristic of which is an urge to activity, and that these IMPULSIONS (the affective aspect of which we experience as EMOTIONS) strive to find expression in behaviour. Looked at from this viewpoint, do the LITURGICAL ACTIONS give an opportunity for the necessary expression of our impulses?

As men gather together to unite in Public Worship, there is usually much for which they should be grateful, as individuals, and as a community; and Scripture Sentences, spoken early in the service, may arouse a feeling of GRATITUDE. It has already been noted (in Chapter VIII) that there is in mankind a felt need to SHARE with others, who are like-minded, our emotions. Therefore, when gratitude is not only expressed in the words of the minister, or by the

singing

(11) LITURGICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

singing of a choir, but by the whole congregation uniting in an act of praise, it would seem to make for health (mental, moral, spiritual) and happiness.

But can the SERVICE OF PRAISE do more than provide a healthy means of expressing emotion? It is commonly said (and repeated by psychologists) that a joy shared is a joy doubled; indeed, in the presence of an assembly of people, who have gathered together with one purpose, and who have come with (or in whom has been aroused) a distinctive feeling-tone, a man's emotional reactions are quite different from those experienced in his solitary life (XIV: p. 142). He is being acted on by 'HERD-SUGGESTION', produced by all the other members, who are being influenced, too. His joy increases; his gratitude deepens; his suggestibility becomes greater. This gives to the minister a great opportunity. The various acts of praise and of prayer need not be all expressions of gratitude; they may lead the worshippers forward step by step.

There are realms (as Professor McDougall has reminded us) where the knowledge (even of the best of us) is quite inadequate as a guide to belief and action; and in these realms we are particularly susceptible to leadership; realising our own lack, we are willing to be led through the medium of SUGGESTION. One of these realms is surely religion. If Public Worship

(11) LITURGICS: CRITICISM ... (continued)

is, as suggested by Van Oosterzee, conducted so as to be, as far as possible, in full harmony with the supreme majesty of God, it would be natural for NEGATIVE SELF-FEELING to be evoked; thus one of the conditions of SUGGESTION would be realised, as a worshipper unites in a noble hymn or prayer. If, in addition, the

THE POWER OF SUGGESTION
IN PUBLIC WORSHIP

'simplicity and majesty of
Sacred Scripture' be retained,

(as, for example, they are retained in many of the Psalms and Paraphrases, Ancient Hymns, and Canticles) possibilities are increased; for these words have been used, hallowed and revered by the saints of the ages.

Further, where the Psalms and Hymns are chosen so as to meet the deepest needs of men (as Van Oosterzee tells us they should be) another condition for SUGGESTION is present, viz., INTRINSIC VALUE.

It would seem that there is here an influence such as is difficult to provide in Bible Class or Sunday School; and an experiment, which involved the attendance of children at Public Worship, has been made, and is reported in the next chapter.

: :

(III) CATECHETICS.

1. EXPOSITION.

The Theory of Religious Instruction, given in the name of the Church and at the command of her Lord,

(11) CATECHETICS: EXPOSITION (continued)

is called 'CATECHETICS'.

The Kingdom of God is adapted and accessible for children and young people, no less than for adults, and in every human being there is present in principle a natural gift for the formation of a Christian-religious character. This gift, however, needs calling forth, developing, and guiding (L: pp. 467 ff.).

The instruction should make progress by slow gradations, must as a rule be received in social groups, and ought to attach itself as closely as possible to all that is done by means of Baptism, home-life, school-teaching, and public worship; further, it should embrace all that it is necessary for the catechumens to know with regard to religion, Christianity, and Church, including the history of missions, and should give the knowledge 'of the truth which is after godliness, in hope of eternal life' (L: pp. 471-482). The CATECHESIS assumes the character of a didactic lecture, combined with the 'erotematic' method ('catechetical' in the narrower sense of the word), the pupil then giving answers to questions put to him by the catechete. Occasional singing may prove of service.

The Sunday School has now become a moral power over millions of children in the Old World and the New, and an inestimable ally of the CATECHESIS.

Catechete and Sunday School teachers need to

(111) CATECHETICS: EXPOSITION (continued)

fix the 'believing gaze' upon 'Him Who wins His people by the power of His love'.

: :

ILCRITICISM FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF THE HORMIC THEORY.

This 'INSTRUCTION' is all very well, and, Hormic Psychology agrees with educationists generally in saying, necessary; BUT TAKES LITTLE ACCOUNT OF

(1) The 'LAW OF TRANSITORINESS' (as set forth by Professor William James -- XL: p. 402), which is this: MANY INSTINCTS RIPEN AT A CERTAIN AGE, AND THEN FADE AWAY. There is a time, in the life-history of each child, when some instincts are at the peak of their 'vivacity'; the educator must take advantage of this time, and provide an environment either to avoid the functioning of the instinct or to encourage its functioning (as desired). Studies of 'CONVERSION' show a 'peak' period in adolescence, for instance, of which Religious Education must take account.

(11) The NECESSITY FOR ACTIVITY ON THE PART OF THE LEARNER. To spend a few months watching an up-to-date school, using the 'MODERN COURSE' in teaching Pitman's Shorthand, and at the same time to watch some Bible Classes and Sunday Schools, gives one the impression that it is the Pitman Teachers who know how to teach (as a rule; there are exceptions). Instantly (in the shorthand class) there is activity

when

(iii) CATECHETICS: CRITICISM (continued)

when the teacher says a word; reading, writing; and the writing is correct -- there is a perfect model within an inch of the pen-point of the student. No rules to be learned! The students have to discover the rules for themselves after they are writing the very words to which the rules apply at not less than fifty words perminute. Practically no telling is permitted; the teacher must make the learners do the telling. The progress of the students is remarkable.

It has been possible to contrast the former method of teaching shorthand (viz., learning of letters and learning rules; then writing words according to rule) with the 'Modern' method; comparison of results makes the old 'telling' methods appear obsolete, in 1944; but some teachers are still using them.

Shorthand is a skill; and Religious Education is more than a skill. But cannot religion and morality be learned largely through activity?

: : :

(IV) POIMENICSI. EXPOSITION.

That part of Practical Theology which is occupied with the theory of the pastoral care exercised by the minister of the Gospel, in his legitimate sphere of labour, is called 'POIMENICS' (L: p. 510). The
'feeding

(1v) POIMENICS: EXPOSITION (continued)

'feeding of the flock of God' is (1) GENERAL and
(11) INDIVIDUAL.

General PASTORAL CARE demands the forming of an accurate acquaintance with the members of the congregation, by systematic and well-ordered house-to-house visitation, with a compassionate shepherd's heart leading the flock ever again to the fresh streams of living waters.

Individual PASTORAL CARE is, as a rule, not of a material but of a moral and religious nature. It involves watching over each sheep, visiting the bodily sick, consoling the afflicted, taking an earnest interest in the fallen and the condemned, and guiding the mentally distressed and soul-sick. For INDIVIDUAL POIMENICS, as for GENERAL, the conclusion of the whole may be summed up in the words of the old psalmist:

'To all perfection I have seen an end,
BUT -- Thy commandment is exceeding broad'
(Ps. 119: 96).

(L: p.586)

: :

II. CRITICISM FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF THE HORMIC
THEORY.

Once again, the activity is on the part of the minister only. In some churches, ELDERS and DEACONS also take a share in pastoral work. Can this duty be enlarged so as to allow of many more Church members taking part in it? (Experiment I).

CHAPTER XIII

SOME EXPERIMENTS

'The eagle suffers little birds
to sing'

-- Shakespeare

(Titus Andronicus:
Act IV: Sc. iv:
line 82)

CHAPTER XIII

SOME EXPERIMENTS

Mention has already been made of some experiments that have been carried out in connection with this study; these experiments have extended over many years, and some of them have been repeated several times, arrangements on subsequent occasions being varied in accordance with results previously obtained. Under the headings of (i) Problem (ii) Tentative Hypothesis (iii) Question (iv) Text (v) Result and (vi) Conclusion, a note is given of a few of these experiments.

(A) EXPERIMENT No.1.

(i) Problem:- To provide such an environment for adolescents as would give them opportunity to use their 'horme' by the functioning of such instincts as the religious educator wishes to unfold, thereby 'inhibiting by drainage' other instinctive propensities.

(ii) Tentative Hypothesis:- That adolescents are endowed with instincts, at their age 'vivacious', which

- (a) impel them to protect the young and the weak,
- (b) and impel them to construct (with the aid of knowledge, reason and imagination);

and that they are susceptible, at their age,

- (c) to leadership; and
- (d) to the call to self-sacrificing work that is beneficial to society -- particularly
- so (e) when they would be co-operating with others of their own age.

(iii)

(A) EXPERIMENT NO. 1 (continued)

(iii) Question:- Would a 'League of Worship', on the lines indicated in Chapter VIII (pages 182-184),

- (a) be of interest to the adolescents
- (b) deepen their protective instincts
- (c) promote regular Church attendance by themselves and the children
- (d) promote the well-being of adolescents and children?

: :

(iv) Test:- The adolescents met each week in accordance with the permission granted; rehearsed (in the hall) visits of 'prefects' to the homes of the children; actually visited the homes of the parish, found the children, interested the parents in their plans; discovered some cases of need, and took steps to remedy them; found the money required for their schemes; held social evenings, picnics, etc.; increased the number of 'prefects' to forty; increased the attendance at Church remarkably; and, incidentally so increased the attendance at Sunday School that the superintendent had to ask them to provide fifteen more Sunday School teachers to cope with the classes that had to be formed in Junior and Primary Departments to take the new-comers.

: :

(v) Conclusion:-

(a) (b) (c) (d) The 'League of Worship' does interest adolescents, does promote regular Church attendance

(A) EXPERIMENT No. 1 (continued)

attendance, and (apparently) deepens the protective instincts of the 'prefects', and promotes the well-being of both 'prefects' and children; B U T

(e) some parents do not bother to go to Church with their children, and the sitting of children together in Church is not satisfactory from the point of view of the 'atmosphere' of Public Worship. A reverent adult or adolescent needs to be with EVERY CHILD.

: :

This experiment was repeated later in another Church, and, in this case, the Kirk Session did NOT grant permission to the 'prefects' to encourage the attendance at Public Worship of children without their parents. The 'prefects' confined themselves to visitation, picnics, etc., etc., but did not seem to have the same satisfaction in their work when they did not see visible results in large attendances at Church.

(v) CONCLUSION:- Adolescents find great satisfaction in the functioning of the PROTECTIVE INSTINCT and the INSTINCT OF CONSTRUCTION, and the Public School method of relying upon the 'prefects' to use their knowledge, intellect and imagination (WITHOUT OVERSIGHT) seems to be SOUND. Mistakes can be made (as in allowing children to sit together in Church), but the 'prefects' are

(A) EXPERIMENT NO. 1 (continued)

are quite capable of discovering the remedy.

::::::::::

(B) EXPERIMENT No. 2.

(i) Problem:- How to improve methods and equipment in Sunday Schools.

(ii) Tentative Hypothesis:-

- (a) That ideational imitation will be of behaviour which is interesting;
- (b) That the tendency is to imitate one's superiors rather than one's inferiors;
- (c) That, if imitation is to occur, the conduct should have intrinsic value for the one who (it is hoped) will be the imitator.

(iii) Question:-

Would Sunday School teachers, who are willing to go on Sunday afternoons and see another Sunday School at work (a Sunday School that is superior to their own in such matters as method and equipment), return to their own schools and adopt methods, equipment, etc., used in the school they have visited?

(iv) Test:-

Some of the best-equipped and best-staffed Sunday Schools in the London area were approached individually; permission was granted by them for the visit, on such Sunday afternoons as would be arranged later, of members of staffs of other schools. Then thirty-five Sunday Schools were told

of

(B) EXPERIMENT NO. 2 (continued)

of their opportunity to visit the selected schools -- some being approached personally, but most of them by personal letter, addressed to the superintendent. On receipt of replies, programmes were mapped out, and visits made.

(v) Result:-

To many of the letters no replies were received.

Most of the acceptances were the outcome of personal invitations.

The total number of acceptances did not come up to expectations.

Some of the teachers returned to their schools and suggested changes. This led to other visits to selected schools by other teachers, and, finally, to improved method and equipment.

But in these schools there were some teachers, who refused to see any other school, who said their ways were being adversely criticized, and who resigned as teachers.

(vi) Conclusion:- The advance was not without cost; some of the teachers who resigned were most worthy ladies; but the general effectiveness of these schools improved.

The hypothesis was confirmed (if it needed confirming).

(N.B.: The experiment was carried out officially by the Sunday School Council; the opportunity came for it, when considerable resentment was shown by some Sunday Schools at the Official Report of the Sunday School Secretary after visiting the particular schools that most needed improving).

(C)

(C) EXPERIMENT No. 3.

(i) Problem:-

How can young children satisfactorily give expression to the PROTECTIVE INSTINCT?

(ii) Tentative Hypothesis:-

That, in this connection, young children (3-5; 6-8 years -- Beginners and Primary respectively) are interested in BABIES, THE AGED, and THE WEAK.

(iii) Question:-

If a Church Flower Service were held, to which each child was asked to bring flowers, eggs, or fruit; if hymns, Bible readings, prayers, etc., all tended to arouse sympathy with BABIES, THE AGED, and THE WEAK; and if (as a suitable expression of the emotions aroused) the children themselves each took a bunch of flowers, some eggs, or some fruit, to a BABY, ^{OR} an AGED PERSON (or someone who was otherwise WEAK), would the effect be satisfactory?

(iv) Test:-

The Service was held; flowers, etc., were brought by the children; hymns, etc., including the address (story) all concentrated on the thought of the WEAK; the children afterwards delivered the flowers, etc. (but not the same ones as they had each brought).

(v) Result:- Great satisfaction given, both to children, and to the AGED, etc. One child (age, 3 years 4 months), whose father accompanied her to

the

(C) EXPERIMENT No. 3 (continued)

the home of an elderly lady (who was found sitting up in a bath chair), duly delivered her flowers, but said little. However, on the way home again, she said, six times, with an interval between each repetition of the remark, 'The poor wee girlie!' But there were no signs of distress.

: : :

This experiment has been repeated many times now, in churches that differ greatly, but always the results have been found most satisfactory from the point of view of the child -- as well as, of course, from the point of view of the aged recipients and the mothers of the babies.

(vi) Conclusion:-

It seems that it would be well if the common practice of sending flowers and fruit from special services to hospitals, homes, etc., were replaced by the more personal method to which attention has been called by this experiment.

Clearly, Beginners' and Primary Department children are interested in babies, the aged, and the weak generally, and the expression of the 'TENDER IMPULSE' might be ^{arranged} ~~expressed~~ in as many ways as educationists can devise.

: :

It remains now to summarise the hypotheses that have been more or less confirmed; to this the next chapter is devoted.

CHAPTER IX)
CHAPTER X)
CHAPTER XI)
CHAPTER XII)
CHAPTER XIII)
CHAPTER XIV)

LIST OF PRINCIPAL BOOKS REFERRED TO, IN THESE
CHAPTERS

... pages 185,
186,
187,
187a

(The List is the same as for Chapter
VIII)

: :

CHAPTER XIV

CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER XIV

C O N C L U S I O N S

Dr Crichton Miller wrote that the conclusions of the Dynamic Psychologists ' have often reaffirmed those which the experience of mankind has long ago evolved and treasured,' adding: 'It is undeniable that analytical psychology repeats a good deal of the wisdom of the nursery ... and it often follows with slow feet to a goal which the insight of poets and prophets reached at a bound'.

With slow feet, paths have been followed throughout this study, leading, in the end, to the reiteration of a statement, which many a mother might have made:

1. LET US WELCOME THE INTRODUCTION OF METHODS that appeal to the 'child's active powers, to his capacities in construction, production, and creation;
LET THE ACTIVITIES 'contribute to the welfare of the community';
LET THE CHILD AND ADOLESCENT use their own intelligence (as well as the knowledge they can gain from books and observation) in building up Creed and pattern for conduct;
LET THEM DO SOCIALLY VALUABLE, PRODUCTIVE WORK, and so 'compensate' for any feeling of inferiority they may have, and realise their natural goal in life -- to be a complete human being -- instead of suppressing their imaginative and constructive tendencies.

When it is asked, How are these methods to be introduced? the answer of the educationist is:

2. THE EDUCATOR MAY MANIPULATE THE ENVIRONMENT; the child's freedom must be respected.

When a further question is presented, May not the educator demand obedience? the reply is:

3. WHILE CARE SHOULD BE TAKEN TO SEE THAT THE CHILD IS NOT DISCOURAGED AND 'BLOCKED ON ALL SIDES', YET THE CHILD WILL HAVE, IN LIFE, TO SUBMIT (OR 'ADJUST HIMSELF') TO SOCIETY, HIS PARTNER IN THE HOME, AND THE ETERNAL: AND IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT HIS SUBMISSIVE INSTINCT SHOULD FUNCTION FROM EARLIEST INFANCY.
4. THE PARENT OR NURSE HAS THREE METHODS OF ENFORCING OBEDIENCE, AND WILL EMPLOY EACH IN ITS PROPER PLACE AND TIME, viz., (i) PHYSICAL STRENGTH, (ii) 'CONDITIONING', OR PUNISHMENT, OR NATURAL REWARDS, (iii) PUBLIC OPINION ('IT'S NOT DONE', &c.). LATER, THE CHILD'S INTELLIGENCE WILL HELP.

What of THE INSTINCTS?

5. THE PARENTS HAVE A CHANCE TO MANIPULATE THE CHILD'S ENVIRONMENT SO THAT SOME MAY DEVELOP, SOME MAY BE INHIBITED BY DRAINAGE, AND SOME INHIBITED BY SELF-RESPECT, REASON, LOVE.

What of the CINEMA and LITERATURE that does not conform to the highest moral standards?

6. IT IS DESIRABLE THAT HOME, SCHOOL, CHURCH, PRESS, BROADCAST, CINEMA, etc., should ALL SPEAK WITH ONE VOICE, and THAT THERE SHOULD BE EXCLUDED FROM THE

child's

CHILD'S ENVIRONMENT ALL THAT SPEAKS WITH A CONTRADICTORY VOICE, UNTIL THE CHILD REACHES YEARS OF DISCRETION.

What of the child's company?

7. THE CHILD IS CHANGED BY THE COMPANY HE KEEPS:

HE IMITATES, RESPONDS TO SUGGESTION, IS 'SYMPATHETIC' (IE., HE 'IMITATES' THE 'FEELINGS' OF OTHERS): HE OBEYS THE DICTATES OF THE COMMUNITY TO AN EXTENT SELDOM APPRECIATED: CO-OPERATIVE WORK UNDER LEADERSHIP WILL APPEAL TO HIM AFTER HE IS ABOUT ELEVEN YEARS OF AGE.

What of religion?

8. 'CERTAIN RELIGIOUS CONVICTIONS, NOT FOUNDED ON REASON, ARE A NECESSITY OF LIFE FOR MANY PERSONS' (Dr Jung); 'THE DEEPER PERSONAL NECESSITIES OF MEN AND WOMEN, WHO FEEL A SENSE OF INCOMPLETENESS IN THE DEEPEST RECESSES OF PERSONALITY,' COMPEL THEM TO REACH OUT 'TOWARDS SOME LARGER EXISTENCE' (Mr Trotter); IT REMAINS FOR THE EDUCATOR TO ARRANGE THE ENVIRONMENT SO THAT THE DEVELOPING CHILD MAY COME TO FIND

'THAT PRACTICAL RELATIONSHIP with God, as revealed
by Jesus Christ, which enables the believer
to overcome even death itself;
THAT FELLOWSHIP WITH HIM which gives happiness
and peace;
THAT SATISFYING VIEW OF EXISTENCE as a whole,
THAT SPIRITUAL VALUATION of human life,
THAT MORAL IDEAL that towers above custom and
convention,
WHICH HAVE BEEN SEEN TO BE OF THE ESSENCE OF
RELIGION'.